

Volume 22, Number 2

July 1995

CONTRIBUTIONS TO NEPALESE STUDIES

Journal of
Centre for Nepal and Asian Studies
Tribhuvan University
Kathmandu, Nepal

CNAS

Contents

		Page
1.	Nepali Art: Nepali Utopia <i>Abhi Subedi</i>	113-130
2.	Social Factors Affecting Patient Utilization of High-Technology Medicine in Nepal <i>Mark B. Tausig</i> <i>Janardan Subedi</i>	131-139
3.	The Development of Vihara Culture in Nepal <i>Ranjana Bajracharya</i>	141-151
4.	Development Co-operation in South Asia: A Nepalese Perspective <i>Bishwa Keshar Maskay</i>	153-165
5.	Management of National Heritage Areas <i>Bishnu Bhandari</i>	167-179
6.	Human Development and the Ethnic Population Sub-groups in the 75 Districts in Nepal <i>Shyam Thapa</i>	181-192
7.	Jupiter and the Awakened Pig <i>Rebecca Saul</i>	193-197
Review Article		
8.	Is the Name the Game Fame, Shame or Blame? <i>J.P. Cross</i>	199-211
9.	Whither Scholarship on Nepal in the Nineties? <i>Mary Des Chene</i> <i>Pratyoush Onta</i>	213-223
Book Review		
10.	Promode Shamshere Rana: <i>Rana Intrigues</i> <i>Ananda P. Shrestha</i>	225-227

NEPALI ART: NEPALI UTOPIA

Abhi Subedi
Central Department of English
Tribhuvan University

Introduction

Nepali art has the most distinctive identity of all the cultural artefacts of this country. The identity can be seen at both the vertical and horizontal levels— in the system of culture through the times and the socio-political structures that Nepal saw with every change within the country and in the neighbouring countries, India and China (Tibet included). Therefore, the study of Nepali art involves the study of its history, government, politics, role of elites and cultural policies adopted at different times.

Nepali art reflects the history and the socio-political structure. But most important of all, it reflects the Nepali way of looking at the world, at the human life, beauty and hopes and premonitions of doom and apocalypse. It reflects the Nepali Utopia. These visions of Utopia have often shaped Nepali art, its various genres, and the Nepali way of looking at the world. The focus of this introduction is thus the critical study of the Nepali aesthetics reflected in its various forms, especially in paintings.

This article has two sections. The first section covers a period of Nepali art that is considered its formative period as well as its golden age. The various forms of Nepali art were created simultaneously at different periods in the Nepali history. Over the centuries many art forms were lost, and especially in the recent times, many art pieces were taken by the Western collectors. Now these items have formed the basis for the study of Nepali art by scholars some of which have been listed at the end of the survey. The dispersal phenomenon is thus a very important aspect of the study of Nepali art. The second section will cover a period of transition to modernity and introduction to the works of the few contemporary artists showing the trends in contemporary art.

Early Nepali Art

The early Nepali art should be studied against the historical background because the socio-political changes and the policies adopted by the rulers have had important impact on the evolution, and the consummation and

operational modes of the Nepali art. Pal (1985: 17) divides Nepali history of art from A.D. 300 into five broad periods:

Lichavi (330-879)

Transitional (879/80-1200)

Early Malla (1200-1482)

Late Malla (1482-1769)

Shah (since the conquest of the Kathmandu valley, the capital city, by the king of the hill state Gorkha, the forefather of the present king of Nepal, in 1769)

Early period is unique in a number of ways, but the perpetuation of the Nepali art forms developed and executed earlier can be seen as the continuity of a mode of art itself.

The Brahminical and Buddhist mythology is the main subject of the early Nepali art. The dual features of the Nepali art can be noticed in all historical periods shown above. The painters could boast of a richer repertoire than those of the sculptors whose work was mainly concentrated on the creation of icons and ritual objects. The painters' range was broader; they could more productively use the mythology; their medium was more versatile; they could use a wider variety of themes and styles.

The Chinese descriptions of Nepali taste for art during the Lichavi period (330-879) say that the people decorated the walls of their houses with paintings. But the paintings of the period have not been found yet. The earliest paintings go back to the eleventh century. The early paintings were the manuscript illuminations executed on palm-leaf sheets and the wooden covers which were used to protect the manuscripts. The style of manuscript illuminations was employed in the fifth century India to decorate the shrines. The Nepali manuscript illuminations are quite distinctly related to these illuminations at Ajanta and the monasteries of Eastern India. In such manuscripts gods and goddesses are depicted in a hieratic manner, and the forms and style are set and defined.

The artist's skill and originality can be seen in the dexterous delineation of the motif however stereotyped they may be. The diminutive deities were made with considerable skill and the use of the primary colour, especially red, heightened the personality and the aura of their power and charm, their erotic and demonic manifestations.

The Nepali art of the early period had a uniqueness of its own. It was different from the Indian art in a number of ways. The styles of the illuminations were distinct. The Pala style of illuminating palm-leaf manuscripts was more conservative than the Nepali style which was more "expressive and more painterly" (Pal 1975: 17).

In the extensive studies of the Nepali art in various books and survey articles different scholars have shown the uniqueness of Nepali art especially in relation to the Indian art of the similar vein prevalent in the Eastern Monasteries of India. But many scholars and observers tend to ignore the uniqueness of the early Nepali art and draw hasty conclusions about the extension of Indian influence on it.

The Nepali illuminations have been considered as the provincial versions of the Pala period (9th-11th century A.D.) Pal quotes Indian art scholars' interpretations of the Nepali art in this regard (1978: 134-5). As early as 1927 Coomaraswamy said that "distinction of style as between the Bengali and Nepali illustrated manuscripts is so slight as to be scarcely definable in a few words." In a comprehensive article written few years after this date Stella Kramrish considered the Nepali art as the emulation of the Nalanda and other styles. Pal says that the Indian scholars have for a long time taken a disdainful attitude towards the Nepali art. They consider Nepali art either as the deviation of the Pala style or inferior art. There is a consistent attitude of disdain of the Indian scholars towards the Nepali art. But in reality, "The manuscript illuminations from Nepal reveal not only richer repertoire than those preserved from Eastern India, but often displays far more complex compositions which are pictorially more exciting." (1978: 135)

Nepali artists have used the art forms and the media to make them flexible enough to express their response to the canonically defined art forms. These responses can be noticed in the execution of the painting and the *paubhas*. The wood-cover illumination of the manuscript *Prajnaparamita* which Bajracharya (n.d.) claims to be the earliest Nepali painting now under the custody of the Shakyas of Patan was executed in 920 A.D.. Bajracharya's claim pushes the history of Nepali painting one century earlier than that recorded by foreign scholars on the basis of the manuscript illuminations found in foreign collections. This painting has Nepali character which can be noticed in its rebellious character and syncretic forms of the deities. The Buddhist illuminations make use of the styles used in Saiva paintings. In Saiva paintings gods and goddesses are richly attired. This painting shows the tall pyramidal hat of Pancha Buddha and other garments somewhat clumsily made which perhaps shows the style of the tenth century Nepali painting.

The painting makes very effective use of colours and their tonality. They are very functional in terms of their use for accentuating the volume and roundness of the different parts of the body. The colours even after a thousand years have not lost their lustre and freshness which show the uniqueness of the Nepali art.

The manuscript illuminations are classically defined conservative forms. There was very little innovation in them. Most of these illuminations belonged to the same traditions as those of the similar paintings in India. But Pal says the Nepali paintings show perceptible stylistic differences. The generally employed primary colours red, blue and yellow and to her colours like white and green differ in "intensity and tonality" in Nepali paintings (1985: 186). The Nepali red is "tinged with crimson" as against the brighter vermilion as used in Indian illuminations. The pigment shades in Nepali illuminations are more subdued than in the East Indian illuminations. The Nepali palette has a richer variety than that of the East Indian artists. The liberal use of mauve, purple and pink in Nepali art shows this very clearly. The exuberant cubical rocks used by the Nepali artists is not found anywhere in Eastern Indian paintings.

The Nepali painting must have developed from its native tradition. The wall paintings were familiar phenomena in Nepal as early as the mid-fifth century A.D. The murals which decorated the monasteries and temples of Lichavi period in Nepal impressed the Chinese Emperor Wang hsuan-tse in the seventh century so much that he admired them as great works of art. The Monastic style of painting as done in the illuminations of the eleventh century must have been derived from those murals of the Lichavi period which must have been executed in the same style as the wall paintings in the Buddhist caves at Ajanta. So the Eastern Indian Monastic paintings and the Nepali Monastic paintings must have a common source in the Gupta tradition (Pal 1978: 43). So, to say that the Nepali painting of the early centuries is a direct emulation of the Eastern Indian Monastic painting is an exaggeration. The other evidence to this act can be found in the sculptures as well. The Nepali sculptures were influenced by the Gupta India (A.D. 320-600). But the Nepali sculptors developed an independent style of their own. The sculptures that have been found in Nepal are not Indian. No Indian sculptures are found in Nepal. So much so that "While large numbers of Indian bronzes have been discovered in the remote monasteries of Tibet and even as far off as Japan, not a single bronze of Indian origin has emerged from a Buddhist monastery in Nepal (Pal 1985: 36)." This also shows how independently did the Nepali artists develop the art forms basically retaining the classically defined forms.

Nepali art, thus, developed as a Nepali aesthetic response to the ways of gods and men and women. It represents Nepali mind, and a configuration of their spiritual and worldly experience.

A sense of competition that dominated the religious norm of the day between the Buddhist and the Saivites had a positive impact on the development of Nepali art. To popularise the religious motives artists made

beautiful illuminations for the manuscripts. These illuminations were made mainly for people to get a good impression about the religious and mythological text. To establish an inter-textual, inter-painterly and text-painterly pragmatics was the main aim of the artists and scribes of Nepal. The main thrust of the communication was to produce a spiritual impact on the audience. This spirit of communication impelled the leaders to make monasteries, meeting places in different parts of the town in the cities of the Kathmandu valley. Murals, paintings and scrolls with the attractive pictures of the deities to be exhibited on the walls were executed by skilful artists. The exuberance in the attires of the deities in the Saiva paintings had impact on the Buddhist art, which must be attributed to the sense of competition between the artists of the two schools of faith. This tradition can be noticed in the periodic exhibition of the scrolls, paintings and figures of deities in temples and monasteries even today. Manuscripts about the methods of illumination are also displayed in monasteries and other holy places.

The Nepali paintings from the tenth upto the sixteenth centuries were executed either with the religious fervour or with the fulfillment of a certain role given to the artists by the society. The paintings of this period follow the classical method. The lining patterns and their delicate use, the concept of harmony and balance, the glazing fast colour, the fully filled up space within the field of action are the stylistic features of the art of these centuries. Moreover, the decorative execution of the twigs and branches and the flame shapes, and the concept of harmony between the facial expressions and the body, concept of harmony between the facial expressions and the body symmetry of the deities are other continuous features of the style of this period.

Nepali artists used paper medium after it was introduced into Nepal from Tibet in the thirteenth century. The narrow horizontal format of the leaves was not immediately broken, but it allowed more space and wider folio to the artists. Paper medium gave a new impetus to the development of Nepali art. By joining the folio edge a folding paper book was formed. Such books were called *thyasaphu* in Newari. Such a continuation of the folios in folds was a very useful medium for narratives in both languages and paintings. The folios were full of beautiful paintings and very telling sketches.

Paper material was also used for painting. In fact the most exquisite paintings were done on the narrow cloth material shaped horizontally. Some of the best paintings are available in Nepal and foreign collections executed on this medium. The didactic narratives were depicted on them in both the Buddhist and Saiva traditions.

The Hindu artists used the album pictures in the seventeenth century under the influence of the Mughal and Rajput artists. The *Ragamala* poetical

literature, the *Ramayana* and *Mahabharat* stories, devotional songs such as *Devimahatmya* and the story of Lord Krishna's life and achievement his were the subject matter of the album pictures. The texts were written either on the back or at the margin and the space was occupied by the art. The Buddhist artist did not seem to use the picture album.

The Nepali painting has been mainly anthropomorphic. The human shapes of the divinities were the subject of these pictures. There is no transparency of the natural scenery. But stones and trees and the cubical shiny gold shapes represent the nature in the paintings. But the Newar artists came under the Mughal and Rajput influence by the mid-seventeenth century. The narrative scrolls depict nature on a continuous basis as the background of the painting. The mountains, some snow-peaked ones, the grass mass, clouds and birds are depicted in the paintings. In these paintings, especially in the creation of the impression of nature and landscape the artists seem to be influenced from the Mughal and Rajput or from the Tibetan arts. But the native tradition continues.

The *Paubha* (*pata* in Sanskrit and *thanka* in Tibetan) occupies a special place in Nepali art. The *Paubhas* are done by both the Buddhist and Hindu artists. There are certain important differences in style and themes. But equally important are the similarities.

The paintings are done in water colour, and resin is used as an adhesive. The Buddhist or Brahminical images are painted on coarse cloth. The emphasis is on symmetry, order, balance and harmony. The rich red and brilliant warm tonality is used in Nepali *Paubhas*. Bright yellow, deep green and intense blue colours are also used to form the environment for the paintings. The foregrounding for the forms and colours is hieratic. Many natural objects form the symbol in the *paubhas*.

The earliest *paubha* goes back to the twelfth century. It is the painting of *Ratnasambhava* and the *Eight Bodhisttvas* now kept in a Los Angeles collection (Pal, 1975: 16, 33). Many features of the *paubha* have remained the same such as the figurative mode, use of the natural forms as symbols, and decorations, use of thrones and shrines, lack of spatial dimension within the picture plain, a uniform distribution of light, non-existence of shades, defined positions of the sitting figures using rich attires, jewellery, a meticulous precision in drawing, apart from the colour structuralism as discussed above. But in the *paubhas* executed after the second half of the fourteenth century, the portraits of priests and donors drawn along the bottom of the picture became the common features of this form of art.

The painters were working in a tradition of art and were part of a group of artists who balanced their aesthetic perceptions with religious motifs. The sculptors, for instance, represent in a tangible form the mode of Nepali

aesthetics as expressed through different media. To understand the history, tradition and the pragmatic intent of the painters we should also look at the Nepali sculptures, especially their three dimensional projection of the same motifs as handled by the painters in their two dimensional forms. To understand the Nepali paintings— their structuration and their modes of expression, therefore, we should briefly look at the sculptures.

The Nepali sculptors used stone, metal, terracotta and wood as their media. The icons are strewn around, as it were, in the cities of the Kathmandu valley. They are in the temples, monasteries, lanes, courtyards, business centres, waterspouts and the paddy fields. Bangdel claims that the Nepali icons can be traced back to the first century B.C. or first century A.D. (404). The early predominant icons were those of mother goddesses. The sculptors belonged to Saiva, Buddhist and Vaisnava schools. The icons represent the above deities both in the Hindu and Buddhist traditions. The icons mainly served the religious functions. Therefore the aesthetic and religious impulses meet in the sculptures.

The sculptors have become less and less rigid, but like the painters the sculptors have always followed certain classical norms. There may not be much space for their own minds to work in this medium. But the very exquisite sculptures sufficiently show the sculptor's personality and skill.

The Lichavi images of Vishnu in stone, bronzes and the terracotta figurines maintained their appeal up to the later date. So the Nepali sculptures share a strong tradition with the Gupta sculptures in India. Nepali sculptors also went to Tibet and China. A team of Nepali sculptors under the leadership of Arniko went to China where he made the monumental *Swetachaitya*. In the early Malla period, Nepali sculptors had developed a unique style of their own.

The facial features became Nepalized. The artists created their own world, their own milieu and within this world they created their own version of the symmetry, facial features and the divine and demonic manifestations. There is a strong human feature in the sculpture.

Even in the late Malla and Shah period, the Nepali sculpture continued to maintain its tradition of more than a millennium. The sculptors remained creative through ages and the number of icons made over the centuries were numerous.

The sculptures and architectures in Kathmandu valley have an urban base. Both sculpture and architecture reflect the spatial impact on Nepali art over the centuries, its urban designs and its meeting places, exhibits the Nepali aesthetic construct which was a combination of artistic form and religious beliefs.

The wood carving which is part of the traditional architecture had also been an important feature of Nepali art since the twelfth century. The wood

carvings can be seen in the temples, monasteries, private homes, palaces and public places. The wood carvings show a secular concept of art. The subject-matter for the strut carving are the events of daily life and the cycles of the season and life. The famous eighty-four sexual postures that can be seen in the struts at the Saiva temples in the heart of Kathmandu show the Saiva tantric tradition but it also shows the artist's free use of the secular motifs.

The struts have two categories: a. the corner struts, and b. the struts at other places. The struts are arranged slantingly standing at 45 degrees supporting the sloping horizontal beams above. Since the slanting struts project their dominant spatial position, the art works – the colourful decorations and carvings on them tend to draw the eyes of the viewers. The struts, therefore, were considered by the artists as the very important medium for creating the aesthetic effect. The struts either carry religious or semi-religious motifs and they are classified under the name of lion or the position of the principal deity. Since the struts were made at a time when tantrism was at its heights, they bear the images of the tantric gods – the tantric manifestations of Shiva and Parvati, Vishnu and Lakshmi, Bodhisattavas, Lokesvara and various mother goddesses. There are smaller panels below the main motif depicting different figures well-known in the mythological systems, dancers and erotic figures.

The struts project very charming visual effect. They are like the paintings in their use of colour and decoration, dexterous manipulation of religious motifs. Such a dexterous performance of the artist can be seen not only in the struts, but also in different panels, windows, doors and the wooden items of daily use.

We have introduced the sculptures and strut carvings only in so far as they project a common pattern in the choice of motifs, and they represent the artist's combination of the religious subject – matter with their aesthetic and secular perception of art.

Transition

In the seventeenth century, the influence of Indian Rajput and Mughal traditions influenced the Nepali artists. But the Nepali artists did not produce perspective and depth of field under the influence. After this period, however, the Nepali palette became richer and pictures of the vegetation became more prominent than before. The Rajput fashion in clothes became more visible. The influence of the portrait making of the Mughal and Rajput India influenced the Nepali artists, and it was a turning point in Nepali paintings.

Though the portraits, the idealized images of persons, were depicted in the *paubhas*, the full portrait making of the Royalties became popular only after that period. Some of the early portraits of the kings of Nepal were done either

by some Indian artists or by Nepali artists in direct emulation of the Rajput Mughal style. The portrait received great impetus from the royal commission and patronage. The turning point in the portrait making came with the visit of the first Nepali prince Jung Bahadur to Europe – Britain and France, in 1850. The prince loved his own image and he employed artists, the family painters. The Newar artists of Kathmandu who are still known by their family name *chitrakar* or the picture maker.

In their love for themselves, and love for projecting their awe and power, the prince and royalties trained Nepali painters and sculptors in the western tradition. They commissioned the busts in Europe. The Rana Prime Ministers' huge figures riding horses now installed around the open space in the heart of Kathmandu town show their love for power and exclusiveness.

One artist named Bhajuman Chitrakar accompanied Jung Bahadur to Europe in 1850. Bhajuman was a court artist in his thirties when he went to Europe. He was a traditional artist, who did beautiful sketches and made pictures of birds and animals. This artist had executed several portraits of Jung Bahadur and his father and brothers.

Bhajuman's visit to Europe can be considered a significant event in Nepali portrait making. Though direct evidence of his emulation of the Western paintings can not be found but from the artist's execution of Queen's portrait and her words of praise for the portrait can be taken as evidence of the fact that he had keen eyes for arts – for the portraits. He was inspired to do portraits of the Queen after seeing her portraits at the Royal Palace which means that he brought Western techniques of paintings home. As a very talented artist he must have learnt many things from his European visit. A careful study of the portrait he executed after his return to Nepal from the European visit can show many things in terms of the Western influence in Nepali art.

The Chitrakars remained basically the court painters. They also executed paintings about the sociocultural life of the Newars of the Kathmandu valley. Their motifs range from secular to religious and they are narrative in structure. The lineage of the Chitrakar artists is a very interesting subject of study for any art historians of Nepal.

Another Chitrakar named Dirghaman accompanied Prime Minister Chandra Sumshere Rana to Europe in 1908. Dirghaman executed the portrait of Edward VII for which he is said to have received ten thousand sterling pounds, but for the sake of 'prestige' he refused to take the prize. With Dirghaman's visit more Western influence came to Nepal. But since no other forms of art were done in Nepal the Chitrakars were commissioned to do the portraits of the Royalties– the portraits of the rulers and their families. Since 1850 a

large number of portraits were executed. This tradition remained through the entire period of the Rana rule in Nepal which lasted up to 1950.

The Ranas were aware of the Western influence. They wanted to encourage the education of the Western style of art. In 1918 Chandra Sumshere Rana sent Chandra Man Maskey for training in Western art to Calcutta School of Art that was already established in 1854 by the Indian and British art lovers of the city, and the school was subsequently taken over by the British government. The Western influence on the art of the subcontinent and Nepal is a very important point for consideration. In recent times, especially with the emphasis on orientalism on the one hand and the pervasive Western influence on art education on the other, the subject of Western influence in oriental art has become an important subject for discussion. A short background to Western influence, modernization and the merger of the traditions in art in this part of the world should be presented here to understand the nature of the contemporary or the modern art scene of Nepal and the subcontinent.

Influence, Modernity and Nepali Art

Paradoxically, the European art in countries like India with a rich artistic and cultural tradition was able to set a norm of standardization more easily than it could do in countries with a large number of ethnic diversities in art and culture. The reasons were like this. The Indian art had broad-based concept of aesthetics and it was more pervasive in time and space as standard norm of art than any minority art forms would be in a position to achieve. The Indian viewer of art who expected to acquire the immediate visual information in the picture, the affluent colour harmony, and the very articulate lines and kinesis suggested by their movements in the picture had already a cultivated taste for art. The viewer knew what art was. The viewer was familiar with the universality—the standard or notions of artistic perceptions.

In terms of medium also the Indian and Nepali artist had already used “gouche: mineral, vegetable and animal pigments mixed with gum arabic, often with embellishment in gold and silver, applied to a prepared paper or, more rarely colour support (Topsfield 1984: 5).” The Mughal art of courts decorated in gold and colour, the bright Rajput arts, and all the other forms of art were united by the fact that they integrated mythological, poetical and mythical allusions. The impact of the music especially of the *ragas* in paintings, the taste of Mughal emperors for art and patronage of the court had set a standard of norm for art in India which had a direct or indirect impact on Nepali art of the later period as discussed above. Paradoxically, the Eurocentric compartmentalization of art—the standardization of art in various neat forms—found it easier to set its own standard as the norm of art.

But talking about Western influence we should ask, did the Eurocentric genres of art undermine the cultural standards by suppressing or downgrading the traditional arts, and trying to impose forms that are alien to the native traditions. It is often said about the impact of the European colonial rules that they imposed a standard for amalgamating the diverse cultural traditions and thus the pluralistic views of the world into a standard model for the purpose of ruling and imposing its own forms of culture. As a result of this and the all pervasive use of the media the identities of culture get blurred. But the Western art standard made its impact in a number of ways. One is the standardization of culture.

The Eurocentric art forms did not necessarily depress the traditions of art in countries like India and through its impact the arts of Nepal. But their thrust for Standardization of culture took its tools. Many small and minority artistic traditions stood neglected. But the establishment of the Arts School in Calcutta had a direct impact on the promotion of modern art in Nepal.

When Nepali painter Chandra Man Maskey joined Calcutta Government School of Art in 1918 for a formal training in art the concepts about art were changing. He brought in the Western technique of painting to Nepal. But he also worked with the indigenous traditional Newar artists of Kathmandu whose family name itself is Chitrakar, and whose art shows the influence of the earlier traditional paintings of the subcontinent— from the Pre-Mughal art to the other religious and court paintings of the later times.

The Westernization of the Nepali art does not mean the loss or the complete rejection of the traditions; it certainly makes a departure. But modern artists of Nepal create their own milieu and create their works in it. Their 'modern' is basically a Western concept, but they only exploit the Western education to broaden the range of their skills in painting. So, the Nepali identity of the artists in this country should be sought in their own cultural and folk environments created by themselves in their works by making the best use of their skills, whether they be Western or Oriental.

Management of the modern galleries, art schools and logistics and the modalities of the execution of the paintings, the use of media and the display of the individual artist's paintings on the wall to show an individual's expressionistic projections, most of them, if not all, are the acquired modalities from the Western training. Now the 'Modern art' has become a norm in Nepal like anywhere else.

The exhibition of Bangdel's paintings in the oldest college gallery in Kathmandu in 1962 marks the turning point in the history of Nepali art. It is perhaps the beginning of the contemporary or modern period of Nepali paintings.

Bangdel's initial training took place in Calcutta Art School and later he got exposure to Western schools in France and Britain including the study visits to Spain. The modern artist's exposure to the Western art, and the direct encounter of the Western galleries, schools and management of arts-exhibitions and other activities was a very significant event for Nepali art.

Bangdel's paintings were Western in their orientation. The blue period of Picasso's paintings influenced his early works. One can notice the pattern of emulation in these paintings. The cultural basis of the subcontinental and Nepali art saw a new configuration of emulation which was new, alien, complex and challenging. But in the abstract canvas the viewers of Kathmandu saw a possibility, and hope for freedom and expression, since for the first time in a painting many Nepali viewers saw a unique presentation of human drama.

To take one painting entitled "Twilight" displayed at the exhibition in 1962 a world of different nature spreads across the canvas. This is an unusual twilight created by the artist. The imagery is drowned into the abstract form. The coloured shapes and the brush strokes give the painting a pattern. The colours themselves, not the images, spring to the eyes of the viewers and influence the mind. The colours have emotional appeal, but the abstraction of the normal in terms of the use of colours and patterns present a picture that exists in the experience – an unusual kind of experience for the Nepalese viewers (Subedi, 1992: 2-3).

Since the sixties Nepali paintings made tangible departure from the tradition. The traditional forms of art, the portrait making, the narrative and spiritual paintings represented a different world altogether. The modern painters, most of them trained in the Indian and Bangladeshi art colleges, fully used the techniques and the media now universally recognized as occidental.

In the modern Nepali paintings artists experimented with all levels of presentation – themes, media treatment of the subject. Though most of them faithfully followed the well-defined order, mostly rigid in the modernist classical sense, some deliberately disrupted it. They did not violate the concept of balance in art, but there appears to be a violation of the balanced placing of the images and colour bands and mass.

The linings of the traditional Nepali art was very important because they were set in a defined system. But in modern Nepali paintings artists used lines expressively. The visible lines were charged with the artist's passion. The invisible lines were entirely new phenomena. The bands of colour and modality of form made up the invisible lines. So, the modern paintings became the vehicles of the artists' feelings, their problems, frustrations and hopes in the changing context of the country and culture.

Colours were used expressionistically. The expressionistic value of colour was realized in the context and the structuralism of the motif. The modern Nepali artist's palette had a greater variety than the Eastern Indian Monastic paintings in the early paintings. But in recent times the Nepali artists do not seem to maintain the uniqueness in terms of the use and combination of colour. Though some artists while delineating the cultural motifs use the traditional forms of colours, the main thrust of any combination is expressionistic, not rigid and defined.

The symbolism in modern Nepali paintings is unique. The universalism in the choice of motifs plays important role in modern Nepali paintings, but the most important feature of the modern Nepali art is that the artist is divided between rejection and the acceptance of the tradition – its values and techniques. In some very well known paintings, the tension itself is the subject-matter of the painting.

The modern paintings create the motion not necessarily by referring or responding to the outer events affecting the life of the artist, but by creating an internal, psychological reality. Therefore, the modern Nepali paintings do not necessarily depict the event and times of the transitional Nepali society. But they are certainly the expressions of the modern Nepali artists' response to the changing times, the changing values and norms.

The works of three artists, one representing the early modern and two—one woman, representing the current generation are introduced here briefly to give a cross-view of the scenario.

The critical review of the works of the three modern Nepali artists will show the nature of the contemporary Nepali art. They certainly are not the only Nepali artists working today. But their works have important commonalities with the works of other artists like Uttam Nepali, Shashi Shah, Krishna Manandhar, Indra Pradhan, Batsa Gopal Vaidya, Shanker Raj Suwal, Sharad Ranjit, Shashi Kala Tiwari and others. but their works are unique in a number of ways.

Manuj Babu Mishra belongs to the second generation of modern artists. His treatment of modernity is different from either Bangdel's or Uttam Nepali's. His works reflect the physical crisis in a very tangible form, but in each canvas he introduces ideas which are directly related to the catastrophe depicted in the art. The base of the dramatic relationship between modern scientifically fortified war machinery and the helpless anthropomorphic forms in the art is humanism. His subjectmatter is humanism – its catastrophe, thwarted hopes and bleak futurity. Overt representation rather than a subtle one is the feature of his art. Because of the need to foreground the theme, the subject of the predicament of humanity under the shadow of the war, he does not delineate the theme in a subtle manner.

Manuj Babu's themes are topical today when each week or even day, children die in the refugee camps due to famine, or fall under the army guns. Women are raped or murdered and genocides are committed. But the mode of the terror drama in Manuj Babu's paintings is shaped by the last Great War, and the structuralism of the European paintings of the War period like Picasso's *Guernica* and *The Charnel House*, Carl Hofer's *The Black Rooms*, Jacob Lawrence's *War Series, No 6* and other post-war crucifixion paintings.

Some of the recurrent images in his paintings are the missiles, tunnels, birds, serpents and terrified heads. These images evoke fear at its rawest form. The archetypal images that evoke fear glibly find place in his paintings. But the symbols though they are supposed to represent and dramatize the universal patterns of fear and hope, love and hatred are supposed to carry the burden of contemporaneity—of four times. His paintings carry the times just as his missiles carry the sophisticated lethal explosives. The scientific sophistication and the bellicose mood that pervades the atmosphere in his paintings are reminiscent of the major events of our times.

There is a great mobility in each canvas. Missiles are fired at, heads shoot around, human figures are subjected to go through the excruciating pain in the blue, red and yellow world. There is movement, targeting, destruction and overriding. But the very important point about all these mobilities and actions is the conspicuous absence of the agency. Each painting therefore, presents the pain of the sufferer, the receiver. The agent, the doer is behind the action, which shows the impersonality and the inhumanly indifferent automation.

Host of his paintings, especially those executed recently, present the drama very vividly. In these paintings birds come out of the cannons, devotees huddle at Buddha's feet with missiles ready for action, the Swayambhu chaitya with Buddha's unwinking bleary eyes carries warheads; a saint is seen in a vertical canvas carrying missiles with the force projected by the yellow in the foreground and grim and sombre at the background; the artist himself is poised for a certain action with missiles jauntily tucked on his hat; there is a parade of heads with all the primary colours heightening the effect. There is irony about the trinity, peace, mobility and progress; and the yellow Buddha is going to Lumbini in the contemporary context. Manuj Babu Mishra, to drive home the irony and the symbolism in his paintings, juxtaposes his own cultural milieu—the deities, their diverse manifestations with the dramatic presence of the warheads and other atrocious objects associated with modern war technology. This is a recurrent phenomenon in nearly every painting.

His treatment of the theme is overt not subtle, therefore, his paintings use the techniques of modern occidental paintings to project the artist's sense of the times we are living in and the atrocities committed by people to people in

tangible images and symbols. The most dominant motif in his paintings is time seen against the background of the apocalypse that, according to the artist, is at hand.

Kiran Manandhar is a versatile Nepali artist of the younger generation. His works are subtle, and their impact is charming and warm created by the structuralism, by the effective combination of the media and the treatment of the motif.

In the vertical paintings represented here we can see some features of his art. We should look at the field of action itself— the vertical sized Himalayan rice paper. As we have seen, Nepali artists extensively used Nepali paper in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. But a modern artist's rediscovery of the medium is an interesting phenomenon. The paper gives the artist an opportunity to create a dialogue not only between the form and the subject-matter, but also between the canvas and the other media— colour and lines. The primitive Himalayan paper enters into a dialogue with the Western media and creates a unique work of art.

Kiran in his paintings makes a liberal use of visible and invisible lines and creates a sense of force in each. Each painting emerges out of the paper canvas — through the rough surface glistening the dry Himalayan grass, tendrils and wigs. Each paintings comes to the foreground, as it were from the depth. Kiran's paper canvas is made by superimposing one layer upon another. This gives the artist a dramatic canvas to sink the lines and colour in each layer.

The most important structural feature of Kiran's paintings is the creation of *mandala*, a dynamic pattern of the movements of the bands of colour and lines. The distribution of colours and lines in the paintings is designed to create a movement within the entire field of action. Once the field of vision acquires a pattern of the kinetic visible and invisible bands and lines, the impact of the canvas works on a psychological plane. The viewer's mind acquires the same motion as the paintings. The mind acquires such dynamism in two ways.

Kiran involves the sky in his paintings. The viewer can see the sky in the vertical movement of the invisible lines and the openness of the field of action. The composition has no limit. The other way one can notice the sky in the paintings is the structuration of a *mandala*, the mobile use of the colour, lines and images. The brush strokes show field of vision— the path that the viewer's eyes have to follow. The sky becomes a consciousness, the mind that must find a place in the structure. We should return to the colour symbolism to see the sky in his paintings. The undulating fast changing colours, the sudden disappearance and emergence of the same colour at another

space creating thereby a sense of mobility, the use of thick white, blue and light yellow create the sky in his paintings.

In his thatched 'terracotta' cottage below the Swayambhu hill—below the bleary eyes of the Buddha I saw him executing some of these paintings. I could feel how the sky entered his canvas. The nature outside, especially the light and the wind find a place in his paintings. In the traditional architecture in temples and houses in Kathmandu a space is created for the sky. The sky being one of the five elements should find its place in paintings, dance, music and the space in a temple or home. The sky in Kiran's paintings is its theme and structure.

Another significant feature of his paintings is the creation of the female form through the abstract pattern. The female richness, immense creative possibilities and charm are the other attributes of Kiran's paintings.

Ragini Upadhya who also represents the young generation of artists has also used the Himalayan paper as her canvas in several of her paintings. Her paintings done on Nepali paper directly synchronize the folk themes with the folk material.

A graphic artist by training, Ragini has been using other techniques and combining different levels of skills in her paintings executed at different times. For instance, in the works done on Nepali paper she has used paints through the medium of graphic prints by the technique of superimposition. The colour blotches albeit not very prominent, have very interestingly served to make the narrative islands in the fables drawn from children's story books, myths and living comic strips—the game of politics which she has depicted in these vertical canvases to create a sense of irony.

Each of the paintings in this series has a commonality with each other, but each is unique in a number of ways. The commonality exists in the use of media and the theme that runs through all the paintings with variations. Her entire body of works is a symphony with variations in each canvas.

Ragini in the paintings of the Nepali paper series has captured the weak points of human nature, especially the games monopolised by men as their prerogatives, like politics, violence, backbiting and fighting for gains. Woman also figures up in these works but only as someone who standing by the corner of the horizontal space watches the drama. But the narrator, the moderator and the censor of these stories is a woman. So the invisible character in these paintings is a woman. The gap between the visible and the invisible therefore is the state of irony in her paintings.

One should be familiar with the stories of the classical Sanskrit myths and other folk tales told in this country to fully understand the themes in these paintings. But there are patterns which are universal like the wickedness and leg pulling and using fair and foul means to achieve one's selfish ends.

There is charm in her paintings. The paintings easily interact with the viewers either through the familiar media and stories if viewed natively or through the dramatization of the universal human psychology through the alien media if viewed outside. The charm and simplicity in her paintings continues in either case.

The painting opens up like a wall and the anthropomorphic forms, lines, colours, the figures of animals and birds, and the *devanagari* scripts appear as graffitis. But these graffitis do not only speak about the contemporary issues, they also dramatize the universal human nature. These paintings, combine the comic with the serious, the graphics with the paintings, fun with sadness and forms with empty space. Ragini continues to make experiments in her works. The paintings referred to here represent her latest experiment and they represent it effectively.

Conclusion

We have made a brief survey of Nepali arts especially paintings of the last one thousand years. It is a very interesting and challenging subject in its own right. The pattern of Western influence can not only be seen in the use of the media and technique and the expressionistic use of colour but more importantly, in the management of art, through the exhibitions of works in one place by making it possible for people to buy them. The early Nepali paintings were produced for the local use, for religious and ritual purposes. But the priests, and the art lovers of this country value only their ritual part. They ignore the great charm, beauty and power of these paintings which certainly must have been highly appreciated by people when they were executed. Every culture has its own aesthetic traditions. The Nepali aesthetic tradition as seen in the paintings is rich, unique and polymorphous.

References

- Bajracharya, Manabajra. (n.d.) *Nepalko Madhyakalin Kala*. Kathmandu: HMG, Ministry of Information.
- Bangdel, Lain Singh. 1989. "The Sculptural Art of Nepal" In Kamal P. Malla (ed.), *Nepal: Perspectives in Continuity and Change*. Kathmandu: Centre for Nepal and Asian Studies, Tribhuvan University, pp. 404-422.
- Deo, Shantaram Balachandra . 1965. *Glimpses of Nepali Woodwork*. Calcutta: Mrs Shrimati Tagore.

Pal, Pratapaditya. 1985. *Art of Nepal*. Berkley: University of California Press.

_____. 1978. *The Arts of Nepal*. Part II: Painting. Leiden/Koln: E. J. Brill.

_____. 1975. *Nepal: Where the Gods Are Young*. New York: Asia House Gallery.

Singh, Narayan Bahadur. 1976. *Samasamayik Chitrakalako Itihas*. Kathmandu: Royal Nepal Academy.

Subedi, Abhi. 1992 "Modern Nepalese Poems and Paintings: Canons and Contexts". *Contributions To Nepalese Studies*, 19:1, pp 1-9.

_____. 1992. "Kiran Manandhar's Paintings: A Postmodernist Orientation." *Kiran*. Kathamndu: Kiran.

Topsfield, Andrew. 1984. *Indian Court Paintings*. London: Victoria and Albert Museum.

SOCIAL FACTORS AFFECTING PATIENT UTILIZATION OF HIGH-TECHNOLOGY MEDICINE IN NEPAL

Mark B. Tausig
The University of Akron
Janardan Subedi
Miami University

Introduction

The introduction and institutionalization of modern Western medicine and medical practices into developing countries is a social process that requires significant investments in training, physical facilities and equipment. With the cultural barriers to the acceptance of Western medical philosophy; the establishment of a modern medical system, its struggle for hegemony of coexistence with indigenous systems, and its widespread diffusion across the geographic and social landscape is a long-term process (Subedi and Subedi 1995). Typically modern medicine is first available and accepted by cultural and social elites residing in principal urban areas. The diffusion of modern practices is uneven within the society. One way in which this uneven diffusion can be indexed is by the introduction of state-of-the-art medical technology. Modern Western medical care is typified, in part, by the intensive use of expensive advanced technology. IN the West (and especially in the United States) new advanced technologies are rapidly diffused because of the availability of funds (from various sources) and high level of legitimacy of the medical enterprise

These conditions do not obtain in developing countries The proportion of national GDP devoted to modern medical practices is trivial compared to investments within Western societies. Advanced technology, therefore, is often ill-suited, inappropriate or unaffordable in developing countries At the same time, it is not atypical for developing countries to obtain exemplars of advanced technology and to use this equipment where it is available and for patients with special access (Subedi 1992).

In the present study we report on the introduction of a state-of-the-art mammography machine into the developing country of Nepal. Our objective in this case study is to evaluate the use of this machine in the context of a

Western medical system that is significantly under-developed in terms of its extent and institutionalization. This particular case is appropriate because the various ways in which the machine can be used reflect the differences between a highly institutionalized, resource-rich environment and an environment in which the medical system is poorly established and is resource poor.

Mammography is a technique that can be applied to medical practice in two distinct ways. It can be used for diagnostic purposes for screening of the general female population. In the United States, for example, mammography was first used exclusively for diagnostic purposes, although its potential as a screening device was well-recognized, technical difficulties and the scarcity of machines and trained personnel kept mammography a diagnostic tool for a significant period of time (Gold 1992; Gold, Bassett and Widoff 1990; Feig 1993). Both the operation of the machine and its significance as an early detection device required technical development as a precondition for its widespread use as a screening tool. In addition, of course, its use as an effective screening technique required the proliferation of the equipment itself, a process which consumes significant resources.

A developing society such as Nepal does not have the luxury to expend the significant resources needed to establish a national screening program. The low level of institutionalization of the Western medical system would make it extremely unlikely that the use of a single mammography machine would be compatible with a screening program. Maximum use of the machine would result in the evaluation of no more than about 3000 women per year. Moreover, the disease burden in the society is largely defined as infectious and parasitic diseases and problems related to infant mortality. Consequently, the existing medical system is principally oriented to the provision of basic curative therapy. Additionally, there is a strong relationship between the "women's movement" in developed countries and attention to and expenditures for women's health problems. Such a movement does not exist in Nepal.

These conditions clearly suggest that the mammography machine will be used diagnostically rather than as a screening device. However, this proposition must be evaluated empirically. There are counter arguments. For example, access to Western medical services is highly skewed toward the economic and political elites. Therefore, it is possible that the single machine could be used as a screening device if its main use focusses on such elites. Members of these elites frequently leave the country to get advanced medical care, including mammograms. It is conceivable that the presence of a mammography machine within the country would induce these elites to use it if its use could be limited to their group. It is also the case that there are no estimates of breast cancer prevalence for Nepal or information on risk factors

for the specific population. Therefore, it might also make sense to use the machine for screening to build a database. While the collection of epidemiological data also diverts resources from the central enterprises of the medical system, it could be accomplished with little additional cost. In sum, the manner in which this machine is used might be affected by a variety of factors.

The Case Study

In May 1994 a state-of-the-art mammography machine donated by its manufacturer to the country of Nepal was delivered and installed in Kathmandu. A team of experts, consisting of a radiologist, two mammography trainers and a technician, accompanied the arrival of the machine. The machine was placed in a separate set of rooms in the X-ray department of the Teaching Hospital operated by Tribhuvan University. Physicians in Nepal were trained in the use of the machine, interpretation of mammograms and treatment techniques. Several X-ray technicians were also trained to do the examination and a record-keeping system was established. The American team stayed in Nepal for approximately three weeks and conducted approximately 75 exams before departing. There was widespread publicity about the arrival of the equipment and the presence of the American team. Upon their departure, the American team was satisfied that the machine could be operated effectively.

Data regarding the use of the machine was collected using a specially developed "Mammography Clinic Patient Record" form. This form contains information about the social and medical backgrounds of each patient undergoing a mammography procedure and the results of each exam. The form was designed to help Nepali physicians in the interpretation of the exam and to supply data for other analytic purposes. Copies of the patient record forms were collected from the clinic each week and sent to us for analysis. A total of 300 patient records were obtained between the introduction of the machine (approx. June 1, 1994) and the end of 1994.

Diagnostic versus Screening Mammography

According to Feig (1993:193) mammographic *screening* is defined as the periodic examination of women, whether or not they are at high low risk based on family or personal history or other risk factors who do not present with any symptoms to suggest the possibility of malignancy. By contrast "...*diagnostic* mammography is performed in response to clinical signs or symptoms....".

The patient record form includes a record of the presence of current complaints related to the possible presence of malignancy: breast lumps,

pain, discharge from the nipple, skin dimples or skin thickening. Following the definition above, women who were reported as having one or more of these complaints were classified as "diagnostic" cases while those women who had no current complain were classified as "screen" cases.

Risk Factors

In the absence of specific complaints, considered signs or symptoms of breast malignancies, use of mammography is defined as screening. As the definition of screening suggests, however, both high and low risk women can be screened, but with a clear preference to screen women with higher risk. This preference is clear in contemporary American debates over the need for women under 50 to have mammograms, for example. The determination of risk factors is derived from studies done in the United States and Canada. While it is possible that these factors have different importance in Nepal, it is likely that they are nevertheless risk factors. Those measured include age of first menstruation, number of pregnancies, female family history (and patient history) of breast problems or cancer, and menopause or hysterectomy age. Risk characteristics of diagnostic and screening cases will be compared.

Social Characteristics

When risk factors are controlled, diagnostic use of the mammography machine would imply that there should be no significant differences in the demographic characteristics of patients. That is, if symptoms prompt the use of the mammography machine as a diagnostic test, then controlling for risk factors, there should be no differences from population distributions in the status characteristics such as marital status, occupation (husband's), education, or referral source among women using the test for diagnostic purpose, because symptoms alone prompt the referral. ON the other hand, screening use of the machine should be highly biased toward "early adopters" such as those with high education, occupational attainment and high caste. Access is somewhat equalized by a commitment to offer the service free of charge for low income women.

Analytic Strategy

Cases will be divided a priori into diagnostic or screening cases based on the reported presence or absence of symptoms. The proportion of screening and diagnostic cases on a month-by-month basis will be examined to determine if experience using the machine affects the selection of patients. Risk factor status between diagnostic and screening cases to establish the role that risk factors play in the way the machine is used will be compared. And distributions of social characteristics will be evaluated to see what role these

factors may play. The results of these analyses will then be used to assess the argument presented at the outset about the use of this high-technology medical device in Nepal.

Results

The use of the mammography machine was compared over the course of two periods of time (Table 1). The "training" period is defined by the presence of the American team and includes all uses of the machine whether managed by the American team or Nepalis. The table clearly shows that following the initial training period, use of the machine shifted to diagnostic application. The shift would appear even more dramatic on a month-to-month basis. Of the thirty-two screening cases examined after the training period, only fourteen were done after July 1. In essence, the machine is now used exclusively for diagnostic purposes. This represents a conscious decision by Nepali physicians. They have developed written guidelines for mammography which specify: "All patients must be referred by a doctor". A fee has been established for each use of the machine, and at present the mammography lab is only open three day per week for a two-hour period. This pattern of use is consistent with our argument that the use of this high-technology equipment will be for diagnostic applications.

Table 1: Use of Mammography Machine for Diagnostic and Screening Purposes

Type of Exam	Time Period		
	Training	Operational	Total
Screening	33	32	65
Diagnostic	46	189	235
Total	79	221	330

Note: Prior to June 15, 1994 is considered to be a *training* period in which the American team worked with Nepali physicians to make the machine operational and assure that the machine would be operated properly. After June 15, the machine was regarded as *operational* and was solely used by Nepali physicians.

Demographic, risk and referral data for screen and diagnostic cases were compared (table 2). Although most of the screen cases were examined prior to the departure of the American team, the demographic comparisons show that screen cases tend to come from among more educated households. While age

was listed as a risk factor rather than a demographic condition, screen cases are much older than diagnostic cases.

Table 2: Characteristics of Screen and Diagnostic Patients

Characteristics	Type of Exam		
	Screen (n = 65)	Diagnostic (n = 235)	P
Demographics			
Patient Education	2.23	1.72	.008
Husband Education	3.27	2.65	.000
Caste	3.27	3.22	n.s.
Marital Status	1.05	1.23	.001
Husband's Employment	.68	.92	.000
Risk Factors			
Age	47.8	37.5	.000
Age 1st Menstruation	13.95	14.53	.031
Number of Pregnancies	3.00	2.49	.034
Still Menstruating	.49	.88	.000
Previous Breast Surgery	.25	.23	n.s.
Breast Problems in Family			
Patient	.21	.24	n.s.
Mother	.02	.05	n.s.
Sister(s)	.02	.06	n.s.
Aunt(s)	.09	.04	n.s.
Grandmother(s)	.02	.00	n.s.
Breast Cancer in Family	.08	.06	n.s.
Referral Sources			
Relative/Friend	.45	.10	.000
Physician	.38	.82	.000
Media	.45	.18	.000
Someone who had been to clinic			

Note: Patient Education and Husband are coded 0 = None, 1 = 8 years or less, 2 = 9 to 10 years, 3 = 11 to 14 years, 4 = 15 or more years. Caste is coded 1 = Non-Hindu, 2 = Brahmin, 3 = Chetri, 4 = Vaishya, 5 = Sudra. Marital Status is coded 1 = Married, 2 = Widow, 3 = Divorced/Separated, 4 = Never Married. Husband's Employment is coded 0 = Unemployed, 1 = Employed.

Still Menstruating, Previous Breast Surgery, Breast Problems in Family, Breast Cancer in Family, Referral Sources are coded 0 = No, 1 = Yes

n.s. = difference not significant

p = t-test probability of equal means between groups

Thus age is clearly the most important risk factor distinguishing screening from diagnostic cases. Since diagnostic cases are defined by physical complaint, it is sensible to think that the complaint, rather than age, would determine use of the mammography equipment. The higher age of screening cases also falls in line with recommendation that such screening should be more frequent for older women. Age also account for the differences in rate of menstruation that are observed. The only other risk factor that appears to differ is the relationship between family history of breast cancer and case type. Screening was more likely to include women with a family history of breast cancer.

Examination of referral sources confirms the organization of the mammography clinic as a diagnostic resource that is accessible only by the physician referral. Eighty-two percent of diagnostic cases were based on physician referral (90% of those after the departure of the American team), while screen cases were drawn from various informal sources (friends, media and previous users).

Conclusions

This straightforward analysis of the first 300 mammographic examinations conducted in Nepal provides cautious support for the following conclusions. The introduction of this high-technology machine into a medical system oriented principally toward basic curative medicine anticipated that its use would be made consistent with this orientation. This appears to be confirmed. After the initial training period, the machine has been used almost entirely for diagnostic purposes. Moreover, it appears to be used in appropriate way, that is, diagnostic cases are not selected for reasons other than their symptomology. For instance, social status does not appear to explain access to the machine for diagnostic purpose. Further, the profile of screening cases suggests that they too are being conducted appropriately (in terms of general

recommendations—greater frequency over age 50, family history of breast cancer). The higher educational levels among screen cases is also consistent with findings in the United States which show educated women as more likely to seek screening mammograms.

It should be noted that the women who have undergone mammographic examinations are largely from the economic and educational elite. The demographic differences between screen and diagnostic cases are slight and do not indicate that the mammogram machine is accessible to poor, uneducated women. Thus, use of the machine, while technically appropriate, also reflects larger status divisions within the society. This is a technology that is available to a small socially privileged group.

Finally, regarding a more global issue related to the diffusion of medical technology it was argued that the introduction of this state-of-the-art mammography machine which can be employed in two distinct formats is particularly useful for evaluating the relationship between modern Western medicine and indigenous health care systems in developing societies. In this regard the results imply two conclusions. First, modern medical equipment (and techniques) are likely to be modified by modern practitioners in developing countries to fit the general orientation to practice (i.e., basic curative). This implies that expensive high technology equipment is probably not the best method for modernizing health care systems. Such equipment reflects the status of the modern health care system in the West in which the disease burden is different, basic services are well-diffused and resources devoted to health care are very high. The machines developed in this context are highly specialized in purpose and function and, therefore, not entirely appropriate for the most significant needs of modernizing systems. Second, while it is clear that the mammography machine's use has been turned to its most appropriate application in this context, it should also be noted that it is significantly underutilized. Mammography is now only available three days per week and for limited hours, further reducing the value of this machine. The infrastructure of modern medicine in Nepal is insufficiently developed to afford maximum use of the machine. Given the basic curative orientation of the practice of modern medicine in Nepal, the capabilities of the machine that exceed its basic curative role cannot be exploited.

While none of these conclusions must be taken as tentative due to the limited data available, they are provocative enough to suggest the importance of continuing to examine their implications.

References

- Feig, Stephen A. 1993. "Mammographic Screening: An Historical Perspective." *Seminars in Roentgenology*, 28:193-203.

- Gold, Richard H. 1992. "The Evolution of Mammography." *Radiologic Clinics of North America*, 30:1-19.
- Gold, Richard H., Lawrence W. Bassett, and Bobbi E. Widoff. 1990. "Highlights from the History of Mammography." *RadioGraphics*, 10:1111-1131.
- Subedi, Janardan. 1992. "Primary Health care and Medical Pluralism Exemplified in Nepal: A Proposal for Maximizing Health care Benefit." *Sociological Focus*, Vol. 25, No. 4, pp. 321-28.
- Subedi, Sree and Janardan Subedi. 1995. "Dominance and Elitism: The Modern Health Care System in Nepal." In Eugene B. Gallagher and Janardan Subedi (Eds.) *Global Perspectives on Health Care*. New Jersey: Prentice Hall, pp. 73-82.

THE DEVELOPMENT OF VIHARA CULTURE IN NEPAL

Ranjana Bajracharya
Padma Kanya Campus

Introduction

The study of *vihara* culture necessitates an understanding of the features, significance and development of Buddhism in Nepal. However, first the term "*vihara* culture" needs to be defined. In Newar Buddhist tradition, the *vihara* plays a significant ritualistic and religious role in society. It is a holy complex where religion and religious practices become overt and it is publicly demonstrated through a host of activities, both internal – performed inside the sacred shrine regularly on a calendar basis – and external – performed in the complex regularly or occasionally with wider participation of the Buddhists of the *vihara* localities. Such activities range from regular worship to mass celebrations and performances. The *vihara*, with its sacred and secular complexes, deities and objects, priests and devotees, remains the main focus of all activities. The optimum objective of the activities is to solemnly demonstrate union with the Buddhahood or Enlightenment. In the present context, the term "*vihara* culture" is used to denote the life cycle of the members of the *vihara* observed through the various activities where gods and people, the donors and the receivers, performers and participants meet together under the umbrella of the sacred complex. The three cities of Patan, Kathmandu and Bhaktapur contain a large number of Buddhist *vihara* known as "*baha*" in Newari. The existence of numerous *vihara* in the Kathmandu valley, more particularly in Patan city, suggests that *vihara* culture is very old and has remained popular in Nepal. The people of Nepal, especially the Newars of the Kathmandu Valley, are sentimentally attached to the *vihara*, because the *baha* is the centre of their religious and cultural life and the focus of their social organization and relations. In order to understand the status of Buddhist religion, culture, rites and rituals of Nepal, a cursory look at *vihara* culture is therefore imperative.

Origin and Antiquity of *Vihara*

Originally, a *vihara* was a place of adoration and religious learning for the Buddhists. It also served as residence of the learned Buddhists monks. In Buddhists literature, the terms *arama* and *vihara* were used to denote a dwelling place of monks. In beginning, a *kuti* (a small cottage) of the Buddha was called *arama*. So at that time *venuvana* of *Rajgriha* was called as *arama*. A residential complex constructed by Anathapindaka in Sravasti was named a Jetavana *vihara*. It was donated to the Buddha and his *sangha* by Anathapindaka. This indicates that in the beginning Lord Buddha and his disciples started to live in *arama* and *vihara*. Slowly these words used in the form of a group of residence was *sangharama* for the *Bhikshu-samuha*. Actually *vihas* were constructed after the establishment of a *sangha*. In one of the *patras* (vessel) of the Gupta period there is mention of an *Arogya Vihara Bhikshu Sanghasya* (Upadhyaya 1972: 97-8). In India after fifth century, most of the *vihas* were constructed on plain land, this is proved by the archaeological survey of the layout of Taxila, Saranath, Nalanda and Vikramasila Mahavihara of India.

In Nepal, the *vihara* is a Newar Buddhist institution or monastery, popularly known as *baha* or *bahal*, where *bhikshu sangha* live by performing different type of rites and rituals. It is a place of religious bliss. Other types of religious complexes known as *bahi* or *bahil*, which is again a modification of the sanskrit term *bahiri* meaning 'outside', were also built outside the town limits. In ancient inscriptions, we find reference to this institution as *bahiri* (Regmi 1966: 96-7). The Chronicle calls these *vihas* '*nirvanik vanaprastha*'. It has often been said that the *vanaprastha vihas* were called *bahi* that is, outside because the *vanaprastha bhikshu* resided not in cities but in forests. The placement of the existing *bahi* of the three cities of the valley shows clearly that all the *bahi* are nearly either at the very edge of the city or beyond it. Actually, they are indeed outside, not so much in the physical sense of outside the city, but in the sense of 'outside' the pale of the tantric Vajracharya culture of the *bahas*.

Regarding the origin of the *vihara* in Nepal, scholars hold different opinions. According to Vaidya, *vihara* or monasteries must have come into existence in the Kathmandu Valley long time ago (Vaidya 1986: 1). On the basis of chronicles, he further asserts that the Kathmandu Valley became fit for human habitation after Manjushree drained the water from the Valley. Manjushree was then enthroned King Dharmakara and the large number of the followers of the king began to reside in the valley as celibate monks. These

viharas were supposed to have been built for the residence of these celibate monks. According to Korn (1976: 26), the origin of the *vihara* building is still obscure. But he is of the opinion that the basic plan for the layout of the *vihara* is more than two thousand years old. He cites an example for rock monasteries at *Ajanta* and *Ellora* of South Western India. At that time *viharas* were constructed by cutting rocks in the hills and mountains in the difficult parts of India. Nepalese *vihara*, however, took a different form. According to Buddhist sources, Gautam Buddha and his followers were staying in *Nyagodharma Vihara* during the visit to Kapilavastu. It is said that in the first year of his enlightenment, Buddha, accompanied by twenty thousand monks, paid a visit to his native place and stayed in this *vihara*.

Hiuen Tsang, a Chinese traveller of the seventh century, mentioned that he saw the ruins of about 1000 *viharas* in *Kapilvastu* (Watters 1973:1). This indicates that the construction of the *vihara* was very popular in those days. Among the specific *viharas* mentioned by Hiuen Tsang are a *vihara* built over the site of the sleeping hall of Queen *Mayadevi* and a *Sangharama* built near the *Ramagrama Stupa* (Beal 1973:1). The excavation of *Kapilvastu* has revealed some important *viharas* that existed during the Buddha's time. Further, he made a note that in Nepal "the *Sangharama* and *Deva* temples are closely joined and there are about 200 priests who study both the Great and Little Vehicle. (Beal 1969:95-6).

Indeed *vihara* had existed from the time of the Buddha. These *viharas* must have been the dwelling places of the monks and the nuns in those days. Therefore, in the remote past, it was in the monasteries where the Buddha's doctrine was preached, discussions held, and new scripts written. Later, the monasteries grew into great universities as the important centres of learning (Locke 1980:64). *Nalanda*, *Vikramasila* and *Taxila* were some of eminent universities of ancient India. Some Buddhist *viharas* originated and flourished at a time when the *Theravada* school was prominent. These *viharas* were built on the pattern of rural dwelling houses. With the evolution of Mahayana Buddhism, Mahayana *viharas* appeared slightly different in construction from the *Theravada* ones. Korn notes that the basic structure did not change in the whole course of two thousand years history (Korn 1976:26).

Development of Buddhist Viharas in Nepal

The Kirata and the Lichchhavi periods are the most significant periods of ancient Nepal. The later chronicles mention that in the Kirata period the Buddha is said to have visited the Kathmandu Valley with his disciples and

lived in place called Puchhagara Chaitya. In order to preach his teachings and provide accommodation for monks and nuns, they assembled at a serene place and formed a community (*sangha*). Housed in monasteries or *vihara*, the monks and nuns devoted themselves to study and practice the teaching of Lord Buddha. In these monasteries a large number of monks and nuns lived and studied. That this community of monks and nuns in the monasteries was known as a *sangha* from Buddha's time is evidenced by different Buddhist Jataka and Avadana literatures. The evidence and records available from the excavations in Kapilavastu and Lumbini indicate the existence of such *viharas* in Buddha's time.

According to chronicles, Charumati Vihara of Chavahil was constructed by Charumati, the daughter of Ashoka. (Wright 1972:111) Although this fact has not been historically proved, *Chavahil* had been an attraction for the Chinese and other Buddhist monks for several centuries. According to Korn, some of the oldest *viharas* dating back to the first century A.D. are Vikramsila Vihara (*Than-vihara* of Thamel), Visharukhya Vihara, Chakra Vihara, Hemvarna Vihara and Bhyu Bahal.

Vihara Culture in the Lichchhavi Period

So far as the *vihara* culture is concerned, the Lichchhavi period is significant in Nepal's history. Lichchhavi rulers enthusiastically helped the *sangha* or *viharas* to function effectively. This fact is proved by the mention of Buddhist *viharas* in the inscriptions of several Lichchhavi rulers. Among them the earliest reference to the *vihara* is in Amsuvarama's Hadigaon inscription in which the name of five most important Buddhist *viharas* of that period that is Manadeva Vihara, Gumvihara, Srirajvihara, Kharjurikavihara and Madyamvihara, are mentioned (Bajracharya 2030 B.S.: 323-4).

Further, in the inscription we also come across the names of a few other *viharas* existing during the Lichchhavi period. They are Adhayaruchi Vihara, Vartakayan Gupta Vihara and Chaturbhattansan Vihara. These *viharas* are referred in the Yagabahal inscription of Lichchhavi King Narendra Deva. Sri Shivadeva Vihara is also another important *vihar* mentioned in the Vajradhar inscription of Narendra Deva (Bajracharya 2030. B.S.:499)

During this period, the *viharas* were organized under the guidance and management of the Buddhist *sangha*. We find the mention of Arya Bhikshu Sangha in the inscription of King Narendra Deva (Bajracharya 2030 B.S.:499). One of the Lichchhavi inscriptions mentions about Chaturdisa Arya Bhikshu Sangha (bhiskshu sangha of the four directions). This indicates

that the *sanghas* had a predominant status in the society and played a significant role in construction work as well as the maintenance of the *viharas*. *Vamsavalis* also contain references to the *viharas* of Lichchhavi period. According to the Gopalraj vamsavali, King Vrishadeva, the great grandfather of Mandeva I, founded the Singu – Vihara – Chaitya – Bhattarika. Further, Sriraj – Vihara was also constructed by King Dharmadeva, father of Mandeva I (Bajracharya 2030 B.S.:173). The existence of many *viharas* indicates that the *vihara* culture was very much developed during the period. However, most of all the existing *viharas* of Kathmandu are of *Mahayana* origin. This is because during the early Lichchhavi period, when *vihara* architecture developed in Nepal, *Mahayana* had become a predominant sect in Buddhism.

***Vihara* Culture in the Medieval period**

Vihara architecture in Nepal was designed from the very early period to maintain several activities that promoted *vihara* culture. The *viharas* were centres of religion, education and cultural activities in the medieval period. The earliest phase of the medieval period of Nepal's history is known as the Thakuri period. This period was marked with the revival and growth of cultural activities in the Kathmandu Valley. Buddhism and Buddhist culture flourished, providing a new dimension to both the material and spiritual life of the people of Nepal. Although Gumvihara of Sankhu, Swayambhu Vihara and Thamvihara of Kathmandu, Rudravarna Mahavihara of Patan and some other *viharas* are of Lichchhavi origin, they must have been renovated several times in later period. Chhusyabahal, Musyabahal, Padma Chakra Mahavihara, Dharmachakra Mahavihara, are some of the eminent *viharas* of the medieval age. The list of more than forty *viharas* is given by Regmi (Regmi 2028 B.S.:173). Additionally we know of hundreds of *viharas* from that period, most of the ancient foundations which still exist today were founded in that period, and the whole of *vihara* culture as we know it today developed in that period – the married *Sangha*, the rising importance of vajrayana and its place of Vajracharyas, the round of tantric ritual, the first examples of Buddhist texts etc. It is in the Thakuri period that we have the greatest flowering of Buddhism in the valley and for the *vihara* culture as it exists today the Thakuri period is certainly decisive. During this period, *viharas* continued to play an important role in educating people and preaching Buddhism. The monks and nuns who resided in them also used to educate the youths and masses who came to hear them. In order to study Nepalese Buddhism,

Buddhist art and architecture, many scholars from India, China and Tibet visited Nepal and stayed in various Nepalese monasteries.

Santrakshita, a famous Indian logician of the eighth century came to Nepal in A.D. 743 and stayed for six years. His Vigyananavada theory might have become popular among the Nepalese Buddhist scholars of this time, Padmasambhava, a professor of Yogachara school of Tantric Buddhism at the Nalanda Mahavihara visited Nepal in A.D. 743 (Sankalia 1934:119). In Nepal he practiced Tantric Sadhanas. He was very impressed by the Nepalese festivals and rituals. He stayed in Nepal for four years, and in A.D. 747 he left for Tibet. Komalasila was a great buddhist philosopher of India. He was the disciple of Santarakshita at Nalanda. During his visit in Nepal in A.D. 762 he was warmly received by the Nepalese Buddhist. He visited all the famous Buddhist centres of the Valley, especially the Swayambhu Chaitya and Buddhanath. In this way they all visited Nepal where they preached and worked for the expansion of Nepalese Buddhism. Some Buddhist monks of Tibet also visited Nepal for the cause of Nepalese Buddhism (A.D. 978-1026). They are Brogmi, Stang Lo-gzon, Mar-pa Dopa, Rwa lotsa-barDo-rjegrags, Gos se-btsum. The Chinese Buddhist priests also visited Nepal. Ki-ye with a mission of the Chinese Buddhist priests came to Nepal.

All these accounts show that from the ancient period Nepal was visited by many Buddhist philosophers as well as priests. Their visits and activities tied India, Nepal and Tibet in one strong knot of Buddhism. During the period in question, one can also see the gradual changes which occurred in the Buddhist society in Nepal. The *vajrayana* became the most dominating sect which injected mantras, charms and rituals to the basic and purely intellectual tenets of Buddhism. It destroyed the sanctity of monastic settlement including the lives of monks and nuns. The celibate monks disappeared entirely, changing into the communities of married *bare* (Shakya). This development gave Newar Buddhist of Nepal its special character (Regmi 2028 B.S.:119). In the *vihara*, nowadays, high caste Buddhist Newars such as Shakyas and Vajracharyas are initiated as Buddhist monks for some days. This initiation ceremony is called *Barechhuyegu*. Besides this, they have also many rites and rituals, festivals and ceremonies which have bound the community together. It is true that there were monasteries with celibate monks at one time and there are now only monasteries with *sanghas* of married or householder *Bhikshhus*. These *viharas* served as centres for the socio-religious affairs of the entire Buddhist community (Slusser 1982:288).

Characteristic Differences Between *Baha* and *Bahi*

Although both *baha* and *bahi* bear the formal names of Mahavihara these two terms possess some distinctive features that needs to be discussed.

In ancient period, the *bahis* were found as peaceful place for the Buddhist. Originally, the *bahis* were designed as places for training, preaching, copying religious manuscripts and providing shelter and boarding to visiting monks. Later on, when Buddhism developed the cult of *Vajrayana*, the residential monks began to lead married and domestic life. Then new *bahals* were constructed as establishments for communities of married monks. The references to *baha* can be seen in many Lichchhavi inscriptions.

Generally *bahis* are built up outside the settlement areas so that the members of *Bhikshu Sangha* can pursue their daily duties in peace and tranquility, for examples, *Puchho - Bahi*, *Chabahi*, and *Kindol Bahi* are located outside the main urban settlements. In ancient India too monasteries were built on mountains or outside the urban settlements. It is indicated that the famous Mauryan King Ashoka dug some caves in rocks for the monks. In Nepal, the *bahas* were constructed in the middle of the city or inside the city areas. One can see that almost all were constructed in the midst of principal settlements.

Architecturally, however, *baha* and *bahi* differ slightly from each other. Generally the *bahi* architecture is simpler than the *baha* one. The *bahis* are built up over a raised plinth or a platform about street level, for example, *Yampi-Bahi* of Patan with a higher plinth displays a typical *bahi* architecture. Further, on the rooftop of the shrine, a small temple-like structure or a hanging lantern-like structure is built. This typical structure of a *bahi* can be seen in the *Saptapur Mahabahi* at Lalitpur. The architectural style of the *baha* is more beautiful, lavish and elaborate than that of *bahi*. The architecture of Rudravarana Mahavihara and Hiranyavarana Mahavihara of Patan can be taken as examples. Here it would be relevant to mention that the *baha* became home of the tantric ritualistic activities of the vajracharya. On the other hand the *bahis* as the relics of an earlier, less-tantric Buddhist tradition, maintained more simplistic architectural form (Locke 1985:187).

In a *baha*, *gajurs* or pinnacles are attached on the top of the roof. The roof is wide, and the space under it is usually unused. Though Shakyamuni Buddha or one of the celestial Buddhas may be the *kwapadyo* or main deity of the *baha*, in most of the *bahas* the main deity is Akshobhya Buddha while most of *bahis* have Maitreya Bodhisattwa. On the ground floor of a *bahi* and a *baha*, there stands the main shrine which is always guarded by two lions,

elephants or griffins. This shrine is closed except for a latticed window. On the second floor of the *Baha* is a room called *agam*, where the *Tantric* deities of the *sangha* are kept and worshipped. The lower storey in both *baha* and *bahi* is in the form of an open *varanda*, and the upper storey is divided into residential room in a *baha* while it is a colonnaded room in a *bahi*. The upper storey of a *baha* provides the residence room for the monks during the days when these monasteries housed communities of celibate monks. The *bahis* have open exhibition halls where they exhibit *Dipankara* images in the month of *Gunla*. From the study of *baha* and *bahi* in all the three cities of Kathmandu Valley, one comes to know that *baha* are larger in shape and more in number than *bahi* because the *baha* could be built by the devotees while no new *bahi* can be constructed.

One cannot ignore that both the term *baha* and *bahi* have been derived from *vihara* and bear the formal names of "*mahavihara*". For example, Thanbahi is also called Vikramshila Mahavihara, while in *Bhuakha Bahi*, a *baha* is known as Henakar Mahavihara. Structurally, both *baha* and *bahi* have courtyards, each enclosed by a two-storied rectangular structure. The lower storey in both the *baha* and *bahi* is in the form of an open *varanda*. In both *baha* and *bahi* a *dharmadhatu mandal* is installed in front of the main deity. Both *baha* and *bahi* are built of brick and wood.

Propagation of Buddhism through the Viharas

From the very ancient period, Nepal was famous for its Buddhist *vihara*. These *viharas* were humming with intellectual activities of the Nepalese and foreign Buddhists and were the centres for the propagation of Buddhist religion and culture. The monks of the *vihara* possessed tremendous knowledge of religious texts. Later on, these monasteries played a significant role in the field of Tantric Buddhism. Mahabauddha *Vihara* or Ubaha of Patan, had been the traditional centre of tantric Buddhist rituals. *Guhyapuja* or the secret Buddhist practices are occasionally performed at the Mahabauddha *Vihara* of Patan.

Activities of the Viharas

Vihara is the main centre for the development of the religious texts and manuscripts. Numerous Buddhist texts were written or copied there. *Pancharaksha* and *Ashtasaharika pajnaparmita* were the popular texts written and edited in the *viharas*. Other important Buddhist texts include *Namasangiti*, *Ganadvyuha*, *Karandevyuha* and *Kangur* (Ram 1978:150). Most of the

Tibetan and Sanskrit manuscripts were also copied here. All big *viharas* were inhabited by great scholars and famous priests of the time who created a good collection of books. Therefore, the Nepalese *vihara* became the storehouse of Buddhist literature. Buddhist *vihara* such as Charumati Vihara, Rundravarna Mahavihara, and Hiranyavarna Mahavihar played the significant role in this regard. Because of their fame, they were visited by foreign scholars from time to time.

Conclusion

The study of a large number of extent *viharas* such as Rudravarna Mahavihara, Hiranyavarna Mahavihara and others, *viharas* in the principal cities of the Kathmandu Valley and references to innumerable *viharas* in the Lichchhavi and the Malla inscriptions bring to light the unique features of the Nepalese *viharas*. These *viharas* have their own peculiar characters which are intensely religious and supremely symbolic. Their quiet location provided the residing monks and scholars opportunity and inspiration to create bulks of Buddhist literature which not only educated the natives but also attracted foreign visitors. Translation of original Sanskrit and Newari into Tibetan took place in various *viharas* of Nepal. On the other hand *viharas* also assumed the role of cultural and ritual centres where growth rites and many communal-clans and family rituals were performed under the leadership of the resident monks. It should be mentioned here that the *vihara* became embodiment of Buddhist religion and culture in Nepal. The "*vihara* culture" therefore, should be understood in the context of Buddhist culture sustained by the *vihara*, the centre of learning and ritual performances.

References

- Bajracharya, Dhanavajra. 2030 V.S. *Lichchhavikalaka Abhilekha*. Kathmandu: Institute of Nepal and Asian Studies, Tribhuvan University (In Nepali).
- Bajracharya, Dhanavajra and K.P. Malla eds. 1985. *Gopalraj Vamsavali*. Nepal Research Centre Publication. Wiesbaden: Franz steiner Verlag.
- Bajracharya, Ratnakaji and Vijaya Ratna 1983. *Nepa Dyaya Viharaya Tacha*. Kathmandu: Authors (In Newari).

Beal, Samuel. 1969. *Buddhist Records of the Western World*. Delhi: Oriental Book.

Dutta, Sukumar 1962. *Buddhist Monks and Monasteries of India*, London: George Allen and Unwin.

Gellner, David N. 1993. *Monk, Householder and Tantric Priest*. India: Cambridge University Press.

Korn, Wolfgang. 1976, *The Traditional Architecture of the Kathmandu Valley*. Bibliotheca Himalayan Series 2. Kathmandu: Ratna Pustak Bhandar.

Locke, John K. 1985, *Buddhist Monasteries of Nepal*, Kathmandu: Sahayogi Press Pvt. Ltd.

_____ 1980. *Karunmaya: The Cult of Avalokitesvara Matsyendrnath in the Valley of Nepal*. Kathmandu: Sahayogi Prakashan.

Nepali, Gopal Singh. 1965. *The Newars* Bombay: United Asia Publications.

Ram, Rajendra. 1978. *History of Buddhism in Nepal*, Delhi: Motilal Banarsidas.

Regmi, D.R. 1969. *Ancient Nepal* 3rd ed. Calcutta: Firm K.L. Mukhopadhyaya.

Regmi, J.C. 2029 V.S. *Lichchhavi Samskriti* (In Nepali) Kathmandu: Royal Nepal Academy.

_____ 2028 V.S. *Nepalko Dharmik Itihas* (In Nepali), Kathmandu: Royal Nepal Academy

Slusser, Mary Shepherd. 1982. *Nepal Mandala: A Cultural Study of the Kathmandu Valley* Vol II. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Upadhyaya, Vasudeva. 1972. *Prachin Bharatiya Stupa, Guha Abam Mandir: Vihara Hindi Granth*, Academy Samaylam Bhavan Kadamkuwa.

Watters, Thomas. 1973. *On Yuan Chwang's Travels in India*. Vol. I. Second Edition, New Delhi: Mumshiram Manoharlal Publishers.

Wright, Daniel. 1972. *History of Nepal*, Kathmandu: Nepal Antiquated Book Publishers.

DEVELOPMENT CO-OPERATION IN SOUTH ASIA: A NEPALESE PERSPECTIVE

Bishwa Keshar Maskay

Introduction

Regional co-operation thrives on the shared interests of its members. It is like a joint enterprise which involves initial investment costs but ultimately offers positive benefits. The question of the sustainability of co-operation, like enterprises, is therefore the legitimate concern of its beneficiaries. This is why there is a momentous growth of cooperation organizations for development in both developed and underdeveloped regions alike. This growth has also led to the belief that there is more benefit in cooperation than noncooperation.

The Charter of the South Asian Association for Regional Co-operation (SAARC) sets its objectives of peace, freedom, social justice and economic prosperity through mutual understanding, good neighbourly relations and meaningful cooperation in the region for achieving *national and collective self-reliance* and promoting *people-to-people* understanding at the regional level (SAARC n.d.a). Common civilization heritage, ecology and geographical proximity claim the importance of economic co-operation in South Asia. Moreover, to tackle the common challenges of growing population, inequality, environmental degradation and chronic poverty as well as to prevent the continuous marginalization of the region from the world market, benefits of co-operation are highlighted by several studies.

The growth of regionalism in many parts of the worlds both as a result of the globalization process and the inability of nation-states to fulfil basic human needs has brought regional economic co-operation as a major line of development strategy. Institutionalised co-operation in south Asia, however, is of late origin: only with the onset of SAARC in the first half of the 1980s. It is an institutionalised co-operation among its constituent members—Nepal, India, Bangladesh, Sri Lanka, Pakistan, Bhutan and the Maldives—aiming to solve common socioeconomic problems and generate regional harmony, peace and development (Wagner 1994).

Objective of the SAARC

SAARC Charter spells out eight specific objectives, consisting of promoting the welfare of the people; improving their quality of life through accelerated economic, social, and cultural development of the region; shaping collective self-reliance, collaboration and mutual assistance in various fields, including the development of their common position in international organisations. The initiation of the Integrated Program of Action (IPA), consisting of twelve agreed Areas—agriculture, education and culture, environment, health and population activities, meteorology, prevention of drug-trafficking and drug-abuse, rural development, science and technology, communications, tourism, transport, and women and development—involve the function approach to evolve and integrated community. Two SAARC regional institutions—the Agriculture Information Centre in Dhaka (SAARC 1993), and Tuberculosis Centre in Kathmandu—as well as agreement to establish two additional Centres for Documentation, and Meteorology Research respectively in New Delhi and Dhaka as regional actors with stake in their survival and expansion of goals, are likely to generate further momentum toward regional integration processes.

The Charter of SAARC relies primarily on mutually beneficial co-operation where bilateral and multilateral co-operation will be *consistent and complementary* to each other. That is, it will depend on the nation state until the spillover process brings substantial change in the political culture, sentiment, and attitudes of South Asian governments and the people; it increases their structural and functional *interdependencies* both at sectoral and general levels among the regional states, interest groups, and political parties; and it increases the power of the SAARC Secretary General and the secretariat in decision-making which is binding to the national governments. One decade of SAARC's existence reveals that institutional pluralism has entailed regional coordinating mechanism.

As the size and power potential of SAARC members are unequal, the benefits and costs are proportional. Policy-making in SAARC is the responsibility of the Council of Minister, consisting of the foreign ministers of seven member states, who meet twice a year. Below it is the Standing Committee, comprising foreign secretaries charged with the responsibility of monitoring and co-ordination, project approval and modality of financing, determining intersectoral priorities, mobilization of internal and external financing and identification of new areas of co-operation based on concrete studies. Below this are Technical Committees to look into specialised functional areas and to report to Standing Committee. The latter can also create Action Committees concerned with the implementation of projects.

The ultimate decision-making power, however, rest with the apex body: Heads of States or governments of seven members who meet once a year.

The SAARC Funding

Contribution of each member state, on voluntary basis, regional mobilisation, as well as mobilisation from 'appropriate' external sources on the approval of the Standing Committee constitute the financial basis of SAARC. Recommendation for the appointment of costs for implementing programs is made by technical committees. So far there are three sources of funding for SAARC activities. The SAARC Fund for Regional Projects is made up of contributions accorded by member states; the SAARC Special Fund is mainly the contribution of the Japanese government on an annual basis; and the SAARC Regional Fund consists of the contributions made by donor countries, private agencies, and international organisations. Recently, a feasibility study is being carried out for the proposed South Asian Development Fund (SADF) expected to finance selected projects in the fields of Food Security Reserve. The Secretariat has also received proposals for co-operation from ITU, the World Meteorological Organisation, the South Asia Co-operative Environment Program, the International Trade Centre, UNICEF and ESCAP.¹ Contrary to the initial hesitation, that taking funds from outside would dictate SAARC's policies, confidence in such collaboration is growing.

The rules of the game defined for SAARC postulate that decisions at all levels are made on the basis of unanimity and that bilateral and contentious issues are excluded from the deliberations of SAARC (SAARC n.d.b.). This was a sound strategy until the take off of co-operation both at functional and institutional levels.

Building Blocks of South Asian Regionalism

The economic order contrived by the South Asian governments, however, did not spur positive environment for co-operation until the beginning of the eighties.² Unlike ASEAN,³ absence of acceptable political understanding, lack of a regional institutional framework, persistence of ancient suspicions and rivalries, and conflicts between India and its neighbours prevented the evolution of sufficient political will for economic co-operation. Therefore in the initial stage of SAARC its strategic option was only muddled about allowing tremendous scope for debates, but limiting the actual capacity to allocate goods and services, values and institutions (Schmitter 1971). After seven consecutive summits in the various cities of member states, the scope and the level of its activities in functional, issue-specific and institutional areas have considerably increased.

The democratisation of all the South Asian states has created a new environment where the rise of non-state actors engaged in activities within and across national boundaries are creating new opportunities. The demands for the redistribution of resources, statuses, and identities are proliferating. The scarcities of resources, tendencies toward ethnic, linguistic, socio-cultural and regional loyalties, and the forces of interdependence are becoming global in scope. These scarcities are not only the crucial cause of regional economies but a consequence of the unstable nature of a global political economy that prescribes adjustment for the South Asian states rather than offering options for policy flexibility. Adjustment is less easy politically because of the weak national consensus on this policy, the less efficacious legitimacy, the poor development performances of the countries of the region.

The third summit laid stress on the strengthening of inter-governmental efforts with increased people-to-people contacts and called for greater participation of NGOs, including professional bodies in the private sector, in the process of promoting socioeconomic and cultural development of the region. There is also the need for coordinating national NGOs at the regional level for the exchange of technology, goods, capital and knowledge in respect to their potential to augment growth and the level of education and thereby bring the poor and marginalized sections of society into the mainstream of development.

The recognition received by SAARC Chambers of Commerce and Industry, an NGO comprising the chambers of commerce of all the member states, and the possibility of granting similar recognition to the associations of lawyers, architects, and accountants, underline the gravity of non-state actors in promoting understanding among the people for developmental co-operation (Kanesa lingam 1993). Increased emphasis on people-to-people co-operation implies a shift from the central role of state bureaucratic instruments to decentralised social, political and economic development composed and nourished by the people themselves. Strong sociocultural ties among the region's peoples, interest groups, and pressure groups are likely to generate dampening effect on the potentials of interstate conflicts. Once the irreversibility of these ties has been proved by ensuring benefits to the member states, it will unleash more rewarding chances to enter into sensitive areas.

Trade-off between arms and human development is a must in the region because of the need to create development funds, training of the people for nation-building, buying technology and tools and so forth to make the region as a whole competitive for the Twenty-First Century. Regional cooperation is a highly political issue because it alters the patterns of behaviours of cooperating states. In this sense, regional cooperation entails cooperative security embodying confidence-building and non-military defense. The 1990

military expenditure of the regional countries—India (17.0 percent), Pakistan (30.9 percent), Sri Lanka (7.4 percent), Bangladesh (10.1 percent), Nepal (6.0 percent), and the Maldives (1.2 percent)—is comparatively higher if the data are compared with their respective investments in human development.

Issues that are gaining importance in SAARC are welfare of children, disabled persons, girl child and youth. Two studies pertaining to the causes and the consequences of natural disasters, the protection of the environment, and the greenhouse effect and its impact in the region have made pertinent recommendations to the regional governments for immediate action (SAARC 1992a; SAARC 1992 b). The seventh SAARC summit marked the need for integrating population objectives into the formulation of development strategies of member countries. Given the under-utilised resource base of the region, including the water resources, the overutilization of forests (2 percent remains), and the abnormality that over one-fifth of the world's population occupies less than four percent of the land area, the development resources is of uppermost significance. The absence of SAARC's own institutions to implement policies for most of its activities, however, led these policies to muddle around rather than muddle-through-to come to a successful conclusion incrementally.

Some concrete steps have been taken for promoting cooperation in core economic areas identified both by the SAARC Group of Planners, composed of the planning commissions and planning ministries of the members states, as well as a high level Committee on Economic Cooperation (CEC). One critical area is the regional investment on agriculture development, important for lifting the poverty curtain by fulfilling the basic human needs. The other is the signing of the SAARC Preferential Trading Arrangement (SAPTA) in the seventh summit with the objectives of liberalizing trade by removing tariff, para-tariff, and non-tariff barriers that restricted trade among the regional states and increasing the trade of the member countries with developing countries in particular and the rest of the world in general (SAARC 1993; IGSAC 1993). This is a bold step for overcoming the increasing marginalization of South Asia from the world political economy as evidenced by its exclusion from the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) in Seattle, small share of world trade (exports: 0.82; imports: 1.03 percent), low GDP growth rate (5.3 percent) despite huge population share (20 percent, and the discriminatory nature of the world trading regime defined by the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT), which emphasised the need for liberalizing textile trade by dismantling the thirty-year old Multiflora Arrangement.⁴ SAPTA is partly a response to recent international developments such as the formation of the ASEAN Free Trade (AFTA), EC trade bloc and NAFTA. Unlike ASEAN, however, South Asia lacks a growth

triangle where infrastructure integration and the removal of barriers to capital and labor mobility would inspire foreign investments to constitute effective development strategy. Intra-regional trade in both also regions remains abysmally low. Reduction of tariff and non-tariff barriers and adjustment to imports from partners will increase both efficiency and productivity, tax harmonisation and product standarization, even spawn non-economic benefits (Ghei 1993).

South Asian states continue to have difficulties in opening intra-regional trade for a number of reasons. All the regional countries specialize in similar labor-intensive manufactures. They are at similar stages of economic development, and their competitive strength is directed outside the region, except perhaps Nepal, Sri Lanka, and Bangladesh, which are promoting trade within the region. In this context, SAPTA can provide a regional framework in which India and Pakistan, who are discriminating each other and using a tortuous route of transport, can have preferential trading arrangement. If the regional countries can open trade with the strong economies of Japan, Germany, Korea, ASEAN countries, the United States, Canada, and so forth, why can they not compete with each other? The fear that India will overwhelm smaller economies is simply unrealistic because goods are sold and bought in credit, where India is in a weak position to offer. Even if it does, there will be benefits: regional states will import cheaper goods, machinery, and so forth and spend less in foreign exchange, bear lower capital costs and likely to become more competitive (Haq 1993). If trade imbalances occur for smaller economies, India can offer incentives to limit, modify, and possibly reverse them.

Trade expansion, however, entails a regional monetary union to coordinate regional exchange rates to harmonize monetary issues and to promote export credit and transactions for trade and travel on local currencies. Free convertibility was preferred in the second summit. Yet politicians and bankers opted for only limited convertibility for tourism. The SAARC Visa Exemption Scheme as well as the scheme for Promoting Organized Tourism underlined by SAARC are laudatory steps for regional economic integration. There is also an imperative of creating a macro-economic milieu for making proper economic decisions, particularly in the areas of fiscal, monetary and exchange rates, avoiding excessive balance of payment deficits, and Achieving A modest level of saving at the regional level (Dahal 1994). Slow economic transformation of South Asia where agriculture is still defining the future of the region is marked by unstable economic growth, gap between saving and investments, heavy reliance on foreign aid, and less foreign investments. The existence of political instability, vested interest, inertia, and persistent

bilateralism in South Asia, however, created more aspiration than achievements of regional integration.

The underlying growth potential of South Asia remains undiminished, given the abundance of natural resources, modest level of manpower, and the scope for technological innovation and investment. But the future of SAARC is contingent on its steady economic as opposed to political evolution; for, the basic condition of human life (social, psychological, and political, etc) is being governed by the economic equilibrium of society. Poverty, inequality, and illiteracy are mostly the product of economic disequilibrium. This thinking puts greater premium on cooperation. Secluded independence, reinforced tariff barriers and other measures, and reversing the regional process of backward and forward linkages undermine the goal of economic development. Liberalization of trade and progressive integration of economies necessary for development entail the diversification of the source of supply, competitiveness of units, proper investment policies, sound management in fiscal policies, research and development, and entrepreneurial zeal. SAARC studies suggest the need for more interaction among the regional states than with extra-regional countries and achieving collective self-reliance of the region through people-to-people solidarity and cooperation so as to minimize power and market dependency created by the previous active role of the governments (Bhargane 1995). Participation of South Asia in international financial regimes requires the regional states' common policies, collective identity, and concerted action. In a framework of completely asymmetric interdependence revealing a low level of equilibrium in cooperation, only the constant dialogues between the industrialized North and agrarian South, between South and South, and between South Asia And other regional groupings, international institutions and forces are likely to unfold a situation more conducive for cooperative development in the region.

For smaller states, too, regional integration can offer an opportunity for overcoming the small size of the national domestic market, provide an outlet to the international market that, according to comparative advantage, promises welfare gains and forms the bedrock of their viability (Ashoff 1988). The willingness of foreign governments and international institutions to cooperate with SAARC And a better convergence in policies through adjustment are valuable to minimize the sources of conflicts— a vital precondition necessary for turning cooperation into a non-zero-sum game (Khatri 1991). This is true for multilateral joint investment also, which entail, inter alia, strong ties among regional states for they involve long-term capital, technology, and resource sharing and harmony in monetary, fiscal, industrial and commercial policies. Political will for regional cooperation is evident from the speeches at the various summits. Nepal offers to harness is

water resources; Bhutan emphasises on regional involvement in trade and joint economic ventures; the Maldives calls for formulating strategies and programs for utilizing cooperation as an effective vehicle for shared progress and prosperity; India stresses core economic issues – trade industry, money and finance; Sri Lanka focuses on intra-regional trade expansion and joint ventures; and Bangladesh appeals for SAARC's involvement in more concrete and result-oriented activities for strengthening the foundation of collective self-reliance.⁵

The social precondition for economic development is a must for the takeoff of regional cooperation. For example, South Asian countries' social indicators of human development are very low. Except Sri Lanka (86), which falls in medium human development ranking all the countries come in the low human development ranking; the Maldives (112), Pakistan (132), India (134), Bangladesh (147), Nepal (152) and Bhutan (159). Until adequate allocation is made on population, education, training, information, health care, water, nutrition, immunization and family planning services, and substantial portions are cut from defense expenditures, the goals of participatory development will remain tantalizing. All the regional countries fall into low income GNP per capita below \$500 whose failure to meet even these minimum preconditions represents a recipe for inefficiency of the regional governments fuelling the sources of underdevelopment.

Modernization of economies requires technical and professional manpower, institutional and policy reforms to adjust with the globalization process. Learning and absorption capacities are directly correlated to the modernization of agriculture, industry and technology. The market mechanism alone would be ineffective. Although the SAARC countries adopted an adjustment policy that took into account macro-economic growth, the importance of reducing poverty, raising income levels and distribution, employment, education and participation in the market and political process has been well reflected in a report "Meeting the Challenge" prepared by an Independent South Asian Commission on Poverty Alleviation. For realizing what the report calls *dāl-bhāt*, or basic needs, calls for a radical shift from its hitherto trickle-down model. The new perspective on development reflects a modest shift from the state-centric, centralized and urban-industrialization that are biased to a pro-people, participatory, decentralized and sustainable development model. The changing relationship between the state and private sectors is cyclical rather than linear because policy flexibility in South Asia has yet to introduce major changes in the basic structures of society. The shift has become imperative because South Asia has the largest concentration of the world's poor, accounting for more than 46 percent of the total number of poor in the developing world. The leitmotif of development here means development of

the people. There are individual success stories of South Asia whose lessons include (Bhattarai et al. 1992):

- Building organizations of the poor for saving and investment is essential for poverty alleviation
- Empowerment of the poor is the means to poverty eradication
- Poor women can effectively overcome their double burden through the same process
- The need for sensitive support mechanisms to catalyse the process of social mobilization
- Participatory monitoring and evaluation have to be built into the process so that self corrective action can take place as the process evolves.

SAARC's transition from state-centric to a people-to-people cooperation demonstrates a move toward the creation of civil society where people have a right to participate in every decision that affects them. People's participation, however, presupposes the activation of passive and marginalized sections of South Asian people toward the goals of accelerated development, even to democratic processes that define the *ends and means of development*. A high sense of civic competence is important to inspire the voluntary participation of citizenry whose roots lie in mutual learning and experience, in protecting and promoting their personal and collective interests in sustained manner. Participation prevents alienation and rebellion of the people and enforces their accountability to the representative institutions and values. Democracy survives within nation states, and as nations lose control over economic matters to the globalization process, democracy's writ is seriously undermined (Dionne 1993:6).

Democratic development posits: first, development is for the people rather than people for development. It is a bottom-up process where people cope with and benefit from the processes of economic, social, political and other activities. Participation makes them responsible to the development processes. If development alienates some and inspires others it will have a polarizing effect. All polarizing development is unprogressive for those satisfied try to maintain it while the deprived ones try to overthrow it thus making the whole development process unsustainable. Second, the philosophy of development springs from the self-cognition of the people about their existence, their needs and wants, the causes of their misery, and the ethics. Third, the basic concern of development centres around how people organize themselves in society and promote their productive life. Fourth, development is a means to realize people's self-worth and self-fulfilment, not in isolation but in the totality of human society. And finally, development

implies a change toward greater perfection taking into account the needs and aspirations of majority.

Conclusion

The development of the cooperative mechanism in South Asia through SAARC enables the regional states to efficiently utilize the scarce regional resources for their long-term benefit. This is because such development is based on rational cost-benefit calculation where the cost of non-cooperation is greater than cooperation. This will also minimize the political consideration of allocation—thus establishing the role of government as a *facilitator* in infrastructure-creation and maintenance, rather than controller of the development process. It is only in self-governing institutions people offer labor, resources and other services, and maintain and nurture them. This means legislative power of the regional people is important to *evolve institutional rules, monitor compliance, and enforce sanctions* thus making the whole development processes sustainable (Ostrin et al. 1993). Only through sustainable development people can control regional markets, not just by regulating price but also addressing the growing quality, innovation, management and a variety of goods and services. Such measures give space for civil society to organize and work for cooperative development. These are also the areas where the primary interests of South Asian people are converging.

The growing interdependence within South Asian states and the rest of the world is a matter of stark necessity rather than a choice. SAARC embodies a common framework of development goals with members and common implementation of policies for poverty alleviation, equality and social justice. The increasing realization of common commitment to non-offensive defense and conflict-resolution at the national and regional levels is expected to generate an energy for addressing the common challenges of poverty, disempowerment, and disenfranchisement. Clearly, cooperative development cannot move in the absence of participatory regional processes where regional governments at the apex and people at the bottom marshal their resources and maintain their confidence in the SAARC's Charter. Fellowship can be derived from intimacy in cooperative behaviour, rather obsolete hegemonism, in the sharing of common wealth of the region for collective self-reliance, necessary to sustain the new development perspective.

Notes

1. I.H. Zaki, "An Overview of the Recent Developments in SAARC" Keynote Address made at a regional seminar on "South Asia: the Roads Ahead" organized by CGSSAP in co-operation with Friedrich Ebert Stiftung on November 16, 1993.

2. The idea of regional cooperation in South Asia was first made by president Ziaur Rahman of Bangladesh in May 1980. Then the "Proposal for Regional Cooperation in South Asia" was circulated by his country in November. The modus operandi for this was streamlined in 1981 by the foreign ministers of regional countries. In August 1983 the IPA was launched through the adoption of the declaration on south Asian Regional Cooperation. (SAARC). The first summit in Dhaka in December 1985 declared the establishment of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC). Following this other summits were held in India (1986), Nepal (1987), Pakistan (1988), the Maldives (1990), Sri Lanka (1991), Bangladesh (1993) and India (1995).
3. Anuwar Ali, "Economic Transformation and its Implications for Interdependence and Competitiveness: Southeast Asian Perspectives". Paper presented at "Economic Transformation in Asia and the Pacific: Social, Political, and Ecological Perspectives, APIDA Tenth General Meeting 5-8 October 1993; Colombo, Sri Lanka. and S. S. Colombage, Payments And Monetary Cooperation (Colombo: FES-CGSSAP, 1994).
4. Data for this article are mainly taken from the *Human Development Report* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993), and *Meeting the Challenge*.
5. An in-depth analysis made of the participatory process at the micro terrain such as Women's Development Program (WDP) in India, the Aga Khan Rural Support Program (AKRSP) in Pakistan, the Small Farmers' Development Program (SFDP) in Nepal the Mongar Primary Health Care Program (MPHP) in Bhutan, the Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee (BRAC) in Bangladesh, and the Janashatki Banku sangam (JBS) in Sri Lanka, as well as other cases such as the Working Women's Forum (WWF) and Self-Employed Women's Association (SEWA), in India, the Production Credit for Rural Women (PCRW) in Nepal, the Orangi Pilot Project (OPP) in Pakistan, and the Grameen Bank in Bangladesh reflect the kind of social mobilization taking place where the poor have contributed to growth and human development simultaneously, under varying sociopolitical circumstances.

References

- Ashoff, Guido. 1988. *Economic and Industrial Development Options for Small Third World Countries*. Berlin: GDI.
- Bhargave, K.K, Heinz Bongartz and Faroog Shobhan, eds. 1995. *Shaping South Asia's Future: Role of Regional Cooperation*. New Delhi: Vikas.

- Bhattarai, K.B. et al. 1992. *Meeting the Challenge*. Kathmandu: SAARC Secretariat.
- Dahal, Dev Raj. 1994. "Developing Regionalism in South Asia." *The Kathmandu Post*. April 29.
- Dionne, Jr.E.J. 1993. "Neo-nationalism isn't Only a Russian Temptation". *International Herald Tribune*, December 15, p. 6.
- Ghei, Nita. 1993. "GATT, NAFTA and All That." *The Economic Times*. December 16.
- Haq, Mahbub Ul. 1993. "Interview." *The Economic Times*. December 28.
- IGSAC. 1993. *SAARC: Moving Towards Core Areas of Cooperation*. Dhaka IGSAC.
- Kanessalingam, V. 1993. *Collective Self-reliance of South Asia*. Sri Lanka: FES-CGSSAP.
- Khatri, Shridhar K. 1992. "A Decade of South Asian Regionalism Retrospect and Prospect." *Contemporary South Asia*, Vol. I, pp. 5-23.
- Ostrom, Elinor et al. 1993. *Institutional Incentives and Sustainable Development: Infrastructure Policies in Perspective*. Boulder: Westview Press.
- SAARC. 1991. *SAARC Study on Trade, Manufactures, and Services*. Kathmandu: SAARC Secretariat.
- SAARC. 1992 a. *Regional Study on the causes and consequences of Natural Disasters and the Protection and Preservation of environment*. Kathmandu: SAARC Secretariat.
- SAARC. 1992 b. *Regional Study on Greenhouse Effect and its impact in the region*. Kathmandu: SAARC Secretariat.
- SAARC. 1992 c. *Agreement on SAARC Preferential Trading Arrangement*. Kathmandu: SAARC Secretariat.
- SAARC. 1993. *SAARC in Brief*. Kathmandu: SAARC Secretariat.

SAARC. n.d.a. *Charter of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation*. Kathmandu: SAARC Secretariat.

SAARC. n.d.b. *Provisional Rules of Procedures*. Kathmandu: SAARC Secretariat.

Schmitter, Philippe. 1971. "Revised Theory of Regional Integration." In Leon Linber and S.A. Scheingold (eds.), *Regional Integration: Theory and Research*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, pp. 242-46.

Wagner, Christion. 1994. *Regional Cooperation in Europe and South Asia: Can the European Union Serve as a Model for SAARC?* Kathmandu: NEFAS.

MANAGEMENT OF NATIONAL HERITAGE AREAS

Bishnu Bhandari

Background

The wise use of natural resources is a key factor in attaining sustainability. The term sustainable development can be interchanged with eco-development. The principle underlying sustainable development is the sustainable use of natural resources, preserving biological diversity and maintaining essential the ecological or life support system through the equitable use of resources. This word has been extensively used in developmental parlance.

"Conservation," according to the World Conservation Strategy (1980:4), is defined as "the management of human use of the biosphere so that it may yield the greatest sustainable benefits to present generations while maintaining its potential to meet the needs and aspirations of future generations. Thus conservation is positive embracing preservation, maintenance, sustainable utilization, restoration, and enhancement of the natural environment."

A myriad of ways and means have been in practice for ages in our society to maintain the sustainability of our scarce resources. The most important one among them is the management of cultural and natural resources in a sustainable way.

The primary objective of this paper is to introduce the concept of heritage as both a tool and a process to effectively manage our natural and cultural heritage in a wise and sustainable way. The first section talks about the meaning and significance of heritage with some practical examples and its benefits to the society. The second section describes the National Heritage Conservation Programme, its philosophical elements, and an explanation of its innovative approach. The third section deals with function of the NHC Register and seventeen cultural and natural heritage sites of national significance. Criteria of assessment are also presented in this section. The fourth section describes a twelve-step process of national heritage conservation. The fifth chapter deals with national heritage significance of the Panauti Area.

Meaning of Heritage

The World Heritage means many different things to different people: a piece of item such as, a knife, an object, a building, endangered and threatened species of animals or their habitat, an ecosystem, a natural site, cultural expression, or social passions. It is called *sampada* in Nepali.

The popular adage "one man's meat is another man's poison" can be applied in the case of heritage. This is especially true in an ethnically heterogeneous society like Nepal's. For instance, *Pung* has great cultural value in the Gurung community, but it has no significance in the Brahman, Kshetry, or Newar communities. What is highly valued by one community may not be valued by another. For instance, wearing a *sacred* thread is a social heritage for Brahman, Kshetry and upper class people of the Hindu Newar community but not to the people of other communities.

In general terms, heritage is viewed as an inheritance like a piece of land to which one has a right at birth, and which links us with past generations. There is an implication that, with this right, comes a responsibility to pass on that property in a good, or even improved, condition to future generations which, in turn, will also possess it as a right (Carew-Reid, 1992:41). It is always a connection between the past and the future and has a cultural implication.

Conventionally, we usually think and talk about heritage as specific items of well-recognised structure, or well-defined areas. It is this tendency to break heritage down into items and parts separate from our surroundings that has led worldwide to our failure to adequately conserve it. What remains often becomes so isolated and separate from life as to diminish its traditional heritage values.

What we are discovering is that the things viewed as heritage are woven within systems, which, as a whole, are always much greater in importance than their constituent parts. This means that unless we recognise and understand all parts of the system and their relationships, with each other we cannot expect to manage and conserve those heritage items which are of specific immediate significance.

Explaining the meaning of heritage in his address at the Workshop on National Heritage Conservation in 1991, Carew-Reid (1992:41) states:

The heritage concept is like an iceberg. What we see, and what is of immediate importance to us, is one of the surfaces. But if we concentrate our management effort in trying to conserve just the part that is visible, we will unavoidably fail. It will continue to diminish before our eyes. The reason, of course, is that much the same way as only 10 percent of the iceberg is visible on the surface, an item of obvious heritage significance

only reflects a mere fraction of the legacy it represents. The greater ice mass below the surface, supporting the icepeak, melts at a faster rate because of increasing water temperature; in the same way specific heritage items are supported by a foundation of natural and social resource which, if it erodes, will result in collapse and loss of the heritage.

UNESCO and World Heritage Sites

Article I of the world Heritage Convention of the UNESCO (1971) defines "cultural heritage" as monuments, groups of buildings and sites. A cultural monument must, for example, be authentic and have exerted a great architectural influence or bear a unique witness, or be associated with ideas or beliefs of universal significance, or it may be an outstanding example of a traditional way of life that represents a certain culture. The World Heritage Committee used two criteria with several sub-criteria for including cultural properties in the World Heritage List.¹

A natural heritage property will be considered to be of an outstanding universal value if it meets one or more criteria and fulfills the conditions of integrity.²

The aim of the convention is to promote cooperation among all nations and peoples in order to contribute effectively to this protection, because these properties belong to all mankind. The convention is thus original in its conception. It embodies some important new ideas linking together the conservation of nature and of culture which until recently had rarely been seen in conjunction with each other. For a long time, nature and culture were perceived as opposing elements in that man was supposed to conquer a hostile nature, while culture symbolized spiritual values. However, nature and culture are complementary: the cultural identity of different people has been forged in the environment in which they live. Frequently, the most beautiful man-made works owe part of their beauty to their natural surroundings. Some of the most spectacular natural sites bear the imprint of centuries of human activity. Sadly, in our modern world, cultural monuments and natural sites appear to be equally threatened by degradation.

The properties listed from Nepal in the World Heritage list are Sagarmatha National Park, Kathmandu Valley (Pashupati, Boudha, Changu Narayan, Swayambhu, Kathmandu Durbar Square, Patan Durbar Square, and Bhaktapur Durbar Square) and Royal Chitwan National Park.

The Convention describes these treasures as properties of an outstanding universal value from the point of view of art, or history, science or natural beauty.

According to the definition of IUCN, Nepal:

Those places, national heritage has been defined objects, and activities that are components of the natural or cultural environment of Nepal and have aesthetic, historic, scientific, religious, spiritual, social, or communal significance; or any other special value for future as well as present generations (NPC/IUCN, 1992).

Importance of Heritage in Society

Heritage properties or items are of great significance. They always help introduce the community with outside the world. Through heritage people of different ethnic groups live in harmony. They instill in people a sense of togetherness and solidarity. It is heritage that makes a community unique and attractive to tourists and visitors. Some of important benefits of heritage are given below:

1. *Civic pride*: helps recognize and appreciate a community's historic fabric and history.
2. *Business opportunities*: provide business opportunities such as in the restoration industry, tourism business, provision of local goods and services, basic needs service, employment, etc.
3. *Quality of life*: more than modern materials, goods and conveniences, it includes values of the area.
4. *Conservation Awareness*: Heritage is good for business. Community resources are revitalized.
5. *Tourism*: Heritage and well-maintained heritage can provide an attraction to the visitors and tourists. Tourism is all about the cultural and natural heritage. This is what people come to see. If heritage is not conserved, tourists will not come. It demands a considerable dependence on tourism.
6. *Enjoyment*: provides enjoyment and appreciation of the area.
7. *Multiple benefits*: The management of heritage provides multiple benefits to the community.

The Conservation of National Heritage

In order to promote the conservation of cultural and natural heritage of national significance in Nepal, the National Conservation Strategy Implementation Project, coordinated by the National Planning Commission, has introduced a programme called the National Heritage Conservation Programme with technical assistance from IUCN-The World Conservation Union. The programme was started in 1990. Its main aim was to prepare a comprehensive register of natural and cultural heritage areas of national importance and develop approaches to managing these properties based on

community involvement and intersectoral cooperation. This programme has been run in collaboration with the Nepal Heritage Society, national non-governmental organization established to advance the cause of conserving cultural and natural heritage areas of the country. It is based on three principles.

Cultural Continuum. Heritage is an expression of culture that may be found within both nature and the things created by men. It is a continuum of cultural expression that extends from the most primitive natural places to the most densely populated urban conditions. Within the continuum, heritage is found in a myriad of ways that reflect the web of beliefs, patterns of behaviour, concepts of significance, and the physical creation of the people of Nepal over the millennia. It is neither purely natural nor purely human centered. The cultural expression emerges out of the landscape in terms of thoughts, beliefs, and the built environment. Heritage can be described as a "cultural phenomena," too.

Living Process. Heritage should be seen as a living process that grows and changes with time and must be folded into life in order to survive. It is living and is not a museum of protected things but parts of people's lives. Heritage is most relevant if it is seen as part of the daily life of ordinary people. It is then seen to have social religious, political, economic and historic significance and will be conserved as a living process as part of day-to-day life. Where the links between heritage and the communities have been broken or have never existed, the nature of the conservation process dies.

System. Heritage Conservation involves a wide range of interlinked elements, players and forces (Government, NGOs, donors, etc.) which must be recognized and integrated for successful conservation. All these forces must be joined by realistic management approaches which will vary from place to place depending on what is being conserved and why it is thought to be important.

An Innovative School of Thought

The heritage properties are our common property and can be conserved only through our common responsibility. This is not to say that every man's responsibility is no man's responsibility. The programme represents both an alternative philosophy and a new practice of heritage conservation in implementing the National Conservation Strategy for Nepal. It is an innovative approach for the following reasons.

1. It is based on a pluralist or intersectoral approach in which the responsibility of conserving these areas is in the hands of not one but many authorities. It ranges from individual to community, from quasi-government to government, from Non-governmental Organization (NGO)

to International Non-governmental Organization (INGO), and so forth. It integrates all activities of life. It is recognised that conservation management needs to be explored from all aspects, and the interests of the government and the people need to be identified and integrated for a successful conservation activity.

2. The approach adopted in the programme is based upon a holistic view of heritage. The Conservation of National Heritage in Nepal (1992:1) states that heritage is seen as an interconnected living system of both natural and human-centered elements and regards the full range of Nepalese culture as worthy of protection. People's daily and social, economic, cultural and political life must develop to support the conservation of important place of heritage significance. People cannot protect one thing and ignore the rest. Heritage should be seen as a whole system.
3. Heritage conservation cannot be imposed on people, particularly if they cannot afford it. Nor can it be worked out in isolation. It needs active community involvement, but it cannot be mobilized unless we provide benefits and incentives to participants. It must come from within, from a strong wish and need to keep things of the past alive and useful and in a good condition. Some things can be conserved by people taking responsibility themselves, usually small things which are central to their lives. But the big things need a larger commitment so that many people can act together. Community involvement from the very beginning is the key to heritage conservation. If the community does not participate in maintenance; in daily use; in practicing the songs, the dances, the festivals and the religious life, in caring for forests and lands; and in protecting wildlife, then these things disappear. Not only is the participatory planning process essential, but that participatory management of heritage is also required.
4. A fresh approach recognizes that the role played by heritage in socioeconomic development is vital. Heritage conservation can induce local development and may even lead to an improved quality of life. Heritage management can stimulate income generating activities in the community.
5. *Prakriti* and *purush* are the two sides of the life support system or the universe. According to the Hindu spiritual philosophy, *prakriti* (material cause of the universe) and *purush* (human being) are created by God for sustenance. They are inseparable from each other. The existence of one is impossible without that of the other. They are unconditionally accepted as in their harmonious relationship. So in this programme, cultural and natural heritage are viewed and blended together. They are never in conflict with each other, rather, they fall into the continuum of cultural expansion

from primitive natural places to urban areas. They complement each other. One cannot be conserved without the other.

Proposed National Heritage Conservation Register

A review of the literature on heritage conservation and discussions with key conservation experts indicate that much of Nepal's rich natural and cultural heritage is declining. If prompt action is not taken, the remainder of our heritage will disappear. It is thus essential to identify such types of heritage property or items and include them in the register. The main aim of the register is to:

1. identify heritage areas or items of national significance;
2. describe why they are important;
3. promote practical conservation and management activities; and
4. provide due legal protection to the sites.

The heritage register may be called an inventory or list, but here we have chosen to call it a National Heritage Conservation (NHC) Register. It is scientific as well as protective in nature. Its purpose is to ensue or assist in the conservation of heritage. A "protective inventory" was prepared by HMG/UNESCO (1975), but it lacks comprehensive information. The National Heritage Conservation Register proposed here would use the forces of community development, intersectoral cooperation, and economic development. The National Heritage Conservation Programme Coordinating Committee (PCC) has already established a draft NHC Register which includes seventeen cultural and natural heritage areas of national significance (Table 1). These areas have either met one or more of the criteria of national significance mentioned above, some of which have been listed on the World Heritage List.

Table 1

Cultural Areas	Natural Areas
Bhaktapur Durbar Square*	Khaptad National Park
Boudh Nath*	Langtang National Park
Changu Narayan*	Makalu-Barun National Park and Conservation Area
Kathmandu Durbar Square*	Rara National Park
Lumbini Area	Royal Bardia National Park
Pashupati Area*	Royal Chitwan National Park*
Patan Durbar Square*	Sagarmatha National Park*
Panauti Area	Shey-Phoksundo National Park
Swayambhu Area*	

**Included in the World Heritage List.*

Any cultural and natural heritage area or item should meet one or more of the criteria concerning both the nature of significance and the degree of significance, to be considered of national significance (Table 2).

Table 2

Significance	Reason
Nature of Significance	
1. Historic	Significant in the cultural or natural history of Nepal or concerned with a range of context associations.
2. Aesthetic	Having aesthetic characteristics highly valued by the community or exhibiting creative or technical development.
3. Social/Religious	Significant to a community in Nepal for social, cultural, religious, or spiritual reasons or esteem.
4. Scientific	Having research potential to contribute to an understanding of the natural and cultural history of Nepal to yield more information.
5. Other Values	Significant for some other value to past, present or future generations in Nepal, usually in addition to one or more of the above criteria.
Degree of Significance	
6. Rare	Being rare, endangered, or uncommon or having exceptional characteristics.
7. Representative	Significant in demonstrating the typical or principal characteristics of a class of items, places, or environments in Nepal.
8. Associative	Linked with the people, life, work activities, phases, or events in Nepal.

The Process of National Heritage Conservation

A list alone will not fulfill our objectives. We must develop a process which our society can afford. This requires a comprehensive management programme in which a concerted community action can be mobilized through cooperation and coordination from all levels.

National conservation should be continuous process, otherwise heritage areas can be neither protected nor conserved. A temple once renovate cannot remain intact forever nor can a protected natural area remain protected for good without regular maintenance and repair work. They need constant monitoring and surveillance. Thus, the heritage conservation process consists of twelve

steps with two main components (Table 3). The first section is concerned with the process of registration heritage areas described above. The second section deals with the participatory management of heritage that places emphasis on practical action concerning conservation practices, active involvement of local community through out the programme and its overall development.

Table 3: The steps of heritage

I. Registration

1. Considering the existing Heritage of Nepal
2. Nominating Heritage of National Significance
3. Assessing Heritage Significance
4. Considering Nominations and Making Entries on the National Heritage Register

II. Participatory Management of Heritage

5. Setting Priorities for Heritage Management Activities
 6. Conducting Participatory Heritage Appraisal
 7. Preparing a Heritage Systems Profile
 8. Identifying Management Options
 9. Preparation of Heritage Management Plans
 10. Implementing Participatory Heritage Management
 11. Monitoring and Evaluation of the Heritage Conservation Process
 12. Revising Heritage Conservation Plans
-

Heritage Significance of Panauti Area: A Case Study

Attempts have been made to present how necessary information was collected on Panauti so as to nominate it as a heritage area of national significance. As far as the heritage conservation process is concerned, only steps one through eight were completed.

The information presented here is based on Participatory Heritage Appraisal (PHA) conducted by the Environment Core Group of the NCS Implementation Project. The Group, consisting of 28 members, stayed in the field for three days. They extensively practiced PHA techniques such as reconnaissance visit, briefing, with knowledgeable people, direct observation, secondary information, informal survey, mini-survey, focus group discussion, community discussion, planning clinic and so forth.

On the basis of this field exercise, the map of the Panauti Area was prepared with active assistance of local people and necessary information was collected. Then this information was reviewed against criteria of significance

presented elsewhere. Since Panauti area met several criteria of significance, the area was suggested for inclusion in the draft National Heritage conservation Register. Some of the significant characteristics and environmental problems prevalent in Panauti Area are presented below.

The VDC of Panauti is located in Kavre District of the Central Development Region. It is 32 km from the city of Kathmandu and is accessible by an all-weather metalled road. The settlement area is built up with densely compacted houses between rivers. The adjoining landscape is irrigated farmland surrounded by deforested hill.

The Participatory Heritage Appraisal was used as tool for collecting data and information that include key-information interview, direct observation, mini-survey, secondary information and so forth.

Significance:

- History of Panauti begins with the Neolithic period
- Includes sculpture from the ancient Narayan Cult of the 6th and 7th centuries A.D.
- Situated at the confluence of two rivers: the Roshi and Punyamti and the third mythical river, the Nilawati
- Temples of Brahmayani with sculpture dating back to the 7th and 8th centuries A.D.
- Sacred and religiously significant Tribeni Ghat and a multi-stoned temple of Indreshore Mahadev
- Ruins of the Gorakhanath temple at the hill top
- Many archaeological ruins in Taleju Bhawani Mandir.
- Buddhist stupas and monuments
- Makar Mela held every 12 years
- Many examples of social heritage
- Degraded forests, lack of drinking water (Sati Ban, Indreshore forest and Gorakhanath forest)
- Problems of sewerage and drainage
- Braking and collection of stones from the Roshi Khola
- Panauti Hydel Project
- Commercial mulberry farms
- Namo Buddha at distance of 6.7 km.

The problems related to pollution and sanitation mainly originate from Tannery Processing Center, sewerage from the town of Banepa and from Panauti itself. The forests have been depleted with a need to reforest and protect them. The temples are in ruins and some of the historical buildings only have remains.

Conclusion

Nepal's heritage is rich, diversified and complex. It is also a living entity. Because of these, our conservation activities need to be equally varied. Importantly, the problem of such complex phenomena cannot be solved by the government alone, no matter how much money is pumped into a project. We cannot think of doing conservation work without people and community involvement. Its successful conservation needs to be part of the whole development process, rather than a single event. Any item of national heritage should be seen as part of a social, political and economic system.

The concept envisioned here is in its initial stage and needs to be tried out in different types of heritage properties. Only then can they be recommended for its wide application.

Notes

Paper presented at the *International Conference on the Anthropology of Nepal: People Problems, and Processes* organized by the department of Anthropology, the University of Sydney, and Center for Nepal and Asian Studies (CNAS), T.U. in Kathmandu, Nepal, 7-14 September, 1992. The paper is heavily based on two IUCN reports: "*The Conservation of National Heritage in Nepal*" (1992) and "*Proceedings of the Workshop on the Conservation of National Heritage*" (1992).

1. The criteria of outstanding universal value are as follows:

- (a)
 - i. represent a unique artistic achievement, a masterpiece of the creative genius
 - ii. have exerted great influence, over a span of time or within a cultural area of the world, on developments in architecture, monumental arts of town-planning and landscaping
 - iii. bear a unique or at least exceptional testimony to a civilisation which has disappeared
 - iv. be an outstanding example or a type of building or architectural ensemble which illustrates a significant state in history
 - v. be an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement which is representative of a culture and which has become vulnerable under the impact of irreversible change
 - vi. be directly or tangibly associated with events or with ideas or beliefs of outstanding universal significance (the Committee considers that this criterion should justify inclusion in the List only in exceptional circumstances or in conjunction with other criteria)
- (b) meet the test of authenticity in design, materials, workmanship or setting (the Committee stressed that reconstruction is only

acceptable if it is carried out on the basis of complete and detailed documentation on the original and to no extent on conjecture)

2. In accordance with Article 2 of the Convention, the following is considered as "natural heritage":
 - i. "natural features consisting of physical and biological formation or groups of such formation.
 - ii. geological and physiographical formations and precisely delineated areas which constitute the habitat of threatened species of animals and plants
 - iii. natural sites or precisely delineated natural areas of outstanding universal value from the point of view of science, conservation of natural beauty."
 - iv. A natural site may exemplify a stage of the earth's evolutionary processes, or be representative of biological evolution, or contain the natural habitats of endangered animals. It may be a scene of exceptional beauty, a spectacular view or a reserve for a large number of wild animals.

The criteria of outstanding universal significance are as follows:

- i. be outstanding examples representing the major stages of the earth's evolutionary history; or
- ii. be outstanding examples representing *significant on going geological processes, biological evolution and man's interaction with his natural environment* as distinct from the periods of the earth's development, this focuses upon ongoing processes in the development of communities of plants and animals, land forms and marine areas and fresh water bodies; or
- iii. Contain superlative natural phenomena formations or feature, for instance, outstanding exceptional combinations of natural and cultural elements; or
- iv. Contain *the most important and significant natural habitats where threatened species of animals or plants of outstanding universal value from the point of view of science or conservation still survive.*

References

- Bhandari, Bhshnu. 1992. *Heritage Areas of National Significance*. A Souvenir of PATA Nepal Chapter, Kathmandu, Nepal.
- Bhuju, Ukesh Raj (ed.). 2048. *Natural Heritage Conservation* (In Nepali): A collection of Essays. Kathmandu: Nepal Heritage Society.

- Carew, Reid. et al. 1992. *Proceedings of the Workshop on the Conservation of Heritage of National Significance*. NPC/IUCN NCS Implementation Programme, Kathmandu Nepal.
- Hayes, Rodney, et al. 1992. *The Conservation of National Heritage in Nepal* Kathmandu NPC/IUCN NCS Implementation Programme.
- HMG/UNESCO. 1975. *Kathmandu Valley: The Preservation of Physical, Environmental and Cultural Heritage: A Protective Inventory*. Volume 2. Vienna: Anton Schroll and Co.
- IUCN. 1980. *World Conservation Strategy*. Gland, Switzerland: IUCN/UNEP/WWF.
- Joshi, Satya Moha, (ed.). 2043. *Cultural Heritage Conservation: A Challenge in Nepal*. Kathmandu: Nepal Heritage Society.
- Morton, W. Brown. n.d. *The Kathmandu Valley of Nepal: Cultural Conservation Under Siege*. The American Folklore Center, Cultural Conservation: Reconfiguring the Cultural Mission.
- NPC/IUCN. 1993. *National Heritage Conservation: Manual of Conservation*. 1st Draft. NCS Implementation Project, Lalitpur, Nepal.
- NPC/IUCN. 1990. *Project Document on National Heritage Conservation Programme: NCS Implementation Project*. Lalitpur, Nepal.
- Sekler, Edward F. et al. 1977. *Master Plan for the Conservation of the Cultural Heritage in the Kathmandu Valley*. Paris: UNDP/UNESCO.
- UNESCO. 1987. *Inter-governmental Committee For the Protection of the World Cultural Heritage and Natural Heritage: Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Conservation*. WHC/2 Revised January, 1987.

HUMAN DEVELOPMENT AND THE ETHNIC POPULATION SUB-GROUPS IN THE 75 DISTRICTS IN NEPAL

Shyam Thapa

Introduction

As a principle, every government strives for higher socioeconomic progress for its citizens and the country. Such efforts are often guided by the underlying principles of better equity in opportunities for upward mobility and improved access to resources. When the socioeconomic condition of the vast majority improves, then only the overall level of development rises. Hence, it is important not only to periodically assess *what* level of progress has been made, but perhaps more importantly, examine *which* population sub-groups remain more disadvantaged than others so that the social and economic policies and programs can be better focused and balanced.

This paper examines how in Nepal the various population sub-groups, differentiated by ethnic group identification, are associated with the district-level human development. More specifically, it examines the ways, positive or negative, and the extent, whether strongly, moderately or weakly, that ethnic groups are associated with the level of development. An attempt is also made to identify the groups that are most disadvantaged in the development process of the country.

Definition, Data and Measurements

Development is a composite concept and hence warrants multiple indicators to assess its impact. In 1990, the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP, 1990) proposed the "human development index" (HDI) as a way to assess the relative position of each country with regard to three main dimensions of development: longevity, knowledge and standard of living.

Longevity is measured by life expectancy at birth. *Knowledge* is measured by literacy and (since 1991) mean years of educational attainment. *Standard of living* is measured by purchasing power based on real gross domestic product (GDP) per capita adjusted for the local cost of living (purchasing power parity). HDI is an unweighted average of the three measures. The index values

for each dimension are expressed in terms of the *relative distances*, ranging from 0 to 1.

The HDI is based on the premise that human development is a "process of expanding choice." The index may thus be considered as a "measure of people's ability to live a long and healthy life, to communicate and to participate in the life of the community and to have sufficient resources to obtain a decent living" (UNDP, 1993). The three are assumed to be critical dimensions in that "if these choices are not available, many other opportunities remain inaccessible" (UNDP, 1990).

The HDI overlaps with other indicators of development (Hicks and Streeten, 1979; Baster, 1985). However, it differs from the "basic needs approach" in that it "moves away from a commodities-based approach" and instead focuses on the "issues of human choices" (UNDP, 1993).

Nepal ranked in the 22nd and 25th positions from below among 173 countries in the UNDP's 1993 and 1994 assessments (UNDP, 1993, 1994), respectively. Although the rankings are not strictly comparable due to changes in some measures over the years, there seems to have been a gradual improvement in the ranking for Nepal since 1990.

Recently, Thapa (1995a) computed the HDI ranking for each of the 75 districts of Nepal. Life expectancy and literacy data were based on the 1991 census data. Life expectancy was calculated by applying "life-table" techniques to the 10% sample of the census data. Literacy rate referred to the percentage of people six years and older who can read, write and count (CBS, 1993a).

Due to the lack of information on gross domestic product (GDP), data on total bank deposits and credits in each district, as of mid-1991, were used. These data were converted into per capita by using the data on population from the 1991 census. This measure is referred to as "resource access" per capita. Although this is a poor substitute for the GDP measure, to the extent that the GDP per capita as used in the UNDP report is purported to measure "the 'utility' or the welfare-generating capacity of income" and is an indicator of "access to resources" to "obtain a decent living," bank deposits and credits are an indirect way to assess a particular district's accessibility to resources.

Nepal's population is truly an ethnic mosaic. According to the 1991 census there are at least 60 ethnic groups (CBS, 1993b). The 60 groups include those based on both the Hindu caste system and religion. Each may be considered an ethnic group in that it represents a sub-system of institutional arrangements, values and norms. While many of the groups tend to be concentrated in certain ecological regions, several of the groups are scattered throughout the country. Some ethnographic information on many of these

groups have been reported by Bista (1972) and Gautam and Thapa-Magar (1994).

In this analysis, three other indicators of development are used as "control variables": (1) Roads and communication, (2) urbanization, and (3) health services utilization. The first refers to total number of telephone lines, newspapers, and number of airline flights per 1,000 population and the length of road (black-topped, graveled or earthen) in kilometers per 1,000 hectare of land area. Urbanization refers to percent of population that lives in nationally defined urban areas. The data are from multiple sources as described in Thapa (1995b).

Public health services utilization refers to percentage of currently married women in reproductive age groups, 15-49, who have used various maternal and child health services. The services include the following: live births in the five years preceding the survey whose mothers received at least one tetanus toxoid injection (TTI); children among those aged 12-59 months who have received *Bacille Calmette Guerin* (BCG) vaccine; children among those aged 12-59 who have received three doses of *Diphtheria Pertussis Tetanus* (DPT) vaccine; children among those aged 12-59 months who have received three doses of the polio vaccine; children among those 12-59 months who have who have received the measles vaccine; children under 5 years of age with diarrhea in the two weeks preceding the survey who were given oral rehydration therapy (ORT), either purchased or home-prepared solution; currently married women, with a birth in the five years preceding the survey, who received antenatal care from a doctor; trained nurse/midwife or traditional birth attendant; and women of reproductive age, 15-49, who are currently-in-union and are using contraception to space or limit pregnancies. These data are calculated from a 1991/92 national survey and described in detail elsewhere (Thapa, 1995b).

The main techniques of data analysis used are simple correlation coefficients and multiple regression. The unit of analysis is the district, not individuals. In this sense, it is an "ecological" research.

Results

Table 1 presents the HDI values and HDI rank for each of the 75 districts. Kathmandu ranks first and Mugu lowest. The differences between the two are vast: the former is 83 times better than the latter. The second best district is Lalitpur, but there is considerable disparity even between it and Kathmandu. Gorkha District, the hub of the making of modern Nepal, ranks in the 32nd position. Chitawan, which is becoming one of the most prosperous districts, ranks in the 8th position. Nuwakot and Sindhupalchowk, two adjoining districts of Kathmandu in the north, rank 51st and 54th, respectively. Kapilbastu, the birth place of Buddha, ranks 56th.

**Table 1: Human Development Index (HDI) Values
and HDI Rank for 75 Districts, Nepal, 1991**

District	HDI	HDI Rank	District	HDI	HDI Rank
Kathmandu	1.000	1	Mustang	0.331	39
Lalitpur	0.624	2	Manang	0.329	40
Kaski	0.535	3	Darchula	0.328	41
Bhaktapur	0.514	4	Kanchanpur	0.326	42
Morang	0.506	5	Solukhumbu	0.325	43
Tanahu	0.486	6	Siraha	0.323	44
Terhathum	0.478	7	Bara	0.322	45
Chiatwan	0.474	8	Ilam	0.314	46
Jhapa	0.471	9	Sindhuli	0.310	47
Dhankuta	0.468	10	Mahotari	0.307	48
Syanja	0.465	11	Sarlahi	0.306	49
Parbat	0.451	12	Pyuthan	0.281	50
Bhojpur	0.432	13	Nuwakot	0.277	51
Lamjung	0.429	14	Rautahat	0.276	52
Sunsari	0.405	15	Dang	0.275	53
Rupandehi	0.404	16	Sindhupalchowk	0.272	54
Palpa	0.403	17	Bardiya	0.261	55
Arghakhanchi	0.402	18	Kapilbastu	0.260	56
Baglung	0.401	19	Dadheldhura	0.243	57
Gulmi	0.399	20	Dhading	0.238	58
Sankhuwasabha	0.398	21	Kailali	0.231	59
Myagdi	0.396	22	Baitadi	0.229	60
Kavrepalanchowk	0.394	23	Humla	0.215	61
Panchthar	0.388	24	Doti	0.212	62
Dolkha	0.386	25	Rolpa	0.202	63
Okhaldunga	0.385	26	Salyan	0.200	64
Taplejung	0.382	27	Rukum	0.196	65
Parsa	0.369	28	Rasuwa	0.192	66
Saptari	0.363	29	Dailekh	0.191	67
Banke	0.362	30	Dolpa	0.186	68
Udayapur	0.360	31	Achham	0.184	69
Gorkha	0.352	32	Jumla	0.165	70
Surkhet	0.351	33	Bajhang	0.110	71
Khotang	0.345	34	Bajura	0.093	72
Ramechhap	0.344	35	Jajarkot	0.092	73
Nawalparasi	0.336	36	Kalikot	0.068	74
Makwanpur	0.334	37	Mugu	0.012	75
Dhanusha	0.333	38	<i>All Nepal</i>	<i>0.334</i>	

Among all the districts, only five rank over 0.5. Fourteen districts have an HDI value between 0.4 and up to 0.5. Thirty districts, the largest number, belong to the HDI values of 0.3 and up to 0.4. Another 15 districts have an HDI value between 0.2 and up to 0.3. Finally, 11 districts are the worst ones with HDI values of below 0.2. It should also be noted that several of the districts cluster around the same level of HDI.

According to the classification proposed by the UNDP (1994), countries with an HDI below 0.5 are considered to have a low level of human development, those between 0.5 and 0.8 a medium level, and those above 0.8 a high level. If we follow the same classification for Nepal, there is only one district (Kathmandu) that has a *high level* of human development. Furthermore, only four districts (viz., Lalitpur, Kaski, Bhaktapur and Morang) have a *medium level* of human development. The vast majority, 70 districts, have a *low level* of human development. Many of the most deprived districts lie in the mountains and the hills of the Mid- and Far-western regions in the country.

The ethnic composition of the country's total population is shown in Table 2. The groups are listed in descending order according to the percentage share of the total population. The census identified 60 ethnic groups. Besides these 60 groups, additional unspecified groups are listed under "other" in each of the three ecological regions (Mountain, Hill and Terai, which refers to the plain belt in the south) with a total of 4.4%. The foreigners (without ethnic identification) and "not stated" categories constitute 0.05% of the total.

The 60 identified ethnic groups also include those based on language, religion, and the Hindu caste hierarchy system. Bengali is the only linguistic group, representing 0.04% of the population. The religious groups include Muslim, Churaute (Hill Muslim), Marwari, and Sikh. These four ethnic sub-groups represent 3.8% of the total population.

The groups based on the four-fold Hindu caste system include: (1) Bahun (13.8%), (2) Chetri and Thakuri (17.7%), (3) Newar (5.6%), and (4) Kami, Damai, Sarki, and Gaine, known as "lower caste" (8.7%). They represent a total of 45.8% of the total population in the country.

The various other groups represent a total of 46.0% of the population (excluding "other" and unspecified categories). Some of these ethnic groups may be Hindus and Buddhists by religion, while others follow tribal-based religion. (Some of the Newars also belong to the non-Hindu, Buddhist group, but the census does not distinguish between them.)

Table 2: Ethnic Composition of the Population of Nepal, 1991

Ethnic Group	Percent	Number	Ethnic Group	Percent	Number
Chetri	16.05	2,968,082	Dhobi	0.41	76,594
Hill Bahun	12.92	2,388,455	Kumhar	0.39	72,008
Magar	7.24	1,339,308	Kanu	0.38	70,634
Tharu	6.46	1,194,224	Khatway	0.36	66,612
Newar	5.63	1,041,090	Rajput	0.30	55,712
Tamang	5.51	1,018,252	Majhi	0.30	55,050
Kami	5.21	963,655	Kayastha	0.29	53,545
Yadav	4.14	765,137	Danuwar	0.27	50,754
Muslim	3.53	653,055	Haluwai	0.24	44,417
Other Terai	3.39	627,514	Sunuwar	0.22	40,943
Rai	2.84	525,551	Chepeng	0.20	36,656
Gurung	2.43	449,189	Rajbhar	0.18	33,433
Dami	1.99	367,989	Marwari	0.16	29,173
Thakuri	1.62	299,473	Gangain	0.12	22,526
Limbu	1.61	297,186	Thami	0.10	19,103
Sarki	1.49	276,224	Dhimal	0.09	16,781
Teli	1.36	250,732	Thakali	0.07	13,731
Kushwha	1.11	205,797	Bhote	0.07	12,463
Chamar	1.10	203,919	Darai	0.06	10,759
Other Hill	1.00	184,216	Shikh	0.05	9,292
Sanyasi	0.98	181,726	Bengali	0.04	7,909
Kurmi	0.90	166,718	Wadi	0.04	7,082
Terai Bahun	0.88	162,886	Bote	0.04	6,718
Sudhi/Kalwar	0.88	162,046	Jirel	0.03	4,889
Musahar	0.77	141,980	Lepcha	0.03	4,826
Dhanku	0.74	136,944	Gaine	0.02	4,484
Mallha	0.60	110,413	Raji	0.02	3,274
Sherpa	0.60	110,358	Raute	0.02	2,878
Bania	0.55	101,868	Churoute	0.01	1,778
Kewat	0.55	101,482	Other	0.01	1,741
			Mountain		
Dhusadh	0.50	93,242			
Rajbansi	0.44	82,177	Foreign	0.02	2,951
Kumal	0.41	76,635	Not Stated	0.03	4,858
			Total	100.00	18,491,097

Note: The ethnic groups are listed according to the percentage share in the total population.

Source: CBS (1993).

The simple correlation coefficient between each of the ethnic groups and HDI is presented in Table 3. The coefficient shows the degree of linear association between each ethnic group and HDI. Of all the groups, three (Newar, Marwari and Hill Bahun) are positively and significantly associated with the district-level HDI. This indicates that the districts with a higher percentage of these three ethnic groups also have higher levels of human development. The difference between Newars and the others are vast. These three groups represent 18.7% of the total population. The average correlation between these three groups (pooled data) and HDI is 0.631 ($p < .001$).

Table 3: Simple Correlation Coefficient between Various Ethnic Groups and Human Development Index (HDI): 75 Districts, Nepal, 1991

Ethnic Group	Correlation	Ethnic Group	Correlation
Newar	0.562**	Kewat	0.046
Marwari	0.395**	Jirel	0.043
Hill Bahun	0.337*	Bania	0.039
Thakuri	-0.552**	Thami	0.036
Kami	-0.499**	Rajput	0.036
Chettri	-0.460**	Muslim	0.029
Wadi	-0.301*	Dhobi	0.026
Raute	-0.289*	Khatway	0.019
Damai	-0.281*	Thakali	0.016
Bengali	0.249	Dhanku	0.014
Churoute	0.243	Teli	0.013
Dhimai	0.197	Mallha	0.012
Gangaini	0.173	Tamang	0.007
Shikh	0.170	Bhote	0.004
Rajbansi	0.169	Kushwha	0.002
Limbu	0.163	Sudhi	0.001
Bote	0.159	Terai Bahun	0.001
Darai	0.156	Sanyasi	-0.213
Rai	0.147	Raji	-0.174
Kumal	0.120	Sarki	-0.130
Other Mountain	0.115	Other Hill	-0.061
Gaine	0.093	Lepcha	-0.054
Gurung	0.089	Tharu	-0.051
Majhi	0.074	Kumhar	-0.025
Other Terai	0.072	Kurmi	-0.017
Halwai	0.070	Dhusadh	-0.014
Sunuwar	0.064	Yadav	-0.012
Rajbhar	0.061	Kanu	-0.011
Mushar	0.059	Kayastha	-0.010
Magar	0.058	Chamar	-0.007
Chepang	0.054	Sherpa	-0.001
		Danuwar	-0.001

** $p < .001$ * $p < .01$

Note: In each block, the ethnic groups are listed according to the correlation values in descending order. Foreign and Not Stated categories are excluded.

Another six ethnic groups, representing 24.9% of the population, are inversely associated with HDI. HDI is significantly lower in districts that have a larger percentage, especially of Thakuri, Kami and Chetri. The average correlation between these six groups (pooled data) and HDI is -0.541 ($p < .001$).

Another 39 groups are positively associated with HDI, but the correlation is very weak (< 0.10) for 27 groups. The average correlation between the 39 groups (pooled data), representing 37.8% of the total population, and HDI is 0.263 (not significant). Similarly, the remaining 15 groups, representing 18.6% of the population, are inversely associated with HDI, but the correlations are not statistically significant. The average correlation between these 15 pooled groups and HDI is only -0.082.

These results thus indicate that the vast majority of the ethnic groups ($N=54$) cluster around the average value of HDI. They are not associated in any significant way, either positively or inversely, with the district level HDI.

In order to assess the total contribution of the ethnic groups to the variations in HDI, we carried out multiple (including step-wise) regression analysis. Several equation models were estimated and they are presented in Table 4.

Table 4: Regression Results of the Effects of Ethnic Groups and Other Indicators of Development on Human Development Index (HDI): 75 Districts, Nepal, 1991

Variable	Beta Coefficient	R ² (%)	F
Three Ethnic Groups ⁺	.565 ^{**}	60.5	55.17 ^{**}
Six Ethnic Groups ⁺⁺	-.459 ^{**}		
Roads and Communication	.434 ^{**}	73.3	65.08 ^{**}
Three Ethnic Groups ⁺	.334 ^{**}		
Six Ethnic Groups ⁺⁺	-.402 ^{**}		
Urbanization	.340 [*]	68.4	51.18 ^{**}
Three Ethnic Groups ⁺	.393 ^{**}		
Six Ethnic Groups ⁺⁺	-.393 ^{**}		
Health Services Utilization	.309 ^{**}	65.2	44.27 ^{**}
Three Ethnic Groups ⁺	.433 ^{**}		
Six Ethnic Groups ⁺⁺	-.300 ^{**}		

⁺Newar, Marwari, and Hill Bahun

⁺⁺Thakuri, Kami, Chetri, Wadi, Raute, and Damai

^{**} $p < .001$ ^{*} $p < .01$

Note: For definition of development variables, see text.

The first panel shows the relationship between the two "pooled" categories of ethnic groups (differentiated by those having positive and negative correlation) and HDI. The three groups and six groups explain 39.9% and 20.6% of the total variation in HDI, respectively (as indicated by the step-wise regression). Overall, these nine ethnic groups explain nearly 60.5% of the total variation in the district level HDI.

In the second panel of the table, a development indicator, roads and communication, is included. When this development variable is taken into account, the effects of ethnic groups on HDI decrease. The first group consisting of Newar, Marwari and Hill Bahun are the most affected. These results indicate that these groups have higher correlation with HDI, partly because they live in relatively more advanced districts. However, the development status of a district is not the sole factor for the high correlation with HDI. Ethnicity remains important even after controlling for the effects of development of a district. The development indicator, roads and communication, accounts for 49.2% of the total variation in HDI. An additional 24.1% is accounted for by the two broad ethnic groups. The total amount of variance explained by the three variables is thus 73.3%.

A similar pattern of results is found when we introduce two other indicators of development, urbanization and health services utilization. Urbanization reduces the degree of correlation between ethnic differences and HDI. However, it does not take away all the ethnic differences. The introduction of the urbanization variable in the model explains 42.9% of the variance in HDI, and the remaining 25.5% is explained by the ethnic groups. Thus, the total variance explained by the three variables in the model is 68.4%.

Similarly, health services utilization has an independent effect on HDI. It reduces the effects of ethnicity considerably. The six ethnic groups are the most influenced. It suggests that increases in health services utilization help reduce the overall degree of inverse association with HDI. Public health services utilization accounts for 48.9% of the total variance, and the remaining 16.3% is accounted by the ethnic groups. The total variance explained is thus 65.2%.

Of the three development indicators considered, roads plus communication helps explain the largest amount of variance in HDI. Public health services utilization plays a more influential role than the other two indicators in minimizing the ethnic differences. In each case however, the effects of ethnic groups remain highly significant.

Discussion and Conclusion

The human development index (HDI) ranges from a low of 0.012 to a high of 1.0, with a national average of 0.334, in the 75 districts in Nepal. However,

in 73 of the 75 districts, the values are below 0.55. The vast majority of the districts have thus a low level of HDI.

This research sought to examine how the various ethnic groups are associated with the HDI level. The analysis showed that only three groups (Newar, Marwari, and Hill Bahun) are strongly and positively associated with higher level of HDI. Newars, followed by Marwaris, are the most favorably associated.

In contrast, Thakuri, Chetri, Kami, Damai, Wadi and Raute are inversely associated with HDI. Chetris are the largest majority in this group. The majority of the Chetris and Thakuris live in the Western, Mid-western and Far-western hill regions of Nepal, which are known to be the least developed areas.

The analysis further showed that the effects of the ethnic groups on HDI are attenuated when other development variables are taken into account. However, the effects remain highly significant in accounting for the variation in HDI. The issue of "cause and effect" may also be raised. Is HDI in a district higher because particular ethnic groups live there or is it because a higher level of HDI in a district causes the ethnic groups in that district to aspire and achieve relatively more?

A district with a higher level of HDI most probably influences all ethnic groups to achieve higher. The ethnic differences would thus be minimized but not eliminated because, as the present analysis has found, the level of development of a district does not explain away the ethnic differences. Therefore, percentage share of particular ethnic groups in a district remains independently important in determining that district's HDI level.

The results present a great challenge to improving human development. First, the efforts aimed at improving HDI need to also simultaneously address the development of other dimensions, such as roads, communication, utilization of health services, and urbanization. A strong correlation exists between these dimensions of development and the HDI.

HDI, which focuses on "issues of human choices" (UNDP, 1993), does not appear to considerably improve without simultaneously focusing also on other "basic needs" or "commodities based" dimensions of development. At the same time, some of these dimensions cannot be developed without a higher level of HDI itself. For example, research has found that literacy, which is a component of HDI, is essential for increasing health services utilization (Thapa, 1995b). This means HDI is a determinant also. Clearly, efforts to improve HDI must be based on a multidimensional approach.

Second, while improvements in these other dimensions of development could considerably help raise the level of human development, they alone will not help reduce the differences that exist among the ethnic population sub-

groups. Specific social and economic policies and strategic programs aimed at the disadvantaged groups need to be developed such that the differences between the various groups can be minimized and, at the same time, their participation can be more effective in improving human development in Nepal.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by the United States Agency for International Development, as part of its broader support to Family Health International (FHI). The views expressed herein are, however, solely those of the author; they do not necessarily represent those of the funding agency or FHI.

References

- Baster, Nancy. 1985. "Social Indicator Research: Some Issues and Debates." In J.G.M. Hilhorst and M. Klatte (eds.), *Social Development in the Third World*. London: Croom Helm.
- Bista, Dor Bahadur. 1972. *People of Nepal* (Second Edition). Kathmandu: Ratna Pustak Bhandar.
- CBS. 1993a. *Population Census 1991, General Characteristics Tables*. Vol. 1, Part I. Kathmandu: Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS).
- CBS. 1993b. *Population Census 1991, Social Characteristics Tables*. Vol. 1, Part VII. Kathmandu: Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS).
- Gautam, Rajesh and Asoke K. Thapa-Magar. 1994. *Tribal Ethnography of Nepal* (2 volumes). Delhi: Book Faith India.
- Hicks, Norman and Paul Streeten. 1979. "Indicators of Development: The Search for a Basic Needs Yardstick." *World Development* 7:567-80.
- Thapa, Shyam. 1995a. "The Human Development Index: A Portrait of the 75 Districts in Nepal." *Asia-Pacific Population Journal* 10(2):3-14.
- Thapa, Shyam. 1995b. "Infant Mortality and Its Correlates and Determinants in Nepal: A District-Level Analysis." Unpublished paper.
- UNDP. 1990. *Human Development Report 1990*. New York: Oxford University Press.

UNDP. 1993. *Human Development Report 1993*. New York: Oxford University Press.

UNDP. 1994. *Human Development Report 1994*. New York: Oxford University Press.

JUPITER AND THE AWAKENED PIG

Rebecca Saul

The collision of Comet Shoemaker-Levy 9 with Jupiter on July 16, 1994 sparked media coverage all over the world. Radio Nepal covered the event. The Kagpa listened to Radio Nepal. But that was not the only source of information concerning the impending 'disaster'. The monks were talking about the implications and ramifications of the event. The Kagpa listened to the monks. A third source of information came from tourists, both Nepali and non-Nepali speakers. They must have enjoyed explaining what was happening *akash ma* "in the sky," to the 'native' Bhotes of Kag. The Kagpa listened to the tourists.

What is remarkable is that it took me weeks to link the story that I was being told in the village to the information that I had received on the BBC concerning Jupiter. I only linked the two events when people started telling me that tourists and Radio Nepal also spoken of the event. Even then, it was like we were talking about two different happenings *akash ma*, mine being the *real* event, and theirs being part of some mythical past. The following is the locally accepted narrative of the collision of Jupiter.

There was a god [*lha*], probably Guru Rimpoche, who wrote a book and then the book was thrown to earth where it was found by an old woman who could not read. The old woman gave the book to a school teacher who put the book in his bag and forgot about it for many days. In that time his young son died, and he realized that it was because he had neglected the book. He then showed it to a lama, who realized that it was written by *Lha*. Many copies of this book have been made and taken to various Tibetan areas. Some of the people in Kag have seen the books and have even had them in their own house shrines for a day or two before passing them on. The copies that came here were read by a Dolpo lama and the lama told the people that Guru Rimpoche prophesied the falling of a great star to earth. Wherever it falls, the book says, that place will be destroyed, 10,000 houses destroyed. If it falls on the village of America, it will be destroyed. If it falls on Nepal, Nepal will

be destroyed. The best thing to happen would be for it to fall in a big river or lake. All the water would boil but no one would die. The book told people that they must do many '*om mane padme hū*' and prostrations every day. If they do this, the people here will not be destroyed. Even after the star has fallen people must continue to do these things, as it is obvious that they can avert disasters. Even the tourists known about the star, and it has also been on Radio Nepal. But Guru Rimpoche knew first and told the Buddhists through his book so that they could be saved. That is why for many months here, even after the falling of the star, people have been more religious. They go to the Gomba more often and do protective rituals.

What does the above tell us about the world view of the Kagpa? It helps us to understand *where* the Kagpa place themselves within the moral landscape. They see themselves as Buddhists, and 'the chosen' of Buddhists because of their privileged status with Guru Rimpoche.¹ Bhotes are often seen by other Tibetans as being both inferior Tibetans (culturally corrupt) and inferior Buddhists (religiously corrupt). But the Bhotes represent themselves in the narrative as part of the Buddhist world, and also perhaps superior to other Buddhists. The appearance of Guru Rimpoche in the narrative suggests that the Kagpa feel that they have a direct moral imperative from Guru Rimpoche himself.

"But Guru Rimpoche knew first and told the Buddhists through his book so that they could be saved." Here we see the Buddhist/non-Buddhist distinction that is mentioned in the literature as being part of the central core of Tibetan identity. The people of the village of America were not told first. The people of Nepal were not told first. It was the Buddhists—by implication the only people capable of averting the impending disaster—who were given the responsibility of knowledge of the event before it happened. The narrative also implies that only the Buddhists were deemed worthy of salvation.

The story also imparts moral lessons. First, the old woman: although she was old and illiterate, she knew that her moral duty was to give the book to someone with wisdom. Her only mistake was to give the book to a 'school teacher'. The identity of the school teacher is important. We can assume that the school teacher was Nepali, *rongpa*, because all school teachers in Nepal (where this story takes place) generally are. This assumption was confirmed by my informants. The Nepali school teacher, being lazy, placed the book in his bag. Only after something tragic happened to him *personally* do we see him act. This supports the Bhoté claim that while Bhotes have a communal spirit of responsibility, the Nepalese are selfish and egotistical. But even

Nepalese must have redeeming qualities, because the school teacher is said to have given the book to a lama. The lama is learned and responsible, the story reminds the Bhote audience. It was only when he received the book that positive action could be taken, that Guru Rimpoche's words reached the ears of those who could help avert the disaster.

It is interesting also how the impending disaster was described as "... the falling of a great star to earth. Wherever it falls... that place will be destroyed, 10,000 houses destroyed. If it falls on the village of America, it will be destroyed. If it falls on Nepal, Nepal will be destroyed. The best thing to happen would be for it to fall in a big river or lake. All the water would boil but no one would die." As Buddhist areas play a central role in the event, America, a country which usually looms large in the minds of Bhotes, is described as a "village", and a place which, despite its economic and social power on the world scene, can easily be destroyed. The juxtaposition of the village of America and "... a big river or lake..." as possible places where the star might fall is also important. This again implies that America is small and powerless—insignificant really—no bigger really than "a big river or lake." Nepal, too, despite its power in the Bhote regions of Nepal is in the hands of the Buddhists (Bhotes), the only people who can avert the disaster.

The information given by tourists and the media had little effect on the Kagpa; it merely fueled their belief that the event was of colossal importance. And that an event this disastrous could only be explained and averted through dharma. Tourism, a force for cultural change, supported traditional ideology concerning the unstable nature of the universe and the need to be 'dharmically' vigilant. The media, perceived by the Bhotes to be a fount of unbiased, scientific wisdom, reinforced what was already known of the event. Scientific explanations were irrelevant, however, religious background and imperatives were central.

The Kagpa, and other Baragongba, had to make sense of Jupiter within their own world view, and had to conquer their fear with the only weapon they had—dharma. Guru Rimpoche exhorted Buddhists to continue performing protective rituals after the event. The Kagpa responded in a flurry of religious activity which, to my reckoning, lasted until just after Christmas, when another event captured their collective attention.

Early in the second week of January 1995, an earthquake hit Japan. The event rocked the local population for two reasons: the presence of two village men in Japan, and local perceptions of Japan and the Japanese. The families of the two men came to me—the 'tourist'—to find out where the earthquake was centered and how many people had died.² Although they had listened to Radio Nepal, many had not understood the very Sanskritized Nepali which is spoken in the Kathmandu valley. When I had assured the two families that

their brother, husbands and sons were living in an area far away from the epicenter of the quake, I expected local interest in the event to subside. This did not happen.

The Kagpa continued to talk about the disaster because they see the Japanese as *nang-pa*, insiders, because there are a large number of Japanese who are Buddhists. This is important in the local interpretation of the event, but I will come back to that later. The Japanese are seen by Bhotes as more like them than any other tourist group. They are also often perceived as being slightly superior because of their light coloured skin. Many people commented that it was a shame that so many beautiful black-haired, white-skinned people had died. But, they concluded, their deaths were not their own fault (as would have been the case with Jupiter), but the fault of the Japanese lamas. The following conversation took place about a week after the earthquake when I and five other young women were having an all day feast:

Q : Why do you think the earthquake happened?

A : The earthquake in Japan was caused by awakening the pig.

Q : What pig is that?

A : The pig in the center of the world. When it wakes up, it moves its tail and this causes an earthquake.

Q : Why does the pig wake up?

A : Obviously the lamas in Japan were not doing the proper rituals of reading the religious books. If they had been, the pig's tail would not have moved and the earthquake would not have happened.

Q : So, whose fault is the earthquake?

A : I told you, the lamas of Japan are at fault. They were being lazy and now so many people have died.

Q : How big is this pig?

A : I don't know.

Q : Do you think it is bigger or smaller than a regular pig?

A : We don't know whether it is smaller or bigger, do we? Have we ever seen it? But we know it exists and causes earthquakes because that is what the old people told us and the old people must be right.

The women then asked me what I thought was the cause of the earthquake. I tried to explain the basics of tectonic plate movement, but my friends were sceptical. They thought that the pig theory was far more likely.

The local narrative concerning the earthquake again includes elements of dharmic responsibility on the part of Buddhists. But this time, the responsibility lay with the lamas rather than the regular people. That people can suffer by the neglect by lamas of dharmic practices is central to the interpretation of the events leading up to the earthquake.

This story, too, includes a moral element. Despite the fact that these five women are all relatively well educated (I had been engaged in conversation by one of these women previously concerning the Gulf War and Neil Armstrong's history first steps on the moon), they chose to believe that an awakened pig, rather than tectonic plate movement, caused the Japanese earthquake. It did not matter that I was *Emrikar*, or that I was older and more educated than the women to whom I was talking. My opinion was less credible than those of the old men and women in the village. Knowledge is linked inextricably to dharma. As dharma is accumulated, knowledge is accumulated. Life experience does not come into play, only dharmic experience. Knowledge is absorbed over time; one is a passive recipient, not an active accumulator, of knowledge. As one of my friends gently pointed out to me, "An old woman who has never travelled outside of Baragong, who has never gone to school and does not own a radio, is still more qualified to comment on an interpret events than someone who has *bikas* [development]." I stand corrected.

Notes

1. Guru Rimpoche is an extremely important local figure. Having passed through the Kali Gandaki on his way from Nepal to Tibet (visa versa according to some local histories), he is mythologised in many local legends. On the 10th day of every month villagers gather to perform a Guru Rimpoche ritual called *Chi chi pazin* which is essential for the well-being of the village and the ritual participants. One of the favoured mantra of the Kagpa is an honouring of Guru Rimpoche which goes as follows: *Om A Hu Benza Guru Pedma Sedhe Hū*. This was translated for me roughly as 'Trust in the Lord Guru Rimpoche with most Devotion and he will Acknowledge and Enlighten Your Ways'.
2. No, I do not see myself as a tourist, but the local people do not differentiate linguistically between "foreigners who wander and foreigners who stay." We are all *Emrikar*.

IS THE NAME THE GAME FAME, SHAME OR BLAME?

J.P. Cross

Warrior Gentlemen: "Gurkhas" in the Western Imagination by Professor Lionel Caplan, published by Berghahn Books, 165 Taber Avenue, Providence, RI 02906, USA or Bush House, Merewood Avenue, Oxford, OX3 5EE, UK, ISBN 1-57181-852-9, at £26.

The relationship between the Kingdom of Nepal and the United Kingdom is unique. Over and above Nepal being Britain's oldest Asian ally with especially warm ties—and the first (and only?) Asian non-Commonwealth country to be visited twice by any British Head of State—is the Gurkha Connection, that especial bond of comrades-in-arms that breeds an empathy most civilians can never understand. Forged in war as adversaries, it had its genesis on 16 April 1815 (with the British Governor-General signing the Order on 24 April 1815) and is extant today, 180 years later, periodical differences in emphasis notwithstanding. This bond has intrigued, puzzled and fascinated some, and infuriated others, since its inception—and continues to do so. It started under the East India Company, then was fostered in peace and war in the Indian Army from 1858 to 1947, and, since 1 January 1948, has been maintained with Gurkhas being an integral and highly distinguished part of the long-term Order of Battle of the British Army, even though some now see this phenomenon as a questionable anachronism. What cannot be denied is that the Gurkhas' military reputation has emerged from what many claim to be the finest fusion of its kind between east and west that the world has ever seen. Their prowess has turned into a legend that feeds on itself until, when it is discovered that Gurkhas are not supermen and that there are no more human folk than they, it makes people pause and ask themselves what lies behind the legend.

What is it that the British, their army and its traditions, its system and its mystique, do to the comparatively few Nepali Hill Men, the Gurkhas, who join its ranks? How is this potential for military excellence achieved? What is its fashioning? How has it stood the test of time?

There is, of course, no one answer, no one reason, no one unsolved mystery. Rather there is an amalgam, a syndrome, a catalyst of many factors that make a detailed, rational explanation so difficult to quantify. Gallant and genuine heroes have become the expected normal, larger-than-life, stereotype rather than the standard and more modest 'man-in-the-rear-rank' being taken as typical. None the less, Gurkhas are seen by most others as the epitome of good soldierly material. Nurtured on a diet of military history which the more cynical define as 'hot air and quick-drying ink'—and tales of derring-do, 'Gurkha' is a name to conjure with.

Part of the explanation of this phenomenon lies in the 'chemistry of circumstances' which include, for the Gurkha, an upbringing in a rice-producing community, respect for a father figure, an ability to live a hard life and a desire for personal betterment. These blend into a strong and self-supporting matrix when a lad joins the army where, for the first time in his life, 'the man', with his training, his place in the military community, his welfare, his comfort, his problems, his very livelihood, are all the concern of a dedicated band of highly motivated, trained and talented individuals, whose cause is service not self-interest, and whose bedrock of faith is trust. He finds himself in a traditional but forward-looking society with a stricter code of conduct than he has ever known before, where patrimony, partiality and the familiarity that breeds contempt or provides for subtler social pressures are all absent—despite what a disillusioned, small, but sadly vociferous minority of those 'who know best' like to believe to the contrary and who have a self-inspired, semi-divine right of selective reporting to suit their personal failures or otherwise unspoken resentments. It is these 'invincibly ignorant' people who are the spreaders of pernicious, unfounded and often malicious rumours that can cause so much damage. As so aptly put, 'a lie is half way round the world before truth gets its boots on'.

His British officers recognise that all men in the British Army are rational, conscious individuals, with any amount of potential, and they are determined to develop each man as much as circumstances permit. And the man responds. He is now someone in his own right and his opportunities for advancement depend on him, on his own showing, his own ability, his own performance and not on the whim of another: this is heady wine.

A high standard brings its own penalties of expectation so, when standards do sometimes drop, undue emphasis is given to and intemperate conclusions are drawn from the occasion. However, the strength of all military Gurkhas continues to lie in the steady and unspectacular application of the dull, uninspiring but important tasks done properly, without which the foundations for successful action in an emergency would not be strong enough to bear the burden or the consequences. That the Gurkha has proved

himself times without number is self-evident; that he will continue thus is still a tenet of British faith.

Sixty years ago, when Nepal was still a closed country, young officers in India found that life in a Gurkha unit bore no comparison with the difficulties a subaltern in a British battalion faced, so much more tractable were the men from Nepal. And yet... "You will find that the Gurkhas are different in their own country," they were told. Since the country has been opened up, most first-time visitors have also found this out and wondered why. The reasons for this dichotomy are many-sided and interwoven.

Just one example: geography. This has a constant and over-riding impact on the Nepali psyche in that Nepal is a country of contrasts—affecting temperature and temperament, humus and humours, soil and soul alike—which have indelibly ingrained themselves on the Nepali, causing the tremendous differences discernible in the Nepali ethos, both collectively and individually from the Himalayan heights of heroism and splendour to the dross like depths of disappointing detriment. To off-set the harshness of this indictment, however, it must be remembered how near so many Nepalis are to the treadmill of poverty and add to that the wisdom of the oppressed—bending to stay alive where to be rigid would be to perish.

The sudden exposure of the country to influences previously unknown, after centuries of autocratic feudalism, has also been instrumental in causing social, political and cultural indigestion. This has produced a contradiction and a conundrum that puzzle many—what is fact and what is fantasy about these Gurkhas? It was to try and solve this dichotomy that had so forcibly struck him when he did his field work in Eastern Nepal in 1964-5, that Dr. Lionel Caplan, Professor of South Asian Anthropology at the School of Oriental and African Studies in London, bent his penetrating mind. With considerable scholarship he has researched many of the writings about Gurkhas over the past eighteen decades to produce reasons to explain this divergence of views. His findings have been published in a short book¹ that, alas, is too expensive for most Nepalis' pockets. He also interviewed a number of retired and serving British officers of Britain's Brigade of Gurkhas, discerningly melding what they said into the text.

Part of Caplan's treatment of this absorbing subject is by use of his main discipline, anthropology, larded with discerning comment on his own experiences in Ilam and elsewhere among ex-soldiers. With the enormous amount reading that he has undertaken allowing him manifold quotations and erudite observations, his presentation has great depth, with unusual and very interesting slants. In sum, the book is of seminal value.

With so many sources to draw upon, all shades of scholarship have been entertained, including those of a past age which, though normal for their

time, now strike the modern reader not used to the idiom as ignorant, racist and prejudiced when measured by contemporary political and social standards to the extent that they make a mockery of the very great majority of British and Gurkhas who never wrote books, never did anything spectacular but merely served out their time with discipline, dedication and dignity.

Caplan states that his 'essay' constitutes an attempt to related the rhetorical devices employed to depict Gurkhas to the wider historical, political and military contexts affecting these soldiers and, in particular, their European officer-chroniclers. The way he tackles this, after a preface and a lengthy introduction, is to dilate on various aspects of his subject in four chapters. He rounds this off with a conclusion and a 23-page index of references of authors quoted, a bibliography and subject matters under scrutiny. Anyone who had no previous knowledge of this subject would, having read the book, not be blamed for thinking this was probably the last word in this particular field. In such a vast undertaking the author should be congratulated for his skill and tenacity in giving the reader many and various viewpoints from as many sources as possible.

And yet... it did strike the reviewer to make a note of factual errors to improve the value of the book for any subsequent edition and, in places, to offer relevant comments, some not yet in book form, so as to give an added, different or contrasted perception to conclusions already drawn. He first took a cursory glance at the blurb at the back of the book and read '... those legendary soldiers from Nepal who have served Britain's Imperial and post Imperial armies *for more than two centuries*' (his italics). Once inside the book he discovered, on page 3, a total of '*virtually the 175 years of Gurkha history*' (his italics) and, on page 53, '*a period of one hundred and fifty years*' (his italics) of inflow of considerable resources into the middle hills. Gunners call this 'bracketing their target' when other measuring methods are insufficient. The military connection reached 180 years in 1995 when this book was published.

The reviewer then scanned the abbreviations and was surprised to note the DSM, Distinguished Service Medal, listed (there and on page 139). This award is a naval one made only to sailors. Caplan should have written DCM, Distinguished Conduct Medal, an 'other ranks' army bravery award for, until the British Prime Minister-John, 'The Great Leveller', Major-abolished it in 1995, a grade of bravery above its army equivalent, MM, Military Medal, and below the Victoria Cross. (Now any acts of such gallantry will attract the DSO, Distinguished Service Order, formerly reserved for officers.)

Two more points of wrong nomenclature were noted. The first: pre-war and up till 31 December 1947, all Gurkhas were in the 'Gurkha Brigade'. From 1 January 1948, when the Indians would change Gurkha to Gorkha, the 'Brigade

of Gurkhas', at the instigation of the Brigade of Guards in 1949, refers to HBMG's, Gurkhas. The second, on page 46, is the word 'contract' when a 'tour of service' is meant. 'Contract', in the regular British Army, has special connotations not covered in this book.

Chapter 1: The Introduction: Discovering Gurkhas starts with its own introduction of *Texts and their Worldly Contexts* and expands on *The Gurkha Literature, Who are the Gurkhas?, Encountering the Gurkhas, The Anglo-Nepal War, Recruiting Gurkhas* and *Gurkhas in the Twentieth Century*, all in 27 pages. This is a most useful summary, clearly presented and with much merit.

As for the Gurkha being characterized as a 'pet' (pages 2 and 155) anyone who has met even an angry Gurkha, let alone a drunk or 'battle inoculated' one, would hesitate to call such a man a 'pet'. Any officer with such a frame of mind, so it seems to your reviewer, has never generated battle-winning respect, if anything the reverse. One point germane to the British and Gurkha feeling of togetherness was that, in India especially but also in other countries, both were, in many respects, strangers there and, as far as India was concerned, at times not particularly liked or welcome. Nor were Britons or Gurkhas allowed to go the land of the others' birth. This created a special bond.

The section on Gurkha literature is divided into four, with handbooks, manuals and works by officer-authors described as 'core' writings. No quarrel with any of this. It is germane, however, to remember that most officers fighting wars felt they were 'collectively making history' rather than just writing about it—even if they ever gave it a moment's thought, which they most likely never did.

The author addresses the question of who the Gurkhas are in a way to make this a valuable contribution: 'fictions' in the sense of something 'fashioned'. *Encountering the Gurkhas*: the insistence of some writers to say that the 'deserters' in 1815 were not 'pure Gurkhas' is arguable, especially when we have been told that such a being is a 'fiction' —'pure fiction'? (page 10). The Chinese/Tibet war, 1788-92, meant severe cut-backs in New Nepal (Kumaon and Garhwal), where many soldiers were laid off there and then. How many of these men were from Lamjung, Kaski, Parbat, etc. and saw service with the British—warts and all—as giving them a chance to return home in the mistaken belief that the British were going to oust House of Gorkha influence from these home areas? Captain A P Coleman's forthcoming seminal work on this aspect, having had access to sources so far untapped, is awaited with impatience. Incidentally, the author has spoken with Coleman (page viii).

Recruiting Gurkhas and *Gurkhas in the Twentieth Century* are both good summaries with many valid points. The author missed an extract from a 1950 Egyptian newspaper to the effect that *Such is the reputation for fair treatment (Gurkhas) receive under the British Crown that no recruiting has ever been necessary.* Now, that is an accolade worth having!

Chapter 2: Gurkhas At Home: The ecology of military service, in 27 pages, after an *Introduction*, explores *Populations of the Middle Hills, Becoming Gurkhas, The Economics of Gurkhas Service, The Social Implications of Gurkha Service, Ex-Gurkhas in Town* and ends with a *Conclusion*.

The reviewer was impressed with most of this chapter which he sees as generally fair and which contains much knowledge. The question of a supposed annual payment by HBMG to HMGN for Gurkhas' services, 'royalty' as it is known in Nepal, is raised. Even as late as 1995 serving soldiers, to say nothing of aspiring political activists, still darkly suggest a secret 'royalty' payment. The man Cross is quoted (page 36), with the text reading 'official British sources sometimes deny claims of an annual payment after India's independence', as though what the author said was true and what the British Government had averred was not so in that payments were indeed made. The denial about no payment was made in direct response to a request to Cross, when working in the Research Centre for Nepal and Asian Studies (CNAS) of the Tribhuvan university, by a Mr. Gopal Gurung, whose card announced he was Editor-in-Chief of a Nepali weekly, *New Light*, and an English weekly, *Thunder Bolt*. He 'knew' payment was a fact, so could he have the reference? The British Defence Attache was asked and, in writing, gave the negative answer. Even then, the Gentlemen in Question could not accept this.

The reviewer offers this as a possible answer to the 'royalty' conundrum: in February, 1947, Cross visited Nepal at the invitation of the Prime Minister, Padma Shumsher, staying with the First Secretary of the British Legation, as it was still wrongly called, in Lainchaur, Lt Col N M Macleod, 1 GR. Apparently, during the war years, especially throughout the period of discharge from the army (1945 onwards) of the many men who had swelled numbers for the duration of hostilities, Macleod had come to know that the Government of they day in Kathmandu only allowed the modern equivalent of one *kampani* rupee (ICR1) to be exchanged at an artificially depressed rate of NCR+1.42 when the 'going rate' was NCR±1.67. In other words, one *suka*, 25 paisa, profit went into someone's coffers for every Indian rupee every Gurkha, discharged or going on leave, brought into the country. This naturally caused bewilderment, if not resentment. It was nothing to do with

the British who deprecated it. Is it this ghost of the past that has come to haunt, bedevil and detract from the British Government's statement of the present?

As to figures for recruiting, these have been cyclic albeit diminishing since the mid-1970s. Numbers had to be increased in 1978; to fill the gap that had been prepared when 1/2 GR and 2/2 GR had been run-down prior to an amalgamation that was subsequently cancelled; when the Hong Kong Government's demand for more troops saw the re-raising of 2/7 GR; and for the Singapore Police Force's Prison Guard Service. The ratio of aspirants to Recruits (an official rank-before being enlisted a man is only a potential recruit) was 400:1. In other words, for every one man enlisted, 399 'good men and true' had to be rejected. It was a painfully difficult task for the Recruiting officer and one needing diligence, tact and moral stamina to a marked degree. Even among some British officers who know British standards of probity, more rubbish is talked about recruiting than any other military topic.

A word on pensions: the value of a pension is fully realised, both by the soldier and his officer. This is developed in the text (page 38) but what does not appear is when a soldier decides of his own volition to 'cut his name' before a pension has been earned despite much persuasion to the contrary in the knowledge that such a man will, almost inevitably, become a 'welfare case'. British officers are constantly puzzled by this frame of mind, much more liable with Easterners than Westerners, and the soldier would seldom explain his motive. Possibly he objected to another's advancement rather than his own. During periods of run-down, certainly in the late 1960s, three years' service were commuted to enhance a man's pension (that is to say, a man with only 12 years' service received a 15-year pension) and, when service was too short for that, a gratuity was given. It was atrocious had luck that world oil prices steeply increased at that time so making a mockery of what, till then, had been a good deal.

This point of a tendency not to give full answers to a dedicated, yet naive, field worker needs making. Your reviewer asks how often non-army, non-British and non-male—in any combination—interviewers, with or without interpreters, believed that the answers to questions were full, frank and 'unadorned' or 'white', not 'grey' nor 'black'? How often was selective presentation of material to suit personal propensities taken as gospel? No hint of such a probability appears in text or notes. Is this because it is yet another example of that oldest and most dangerous combination of all—the plausible and the gullible?

Much is made of the *Social Implications of Gurkha Service*. Indeed, army service gives a soldier a new slant on life, offers him opportunities to learn

new skills, to earn good money, to go to new places, to savour new experiences, to get away from cloyingly rigid structures in society that prevent initiative to be shown and to take a pride in himself. For others, such as a wife at home, of course it can be hard. But it has to be remembered that the 'Welfare Mind Set' is comparatively recent and, in a non-profit-making concern, i.e. the British Army. Apart from the terms and conditions of service being scrupulously met, the only *legal* requirement thereafter is disbursement of pension. That a lot else is done is, your reviewer feels, only good and proper.

The author tells us (page 46) that the lowest educational standard taken for enlistment is grade 8. No. On 22 July 1995 your reviewer contacted the officer who deals with recruiting, Lt Col J B Smart, about this assertion. His answer was that the lowest grade is Class 5 but that between one-quarter to one-third of successful men will have obtained their School Leaving Certificate.

Writing about *The Political Implications of Gurkha Service*, the author quotes Höfner on pensioners' involvement in 'village politics' in Dhading district (pages 46 and 95). Without a map, a reader might not realise the significance of this particular district (also known as No. 1 West) that lies directly west of the Valley and to the east of Gorkha district (also known as No. 2 West). A word of explanation is needed here: the boundary between Dhading and Gorkha was moved west—from the River Trisuli to the Budi Gandaki—sometime in the nineteenth century. This was most likely caused by the sensitivity of the political centre of gravity, Kathmandu, after the upheavals of the mid-1800s. Dhading became a prohibited area for recruiting so a policy of not enlisting men from there was, therefore, scrupulously observed. This was especially so after World War I when Prime Minister Chandra Shumsher, appalled at the scale of migration to India, totally banned recruiting from Nos. 1 West and East. ("Of the more than 11,000 Gurkhas who were discharged from the regular Indian army at the end of the war, less (sic) than 4,000 returned home. "*Nepal Under The Ranas*, Adrian Sever, page 260.)

Frankly the reviewer is puzzled. Page 95 of Höfner's book gives British Army regiments but page 46 does not specify if the pensioners he refers to are from the Indian Army, the Royal Nepal Army or the British Army, so it is impossible to tell what pensioners the author is writing about. If a British Indian army or Brigade of Gurkhas man trying for enlistment did give his home address in No. 1 West (or No. 1 East) and was found out early enough he was returned. If this was discovered later to be the case, his documents would be fudged, for his own protection. It was only in 1979 that your reviewer recruited for the Brigade of Gurkhas in the one *panchayat* of Dhading

administered by Gorkha. There was no Government reaction as, of course, there had been no need to preserve a Rana bastion since 1951. Dhading was fully opened for British recruiting, for the first time, the following year, 1980. Höfner's book was produced in 1978. Are the ex-servicemen he mentions those remaining few survivors who left the army in 1919 before Chandra Shumsher's ban or are they post-1948 Indian Army men? If neither, who are they?

One reason why British ex-servicemen do not generally opt for 'village head-man-type' jobs (page 49) is much more down-to-earth than any 'traditional relationship' one. Army Gurkhas, used to a slick and forward-looking system where superiority is normally helpful and sympathetic, feel claustrophobic and suffer from 'cultural indigestion' when faced with the normal workings of Nepali bureaucracy. Merit, as a single criterion, is insufficient for local leadership.

Ex-Gurkhas in Town: It has to be remembered that many difficulties for men and their children arise from the comparatively few years between being a sheep drover and a Jeep driver. The problems or redundancy are very real and traumatic. On page 50, we read about the son of a 7 GR, British Gurkha, ex-soldier not trying for enlistment in the Indian Army. What the lad is not reported as saying is that the Indian Army does not enlist the sons of British Gurkhas. The British Army in its quest for the best, places no forfeit on a father's job: only if two contenders for one vacancy are equal in all respects will the one with a British Army connection prevail.

At the end of the chapter (page 53) are the resounding words, 'betrayal of national honour' in joining another country's army. Is this the only case of such 'treachery'? Why should men and women labouring in Korea, Japan, the Middle East—where such jobs are often 'dirty' and few labourers have contractual liabilities for safety, sickness or security— or the taking of Hong Kong citizenship for those born in Hong Kong, rather than working for Nepal in Nepal, be any less of a betrayal or betrayal at all? Such a point, surely, should at least be included for an impartial and personal assessment by an intelligent reader, especially one who knows nothing of such labour in a land where the natives are 'job snobs'.

Chapter 3: Officering Gurkhas: The culture of Command, in 32 pages. This, like other chapters, has its own *Introduction*, then sections on *Royal and Indian Officers*, *British Officers and the Public Schools*, *Sporting Officers*, *The Gurkha Regiments as an Elite Corps*, *British Officer-Gurkha Officer*, *Regimental Cultures*, *The Career Officer* and a *Conclusion*. Two points only need to be made in this most informative and deeply researched chapter: as soon as cuts from over ten thousand Gurkhas to many fewer were

announced in the late 1960s, it seems that volunteers from the top one-third of cadets in Sandhurst went to British service almost entirely rather than officer reinforcement from that bracket being attracted to service with Gurkhas as had been the case before. Soldiers are normally only as good as are their officers. A valuable 'before' and 'after' conclusion could have been added at this juncture. The second point is that your reviewer was at a conference in Kuala Lumpur, Malaya, in 1949, when it was agreed that the Major General, Brigade of Gurkhas, Major General Sir Charles Boucher, would recommend to Higher Authority that all British officers be wasted out from Gurkha units and be replaced by fully commissioned Gurkhas by around 1975.

Chapter 4: Representing Gurkhas: The rhetoric of martiality, runs to 39 pages. This chapter, as do the others, has its *Introduction* which is followed by sections on *Martiality*, *Martial Nepalis*, *The Place of Martiality*, *The persistence of Martial Thinking*, *Masculinity*, *Masculine Nepal*, *Loyalty*, *The Bond of Trust*, *Defiant Gurkhas* and a neat *Conclusion*. This chapter has a lot to commend it, containing, as it does, aspects of the 'Gurkha conundrum' not normally on people's 'mental menu'. The non-specialist reader might be short of breath by the end of it! As can be seen from that list, the author gives an in-depth analysis of, basically, 'what makes the Gurkha soldier tick the way he does'. Caplan quotes Cross as saying Gurkhas were always ready to do battle with any enemy of Britain. In simple terms that remark merely means obeying orders. 'We are assured,' he writes on page 109, that 'the Gurkha riflemen had understood little of the causes and implications' of why he was fighting. Had Caplan researched 'rank and file' British troops in the Brunei Rebellion, 1962-3, and Borneo during Confrontation, 1963-6, he would have been staggered at the ignorance shown by many of them.

On pages 98 and 99 'line-boys' are discussed. 'Line-boys' were those born in the lines and brought up in the comparative ease of a military cantonment in India or, say, Darjeeling. Now the term refers to those lads reared in Hong Kong. When, in 1945, news of the Indian National Army emerged, there was a revulsion against 'line-boys' as many of those Gurkhas who had joined that organisation other than to escape from Malaya/Singapore were not 'hill men'. Officers asked each other whether such behaviour was an aberration or was it normal? Was it a flaw in the man's character? In essence, once leadership for 'line boys' is 'positive and individual oriented', differences between them and hill men should completely disappear.

On page 100, the author quotes Cross as 'continuing to insist' that such people do not possess the inherent chemistry to make as good soldiers as those born in the mountains. Your reviewer managed to talk to Cross who

said he was thinking of those young men who came over from Hong Kong (between 1976 and 1982) to be enlisted and who were '2nd XI' when compared with all those from inside Nepal. He noted that their whole ambience was otiose, probably brought on by a confusion in values, the seduction and indifference of a 'mod-con' environment. They had no spark, no spirit, no spunk. Such aspirants felt they had a 'right' to be enlisted as their fathers were serving soldiers, so why put themselves out by trying? After less than a year, however, in a 'non-Hong Kong' environment, such lads came back through the system and were then as good as if not better material than their counterparts. Sadly, there is also an inverse ratio of a man's suitability to the nearness of his habitat to a main tourist trail.

On page 105 the author writes that 'recently Cross has insisted yet again that soldiering is seen as the one honourable profession open to Gurkhas of Nepal'. Again, your reviewer managed to contact Cross and asked him why he so 'insisted'? His answer was of interest: first, his belief in what he wrote was based on the army being the one outlet, admittedly only in traditional recruiting areas, that legitimately and honourably fulfils the inescapable need to bolster resources after generations of subsistence farming. The man's family has, thereby, a much better chance of surviving intact than otherwise. Secondly, semantics: the Nepali equivalent he was thinking of is *ijjat*, 'self respect' ("money can never buy *ijjat* or parents") or 'face'—that acquisition of personal prestige which makes for public potency. Cross told your reviewer of the case when a father forbade the marriage of his diminutive daughter because the prospective husband was too short to be recruited so his grandsons might not be tall enough to join the British Army. A telling example!

However, even Cross could see that the watershed in the British officer side of soldiering in the late 1960s (page 81) had its counter for Gurkhas following yet another planned rundown in the early to mid-90s, to say nothing of a general, albeit slow, improvement in basic standards in Nepal itself. Cross now agrees that soldiering, while still in the 'top twenty' honourable professions, has probably had its place as 'top of the pops' taken over by Anthropology.

Loyalty and Hawaii: the incident referred to was a gross breach of military discipline between a British officer and Gurkhas. It was, indeed, a disgrace and should never have happened. It would be counterproductive and unethical for your reviewer to add his knowledge of unquoted senior reactions in Kathmandu at the time, or to say anything more than is in the text and the notes except that he is sure that no unit in any army, navy or air force is for ever on its toes and never on its heels. Were the author to have full access to the other two regular armies employing Mongoloid hill men he would find

painful parallels with hawaii and that their records were not without serious blemishes. But no mention or hint of such happenings appears in this book. Is this because the other two armies do not 'wash their dirty linen' in public?

The press in Nepal did indeed have a field day (pages 110 and 111) but, unlike the rest of the world which only had what was told it to work on, could add lurid details of its own. The issue was also a very good way of trying to embarrass an unpopular regime (pre-1990) and its British ally so could 'kill two birds with one stone' or rather 'to goad two governments by one gripe'. All the newspapers quoted were, at the time, slanted towards the left.

In *The Bond of Trust* the author rather unhappily writes that 'British officers and Gurkha soldiers are portrayed as having fallen in love'. It is unfortunate to use an expression 'fall in love' that has sexual connotations. It is a weakness of the English language that the correct rendering of non-sensual love, agape, has no easy alternative. Your reviewer can hear myriads of men of both races turning in their graves at the use of the phrase 'falling in love'. That is not to say that, without a doubt, many cases of a very strong sense of camaraderie have existed over the years and still do exist.

Chapter 5: Courageous Gurkhas: The making of the warrior gentleman. This last chapter of 26 pages, apart from its *Introduction* and *Conclusion*, includes *The Concept of Courage*, *Military Perspectives*, *Warrior Gurkhas*, *Gurkha Perspectives on Courage* and *Gentleman Gurkhas*. Another good chapter that gives an interesting account of differing views of what courage is and where 'the threshold of bravery' lies. The author is obviously unhappy at Cross for 'insisting' that 'Gurkhas do not know what fear is'. A very brash man is Cross, even going so far (page 26) as to say he had 38 years' service with Gurkhas—a curse on these 'instant experts'! Your reviewer looked up what Cross had actually written and found it to be '(Gurkhas) do know what fear is. It just so happens that they often fear the effects of showing fear more than the fear itself'. Is this another case of what the statisticians call 'one of those damned nots'?

And finally there is a short, seven-page, conclusion: Gurkha fictions and political realities which neatly wraps the whole up in easily digestible form. Caplan finishes by writing: *My intention in this essay has been to demonstrate that the strategies of text and the strategies of power are integrally linked, and mutually implicated*. A man with such broad and deep scholarship has amply succeeded in doing this.

As mentioned earlier, this book has differing slants from many, if not all, books on Gurkhas. Anthropologists, and local political scientists, 'make a meal' of the whole Gurkha Connection in such a way that the humble, non-

complicated and dedicated regimental officer seems like an endangered species. At the end, your reviewer felt that, instead of enjoying a good meal, he had to witness the killing of the animal to be eaten, dressing the carcass, preparing it, cooking it and, finally, describing that which is better left unsaid. This caused him mental flatulence.

One tempting but fruitless question is, 'could such delvers for data have produced such good results over the 18 decades of the Gurkha connection to make the name Gurkha one that is world famous?' or could it be that they could have done better by, say, inspiring their men to have won 26 and not merely 13 VCs? No one will ever know—only guess!

And one last question: What is the name of the game? Whatever the answers, it must be said that only scholars such as Professor Lionel Caplan could have written such a noteworthy, stimulating and challenging book for unbiased readers (if such still exist) to make up their own minds.

REVIEW ARTICLE

WHITHER SCHOLARSHIP ON NEPAL IN THE NINETIES?

Nepal in the Nineties: Versions of the past, visions of the future. 1994.
Michael Hutt (ed.). Delhi: Oxford University Press. xi + 172 Pages.

Pratyoush Onta
Mary Des Chene

This book contains eight essays that directly or indirectly, with one exception, deal with the politics (broadly defined) of Nepal during the late Panchayat era, the Jana Andolan of 1990, and the first two years of multiparty democracy. Richard Burghart's opening essay is on the political culture fostered by the panchayat regime. Burghart claims that its project of nation-building revolved around the Nepali language and Hindu kingship. For the legitimation of the latter, the nation itself also had to be Hindu. The official predominance of the Nepali language and the Hindu nation were ensured through census operations. He argues that Hindu kingship enabled "Nepal to claim a source of authority that was uniquely Nepalese" and provided legitimation of "a vision of panchayat democracy as civil society" in which "public order was defined in terms of unity and represented by the kingship." Private interests and institutions including non-state media representing various self-interests could emerge in public only with state authorization and official class-organizations constituted civil society as a collective of non-antagonistic entities. Burghart argues that the gap between the constitutive and regulative rules of panchayat democracy and how it "really" worked increasingly widened after the 1979-80 political movement against the system. Due to the critiques in private newspapers such as *Saptahik Bimarsha*, public life in Nepal in the 1980s and the panchayat system itself were increasingly seen to be a "counterfeit reality" and "structures of panchayat democracy began to acquire a fictional character." As Burghart mentions, behind panchayat's democracy remained a system of control enforced by the palace.

Although not backed by adequate references this article is a succinct macro-statement on the political culture of the panchayat regime but more micro-

studies will be needed to understand its many aspects. These studies should pay attention to the productive capacities of the panchayat era institutions that tried to craft citizens suited to panchayati versions of a Nepali nation through nationalized education, media (propaganda) and other means. Some of these institutions might have died in 1990 but it would be wrong to assume that the effects of their operations that supported the official versions of reality also ended the same year. Nor should future studies underestimate the degree of state violence used to silence the critics of the panchayat system; the "fictional character" of panchayat structures did not mean a lack of real effects. Burghart might have provided us some of these details but his death in January 1994 now challenges other scholars of Nepal to do the same. Here Nepali essayists such as Khagendra Sangraula (2047 v.s., 2049 v.s.b and 2052 v.s.) have already provided some useful bearings for further studies of the culture of fear, censorship and state violence and the nature of "counterfeit reality" during the late panchayat era.

The three essays by the late Martin Hoftun ("The Dynamics and Chronology of the 1990 Revolution"), Michael Hutt ("Drafting the 1990 Constitution") and John Whelpton ("The General Elections of May 1991") provide, as a set, an overview of the Movement that brought an end to the Panchayat regime in the spring of 1990 and the subsequent political happenings of the following year. Hoftun's "blow-by-blow account of the actual events" is based on media reports and interviews he conducted during and immediately after the Andolan and makes for a plausible descriptive account of what happened. However, one wishes for a more detailed study of what he has identified as stage two of the revolution: the 'climax' characterized by the unexpected (by the Movement's leaders) mass uprising. While he argues "that the revolution of 1990 had the form of a mass uprising, at least in the Kathmandu valley," an undifferentiated notion of the "masses" will not be useful for a comprehensive understanding of the Andolan in the long run. Also the avatars of the Movement outside of the Kathmandu valley cannot be neglected. After Hoftun's untimely death it is now up to other scholars to provide us with more insights into the composition of the so-called masses, the immediate reasons and longer political histories that compelled their participation in the Movement. A limited effort in this direction can be found in Katherine Devine's (1993) MA Thesis entitled *Political Mobilization and the People's Movement: A Case Study of Bhaktapur*.

Hutt's essay (a reprint) on the "struggles, debates and controversies" which surrounded the making of the 1990 constitution of Nepal relies too heavily on the published reports carried by the *Nepal Press Digest* and should be read in conjunction with Krishna Hacchethu's (1994) article "Transition to

Democracy in Nepal: Negotiations Behind Constitution Making, 1990." The latter is based on both media reports and on interviews with key persons involved in the process and brings the role of the three "parties" – the Nepali Congress, the United Left Front and the Palace/Panchas – in the making of the constitution into sharper relief. As has become clear with the Tanakpur controversy and with the Prime Minister's right to recommend mid-term polls, the ambiguities that are inherent in the constitution are a result of the several rounds of negotiations that in the final analysis failed to resolve the competing demands of the three groups. Whelpton's report on the 1991 elections provides much detail on the histories of the parties that eventually won seats, with particular attention to the Communist parties. More than any other article in this volume Whelpton's attends to intra and inter-party ideological differences and attempts to provide a historical explanation for the positions taken during the electoral campaign. That developments since its completion (January 1993) are not rendered implausible by this account points to its success in characterizing some of the key tensions in party politics in the early nineties. One might want to read it along with essays in *State, Leadership and Politics in Nepal* edited by Dhruba Kumar (1995) and Pravadevi Kaini's (1994) article for more on the issues related to ethnic politics & the elections and the participation of women candidates in the same elections, the latter being a subject not discussed by Whelpton. Multiple articles in the special 1991 issue of *Jhilko* (No. 16), focussing on different aspects of the elections (some of which are drawn upon by Whelpton), and Khatri et al. (1992) also provide further insights.

Alan Macfarlane's essay, previously published as a review of Dor B Bista's *Fatalism and Development*, is reprinted here. Much of the paper describes the by now familiar terrain of Bista's culturalist explanations of "Bahunism" as the source of societal ills in Nepal. Macfarlane appears to be largely in sympathy with this view, including only a few minor criticisms. Since this argument has been critiqued at length by various commentators elsewhere there is no reason to traverse the same terrain here. We simply note that it is particularly surprising, in a volume primarily focused on politics, that Macfarlane does not consider the bureaucratic institutions of the panchayat era when, for example, a purported lack of enthusiasm for working for the "public good" is under discussion. David Seddon's "Democracy and Development in Nepal" contains, in the main, no surprises for readers familiar with his previous publications including his 1987 book and other works written with P. Blaikie and J. Cameron. In an essay in which he copiously refers to these works, certain World Bank Documents and HMG's 1991 "approach paper" prepared by the National Planning Commission (NPC), Seddon concludes that in the aftermath of the death of the Panchayat

regime, a new political framework has emerged within which a positive relationship between democracy and development could grow. He also states that "a surprising degree of agreement on the broad strategy for development" can be found for the first time (across the political spectrum). From the vantage point of 1995 Seddon's optimism seems exaggerated and taking the within-Nepal debates on Arun-III as an example, he is wrong in seeing any degree of agreement "on the broad strategy for development" in Nepal. Seddon seems to have placed too much faith on the programmatic claims of the 1991 NPC paper which we would suggest should be read as an artifact of statecraft fiction. Notwithstanding the Eighth Five Year Plan and grand rhetoric about people-oriented development, it should not be difficult for anyone to observe that there has been *no* unitary strategy for national development in Nepal even after the Jana Andolan.

Nigel Collett, then Commanding Officer of the 6th Q.E.O. Gurkha Rifles, writes about the British "Gurkha Connection" in the 1990s. As part of the cost-cutting reorganization of the entire British armed forces, the strength of the Brigade of Gurkhas will be reduced from about 7400 men as of early 1991 to 2900 by 1997 (the original target of 2500 was recently revised with the announcement that an additional 400 Gurkhas will be retained) when Britain's sovereignty over Hong Kong ceases. Collett's explanations as to why the Gurkha soldiers are attractive to the British Army should not come as a surprise to anyone familiar with the history of similar representations that were first proposed by Brian Hodgson in the early 1830s and given more concrete form in the recruitment handbooks compiled by Eden Vansittart near the turn of the century (see Des Chene 1991). The "simple and rugged" soldier template, often nostalgically evoked these days, has had a long life along with Orientalist understandings of the "Sanskrit/Hindu culture" of Nepal against which, Collett claims, those with British service experience have spread "Western culture." The vacuousness of the latter representation is testimony to Collett's limited familiarity with the complex social processes currently taking place in Nepal. Perhaps the most depressing aspect of this essay is its deployment of old martial stereotypes that equated illiteracy with simplicity, rugged environment with rugged character and so on. While various details on the reduction in British Gurkhas are provided, the essay is remarkable for the silence it maintains regarding the politics played out in the UK in connection with Gurkha retrenchment, even that which is on the public record in the 1989 Defence Committee Report, "The Future of the Brigade of Gurkhas". Editor Hutt describes Collett's essay as one done "from an authoritative position." Unless one continues to subscribe to the imperial view that authoritative disposition on all matters related to the Gurkhas (along with the impact of retrenchment on Nepali society) resides with

British Gurkha officers who have historically been the self-appointed spokesmen on this issue, one can not see in what sense this essay is "authoritative" (see Des Chene 1995).

In his second essay in the volume, Michael Hutt discusses "the literary background" of the Movement. He quite correctly states that writings, particularly poetry, in the Nepali language have occupied an important place in the growth of a national culture in Nepal and notes how foreign scholars of Nepal have not paid any attention to this body of work. His essay provides a set of snap-shots of the various literary movements since the beginning of the panchayat regime, discusses the "compromises" made by Nepali writers in the late panchayat era, and samples the poetry from the time of the Andolan and its immediate aftermath. While Hutt's effort to introduce samplings of Nepali literature criticising the panchayat system to a non-Nepali reading audience is commendable, there are some worrisome aspects in his presentation. To economize on space, we have commented on only three aspects of Hutt's paper.

a) Hutt's claim that there is "a lack of published documentation" (p. 85) on the Aswikrit Jamat (AJ) and Boot Polish movements: While no historian of Nepali literature, to our knowledge, has produced a substantial analysis of these two movements, the lack of published documentation is not as complete as Hutt would have us believe. First of all, "primary" texts produced during the time of the movements exist. Hutt refers to the Bhojpur journal *Sanjivini* as the initial publication of AJ. Later another journal *Mantra*, published from Kathmandu, pushed forward the agenda of AJ. One of its issues was later republished as a book. Useful extracts from such "primary" texts are provided in Govinda Raj Bhattarai's (2049 v.s.:157-63) book which was published just around the time when Hutt presented a version of this article in Kathmandu in 1992. In terms of other secondary texts, Kavitarām, one of the leading proponents of AJ, has published a collection of his essays under the title *Mera Aswikrit Manyataharu* (2046 v.s.). Therein he discusses the movement historically and provides extracts from the individual manifestoes published by various members of the AJ (see especially pp. 36-48). Moreover Bhattarai (2049 v.s.:161) quotes from a discussion on this subject included in Dayaram Shrestha's ('Sambhava') *Nepali Sahityaka Kehi Prishtha* published as early as 2032 v.s.. Hutt cites this edition of Shrestha's book in his *Himalayan Voices* (1991). While we have not seen this edition of Shrestha's book, the discussion included in its fourth edition (2048 v.s.:344-46) provides a succinct statement of the influences that generated the AJ, its agenda and the severe criticisms it received from critics such as Taranath Sharma and Shree Prasad. Documents

of the Boot Polish movement similarly do exist and references to them can be found in Bhattarai (2049 v.s.: 168-72). Extracts from one such source are provided by Kabitarani in his story "Boot Polishka Collage Katha" included in his *Mukti Prasangka Aswikrit Kathaharu* (2047 v.s.:54-71), a book which Hutt cites. We should also note that members of the AJ were later involved in the Boot Polish movement. In a fuller analysis of the place of literature and the role of writers in the Andolan it would be essential to take account of the often overlooked diversity of regional and class perspectives to be found among the "Kathmandu intelligensia." The reference to the Bhojpur journal must also alert all to the fact that while Kathmandu is no doubt the centre of Nepali literary and intellectual activity, members of Kathmandu's intelligensia have complex biographical trajectories that cover many a rural location in Nepal and beyond (e.g. Sangraula 2049 v.s.b, Subedi 2049 v.s.:1-8).

b) Hutt's translations: We noticed both incorrect translations and omissions without proper indication in the various translations included in Hutt's article. An example of the former is to be found in his translation of Sakar's poem "Boot Polish" (p. 86) where the original line "deshko brihat swarthako samunee" has been translated as "In the face of our country's/Pervasive selfishness." Our own reading of the original suggests that it should be translated as "In the greater self-interest of the country." Hence the relevant part of Sakar's poem should read as follows (in our translation):

People will remember
That in the greater self-interest of the country,
This new generation
Which asks small small questions about
Hunger, poverty, unemployment, and inequity
Has started to write true poetry from today.

With respect to omissions in Hutt's translations, we noticed at least three. The first and the least serious can be found in his translated extract (p. 92) of the editorial by Rudra Kharel (2047 v.s.) in *Andolan Kabita*. The extract is a composite of the first and part of the last passage of the editorial. Hutt should have appropriately indicated this break after the sentence ending with "...definite direction." His second and more serious mistake, again without indication, is the omission of a line from his translation of Bimal Nibha's poem, "Patan" (p. 93) contained in the above collection. The first line which reads "Excitement, anger and revolt" should have been followed by "And protests against injustice."

Hutt's third and most serious omission is contained in his translation of a brief passage from an essay by Khagendra Sangraula. Sangraula characterizes the moment immediately after the Andolan in the following manner: "When praise of the brave Nepali people rose toward the sky, all talk about Chandani Shah along with the gang of commandos fled down a hole. It is amazing! Who was where yesterday, and where are they today" (2047 v.s.:23). In his translation (p. 94), Hutt leaves out Sangraula's reference to the "gang of commandos" again without indication. While commenting on Ananda P. Shrestha's translation of *Muna Madan* Hutt has written "The omissions rob readers of much of the richness of the Nepali original" (1994:255). In his own case, by leaving out the indicated passages, Hutt does great injustice to writers Nibha and Sangraula and his readers. The "commando culture" (alternatively called "mandale culture") of the panchayat system's 1980s avatar is central to an understanding of the violence through which "counterfeit reality" was sustained. It is central to an understanding of how the culture of fear and censorship dominated public life in the 1980s. It is for this reason that the wrath of the critics of the regime focussed so much on this theme (e.g., Sangraula 2047 v.s., 2052 v.s.) and hence its omission can not be easily ignored.

c) Hutt's characterization of the aftermath of the Andolan: Discussing the aftermath of the Andolan, Hutt writes, "Many writers were understandably anxious to prove their democratic credentials, and to pour scorn on the contemporaries they accused of having collaborated with the Panchayat regime." He then goes on to say that the panchayat's censorship regime has possibly been exaggerated after its downfall and states that "the existence of censorship... produced many great and memorable works of allegory" (p. 94-5). As long as Nepali poets used well-known symbolic codes, Hutt argues, they could express their criticism of the system. The end of the need to be allegorical has left many at a loss says Hutt with support from a quote from poet Mohan Koirala. While he is correct in his assessment of the ironically productive role of censorship in the literature written during the panchayat regime, he misses the point regarding the recriminations related to the issue of collaboration with the old regime. The point was not about censorship, but rather about whether or not writers who had succumbed to the seductions of the panchayat regime, money or power-wise – the "rajat kabis" (Sangraula 2047 v.s., Nibha 2045 v.s.) – had any moral right to call themselves democratic or function as critics in the post-Andolan Nepali society. Hutt should have noticed as much in the exchange between Shailendra Sakar (with whose poem he begins his article) and Sangraula as reported in the latter's book which he cites. What was involved in the charge

against rajat kabis was not so much "post-revolutionary rhetoric" but a call to guard against the process through which the cultural commandos of the old regime were re-inventing themselves as self-appointed moral guardians of democracy in the post-Andolan era (see Sangraula 2048 v.s.). Because he does not attend to the multiple fissures that marked the Nepali literary landscape during the panchayat era, Hutt's reading of the "aftermath" is necessarily shallow (see Chaitanya 2051 v.s., Chapagain and Subedi 2051 v.s., Kharel 2051 v.s., Pandeya 2049 v.s. and Sharma 2051 v.s. for some examples of sustained discussions of this subject). Hence while the death of the old regime might have produced temporary paralysis in writers such as Mohan Koirala, heated discussions regarding the role of the writer held *within* the ranks of left-leaning anti-panchayat critics escape Hutt's view (e.g. Dhakal 2051 v.s., Poudel 2052 v.s., Sangraula 2049 v.s.a; see also Subedi and Kharel 2050 v.s.). Hutt has been doing research on modern Nepali literature for over 15 years now and has recently been described by fellow British academic David Gellner "as the foremost foreign expert" on this subject. It is not too much to expect him to provide his readers with more than superficial summaries.

In the preface to the volume editor Hutt approvingly quotes Seddon's claim that the role of outsiders, including academics, "must be to provide sharper and more critical analysis of the complex and changing situation" (p. ix) in Nepal. Judged against that standard, articles in this book will disappoint any informed reader. However, if the purpose was to introduce a primarily non-Nepali audience to aspects of Nepal not captured in touristic literature or the international media, it might be thought of as an adequate presentation. But even if the latter was the goal we have to wonder why in this book, not entirely the product of a single seminar or forum, Nepali academics were not invited to contribute their analyses of "the complex and changing situation" in Nepal. We hope this is not a symptom of a new technology to manage the "Orient" even when it can speak for itself. The ghetto-mentality that exists within different camps of scholars of Nepal, including those of Nepali academics, is counter-productive to the process that might generate "sharper and more critical" understandings of the present-day complexity of Nepali society. We invite members from all camps to reflect on this situation and demonstrate, through mutual intellectual conversation across disciplines and across the bodies of erstwhile separate scholarly works done in Nepali and non-Nepali languages, that academic ghettos and egos can be superseded in the process of generating more comprehensive understandings of today's Nepal. To do otherwise is to contribute toward making academic research on Nepal increasingly more irrelevant in the larger scheme of things.

References

- Bhattarai, Govindaraj. 2049 v.s.. *Kabyik Andolanko Parichaya*. Kathmandu: Royal Nepal Academy.
- Chaitanya. 2051 v.s.. "Samakalin Nepali Kabita: Eak Samchipta Mulyankan." *Kalam* No. 7: 25-42.
- Chapagain, Ninu and Rajendra Subedi. 2051 v.s.. "Nepali Sahityaka Samakalin Prabritiharu." In N. Chapagain, *Yatharthavadi Rachana Drishti ra Vivechana*. Kathmandu: Dil Bardan and Mahim Chapagain.
- Des Chene, Mary. 1991. *Relics of Empire: A Cultural History of the Gurkhas 1815-1987*. Ph. D. diss., Stanford University.
- _____. 1995. "Letter to the editor." *Himal* 8(4): 9-10.
- Devine, Katherine. 1993. *Political Mobilization and the People's Movement: A Case Study of Bhaktapur*. MA Thesis, Department of Sociology/Anthropology, Tribhuvan University.
- Dhakal, Ghanashyam. 2051 v.s.. "Pragativadi Sahityama Bichalanko Sawal." *Kalam* No. 5: 18-29.
- Hacchethu, Krishna. 1994. "Transition to Democracy in Nepal: Negotiations Behind Constitution Making, 1990." *Contributions to Nepalese Studies* 21(1): 91-126.
- Hutt, Michael. 1991. *Himalayan Voices*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- _____. 1994. "Review of *Muna Madan* translated by Ananda P. Shrestha." *Contributions to Nepalese Studies* 21(2): 253-57.
- Jhilko. 1991. No. 16.
- Kabitaram. 2046 v.s.. *Mera Aswikrit Manyataharu*. Kathmandu: Abhibyakti Prakashan.
- _____. 2047 v.s.. *Mukti Prasangka Aswikrit Kathaharu*. Kathmandu: Sar Sangraha Prakashan.

Kaini, Pravadevi. 1994. "Nepalko Sanbidhan 2047 ra Mahila Umedwari: Eak Samajik tatha Rajanaitik Adhyan." *Contributions to Nepalese Studies* 21(2): 235-52.

Kharel, Rudra (ed.). 2047 v.s.. *Andolan Kabita*. Kathmandu: Shrasta Prakashan.

_____ 2051 v.s.. "Yatharthavadi Kathaka Panch Barsa." *Kalam* No. 6: 22-29.

Khatri, Sridhar K. et al., 1992. *Political Parties and the Parliamentary Process in Nepal: A Study of the Transitional Phase*. Kathmandu: Political Science Association of Nepal.

Kumar, Dhruba (ed.). 1995. *State, Leadership and Politics in Nepal*. Kathmandu: Centre for Nepal and Asian Studies, Tribhuvan University.

Nibha, Bimal. 2045 v.s.. *Chautho Kalam*. Kathmandu: Drishti Prakashan.

Pandeya, Tarakant. 2049 v.s.. "Pragativadi Nepali Kabitaka Samakalin Prabritiharu." *Kalam* No. 1: 7-22.

Poudel, Gopindra. 2052 v.s.. "Shyamprasad Sharma: Pralesdekhi Mukti Puruskarsamma." *Kalam* No. 8: 61-70.

Sangraula, Khagendra. 2047 v.s. *Jana-Andolanka Charraharu*. Kathmandu: Bhardwaj Prakashan.

_____ 2048 v.s.. "Bahudaliya Vyavastha Antargat Sahitya-Kalaka Prabritiharu." *Pragyik Jhilko* No. 1: 17-25.

_____ 2049 v.s. a. "Lekhakiya Pratibadhatako Prasna ra Baudhik Pradushan." *Jhilko* No. 17: 17-24, 33.

_____ 2049 v.s. b. "Prajanantra, Prajanantra ra Pheri Prajanantra." *Samakalin Sahitya* No. 9: 16-23.

_____ 2052 v.s.. "Jeevanko Tyo Chyan: Sarpa ra Bichiharuko Jungalma." *Madhuparka* 28(4): 20-25.

Sharma, Gopinath. 2051 v.s.. "Samsamayik Nepali Kabitaka Prabritiharu."
In Krishnaprasad Parajuli (ed.), *Sunkosi* vol 1. Kathmandu/Kavre:
Sunkosi Sahitya Pratisthan.

Shrestha 'Sambhava', Dayaram. 2048 v.s. *Nepali Sahityaka Kehi Pristha*. 4th
edition. Kathmandu: Sajha Prakashan.

Subedi, Rajendra 2049 v.s.. *Khali Shishi Purana Kagaj*. Kathmandu:
Pathyasamagri Pasal.

_____ and Rudra Kharel. 2050 v.s. "Sampadakiya." *Pralesh* 1(2): i-x.

BOOK REVIEW

Rana Intrigues. 1995. Promode Shamshere Rana Kathmandu: R. Rana.
Price: N. Rs. 450.00

Rana Intrigues, the second publication in English after *Rana Nepal: An Insider's View* by Promode Shamshere Rana, is yet another addition to Nepal's Rana history written by a Nepali. The Rana rule, regarded to be the most colourful in Nepal's history began from 1846 and ended in 1951. From the very day Jang Bahadur, through a dramatic coup in 1846, usurped power right down to the day when Mohan Shamshere the last Rana prime minister who handed over power to the democratic revolutionary forces in 1951, holds the student of Nepal's political history spellbound to say the least.

What makes the 104-year Rana period interesting reading is not only the way the various Rana prime ministers ruled as a whole but also in their individual style of functioning, their idiosyncrasies, their personal habits, their private lives, their legendary retinue of concubines, etc. All this not only painted the Rana prime ministers larger than life like the Indian Maharajas but also projected them as magnificent anachronisms of modern times. Besides, Rana passion of those days for intrigues and counter intrigues, plots and counter plots, coups and counter coups, bloody assassinations and machiavellian decisions of opposite camps in the relentless jockeying for power adds further colour to the resplendent Rana canvas.

Rana Intrigues, the book under review written with the intention of bringing to light unrecorded aspects of Rana rule is, no doubt, a commendable effort. And this effort coming as it does from no other than Promode Shamshere, the author of *Rana Rule: An Insider's View* (1978) and the great grandson of Bir Shamshere is certainly most welcome. With his credentials, the author has deftly taken advantages of both documentary and verbal information available to him on the various facets of Rana rule, notably on the detailed accounts of some of the more intimate aspects of courtly and aristocratic life, the organisation of harems, the various forms of entertainment and the furnishing and architecture of the great stucco palaces. Equally interesting is the description of big game hunting, details of dancing girls, minute description of the ill-fated Seto Durbar hall, food and feasting etc.

Contributions to Nepalese Studies, Vol. 22, No. 2 (July 1995), 225–227
Copyright © 1995 CNAS/TU

What is also of interest is Jang Bahadur beating his son Bhim Jang to death after a drunken confrontation; the young Ranas consuming bottles of French perfume to check the foul alcoholic smell prior to appearing before their father and being slow poisoned in the process (p. 41); the punishment meted out to Karabir Khatri by Jang Bahadur (p. 42) Jang's private ayurvedic pharmacy (p. 42); Jang's misuse of the state treasury (p. 46); a list of Jang's legally wedded wives and their respective titles (p. 51); Ranauddip Singh under the influence of hashish reprimanding Col. Lalit Jang Kunwar and whimsically promoting him to Major General the very next day (p. 57); the inside of Jagat Jang's Manohara Durbar (p. 62); the forced remarriage of Brahmin widower Chandra Kant Aryal against Hindu custom and tradition by Ranauddip Singh (p. 80); Bir Shamshere's strict following of the Hindu religious code while taking meals (p. 110); the talismanic armlet given to Bir Shamshere by the hermit of Reshunga and stolen under mysterious circumstances right from under his pillow (p. 111); Dev Shamshere's extravagant life style and love for luxuries, pomp and show, his request to Gehendra Shamshere for his favourite mistress (p. 119); the little known details of his overthrow, the case of mass *sati* on the banks of the Salinadi performed under duress (p. 113); the prophecy of the *Yogi* of Reshunga, Juddha Shamshere's love for vulgar talks and pornographic jokes (p. 191), etc. lend the book a unique flavour.

But as the title of the book may misleadingly suggest, it is not only about intrigues, nor does it unearth, as might be expected, *Rana Intrigues* unheard of before, it does not shed further light on some famous intrigues already known and covered in the book. Had the volume just concentrated on intrigues, big or small, and through research added further information regarding such events, the publication would have certainly been worthwhile. For instance, had new information been given on Ranauddip Singh's assassination, as to who actually fired the first fatal shot, whether it was with a revolver (as it is also believed) or with a carbine rifle (as the author suggests) or whether Khadga Shamshere really meant to stage a coup against his half brother Bir Shamshere or was painted the villain of the peace, it would have been of tremendous interest. For there are arguments to suggest that Khadga Shamshere may well have been a victim of circumstances especially of the ever suspicious nature of Bir Shamshere and his second influential Newar wife Tope Kumari with whom Khadga was not in the best of terms.

The book, as it stands, is just another rendering of Nepal's Rana history already known. Had it not been for the saving grace provided by the more intimate aspects of courtly and aristocratic life as mentioned, it would be no better than just an abridged version of Adrian Sever's *Nepal Under the Ranas*

published earlier. Even the washed out quality of the photographs are reminiscent of the earlier publication and appear to be from the same collection.

Except for Preface, Foreword and Introduction, the volume has been very sloppily edited with glaring errors in almost every page. At times the volume even gives the impression of the 'first' instead of the 'final draft' being unceremoniously hurried through the press by mistake. Nepali words, phrases, expressions and titles used abundantly are not italicized, and inconsistency in spelling and names of places further adds to the confusion. Besides, some of the references listed in the bibliography are not referred to in the text and some in the text are not found in the bibliography. The publication, as a whole leaves much to be desired and seems to have been written more with foreign readership in mind especially those acquainting themselves with Nepalese political history for the very first time.

– Ananda P. Shrestha